AFRICA DEVELOPMENT
AFRIQUE ET DEVELOPPEMENT

Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004

AFRICA DEVELOPMENT
AFRIQUE ET DEVELOPPEMENT
Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004

A Quarterly Journal of the Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa

Revue trimestrielle du Conseil pour le développement de la recherche en sciences sociales en Afrique

CODESRIA would like to express its gratitude to the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA/SAREC), the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Ford Foundation, Mac Arthur Foundation, Carnegie Corporation, the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Danish Agency for International Development (DANIDA), the French Ministry of Cooperation, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Rockefeller Foundation, FINIDA, NORAD, CIDA, IIEP/ADEA, OECD, IFS, OXFAM America, UN/UNICEF and the Government of Senegal for supporting its research, training and publication programmes.

Le CODESRIA exprime sa gratitude à l'Agence suédoise de coopération pour le développement International (SIDA/SAREC), au Centre de recherche pour le développement international (CRDI), à la Fondation Ford, à la fondation Mac Arthur, Carnegie Corporation, au ministère norvégien des Affaires étrangères, à l'Agence danoise pour le développement international (DANIDA), au ministère français de la Coopération, au Programme des Nations Unies pour le développement (PNUD), au ministère des Affaires étrangères des Pays-bas, à la Fondation Rockefeller, FINIDA, NORAD, CIDA, IIEP/ADEA, OCDE, IFS, OXFAM America, UN/UNICEF, le gouvernement du Sénégal pour leur soutien généreux à ses programmes de recherche, de formation et de publication.

Africa Development is the quarterly bilingual journal of CODESRIA. It is a social science journal whose major focus is on issues which are central to the development of society. Its principal objective is to provide a forum for the exchange of ideas among African scholars from a variety of intellectual persuasions and various disciplines. The journal also encourages other contributors working on Africa or those undertaking comparative analysis of Third World issues.

Africa Development welcomes contributions which cut across disciplinary boundaries. Articles with a narrow focus and incomprehensible to people outside their discipline are unlikely to be accepted. The journal is abstracted in the following indexes: *International African Bibliography; African Studies Abstracts Online; Abstracts on Rural Development in the Tropics; Documentationselienst Africa; A Current Bibliography on African Affairs*, and the *African Journals Online*. Back issues are also available online at www.codesria.org/Links/Publications/Journals/africa_development.htm

Afrique et Developpement est un périodique trimestriel bilingue du CODESRIA. C'est une revue de sciences sociales consacrée pour l'essentiel aux problèmes de développement et de société. Son objectif fondamental est de créer un forum pour des échanges d'idées entre intellectuels africains de convictions et de disciplines diverses. Il est également ouvert aux autres chercheurs travaillant sur l'Afrique et à ceux se consacrant à des études comparatives sur le tiers monde.

Afrique et Développement souhaite recevoir des articles mobilisant les acquis de différentes disciplines. Des articles trop spécialisés ou incompréhensibles aux personnes qui sont en dehors de la discipline ne seront probablement pas acceptés. Les articles publiés dans le périodique sont indexés dans les journaux spécialisés suivants: *International African Bibliography; African Studies Abstracts Online; Abstracts on Rural Development in the Tropics; Documentationselienst Africa; A Current Bibliography on African Affairs*, et *African Journals Online*. Les numéros disponibles de *Afrique et Développement* peuvent être consultés à l'adresse suivante: www.codesria.org/Link/Publications/Journals/africa_development.htm

All editorial correspondence and manuscripts should be sent to:
Tous les manuscrits et autres correspondances à caractère éditorial doivent être adressés au:

Editor-in-chief/Rédacteur en Chef
Africa Development / Afrique et Développement
CODESRIA, Av. Cheikh Anta Diop x Canal IV B.P. 3304, Dakar, C.P. 18524 Sénégal.
Tel: +221 825 98 22 / 825 98 23 - Fax: +221 824 12 89
Email: publications@codesria.sn or codesria@codesria.sn
Web Site: www.codesria.org

Subscriptions/Abonnement

(a) African Institutes/Institutions africaines:	$32 US
(b) Non African Institutes/Institutions non africaines	$45 US
(c) Individual/Particuliers	$30 US
- Current individual copy / Prix du numéro	$ 7 US
- Back issues / Volumes antérieurs	$10 US

Claims: Undelivered copies must be claimed no later than three months following date of publication. CODESRIA will supply missing copies when losses have been sustained in transit and where the reserve stock will permit.

Les réclamations: La non-réception d'un numéro doit être signalée dans un délais de trois mois après la parution. Nous vous ferons alors parvenir un numéro de remplacement dans la mesure du stock disponible.

ISSN 0850 3907

Contents / Sommaire
Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004

Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 1–39

(ISSN 0850-3907)

Cultivating Conflict: Agricultural 'Betterment', the Native Land Husbandry Act (NLHA) and Ungovernability in Colonial Zimbabwe, 1951–1962[1]

Guy Thompson*

Abstract

In the 1950s, the white minority regime in Zimbabwe launched an ambitious development scheme for peasant agriculture, known as the Native Land Husbandry Act. It was abandoned in 1962 in the face of massive rural opposition. This paper explores the key provisions of this surprising scheme and its origins in the political economy of the colony and the contradictory interests of the settler community. It then looks at why Africans rejected the measure, arguing the NLHA undermined key peasant strategies for production, environmental management, and survival in the colonial order. Peasants initially tried to evade the impositions of the scheme, but then became defiant as the state tried to coerce them to follow the law. Protests spread throughout the country, creating a state of ungovernability that threatened white rule. These developments played a key role in rural mobilisation and the emergence of land-based nationalism in Zimbabwe, factors that continue to shape the political and social landscape today.

Résumé

Dans les années 50, le régime de minorité blanche avait initié un ambitieux programme de développement destiné à l'agriculture paysanne, connu sous le nom de Native Land Husbandry Act. Celui-ci a été abandonné en 1962, face à la farouche opposition rurale qui s'en est suivie. Cette contribution analyse les principales dispositions de ce surprenant programme, ses origines, dans le cadre de l'économie politique coloniale, ainsi que les intérêts contradictoires des colonisateurs. Elle se penche ensuite sur les raisons pour lesquelles les Africains ont rejeté ce programme, en avançant que le NLHA menaçait les principales

* Department of History and Classics, University of Alberta, Canada.

stratégies de production des agriculteurs, de même que la gestion environnementale et la survie au sein de l'ordre colonial. Les paysans avaient d'abord tenté de se soustraire aux règles imposées par ce programme, puis ont commencé à se rebeller, lorsque l'état a tenté de les contraindre à respecter ce dernier. Des protestations s'élevèrent de tous les coins du pays, créant ainsi un état de «non gouvernabilité» qui menaçait le régime blanc. Ces évolutions ont joué un rôle clé dans la mobilisation rurale et l'émergence d'un nationalisme fondé sur la terre, au Zimbabwe. Ces facteurs continuent de modeler le paysage politique et social d'aujourd'hui.

Introduction

The Mugabe government's recent Fast Track Land Reform programme has brought Zimbabweans' struggle with the difficult legacies of colonial land and agricultural policies into wide public awareness once again. State land grabs, rural political unrest, authoritarian decision-making and violence, however, have a long history in Zimbabwe, extending back to the foundation of the colonial state. This paper explores a key period in the country's agrarian history, when the white minority regime embarked on a huge social engineering and development project to reshape the productive, social, and economic order of the African reserves through the 1951 Native Land Husbandry Act (NLHA). A massive extension of state power, the measure undermined key peasant farming practices and survival strategies within the colonial order. Rural Africans initially tried to evade the impositions of the law, but as enforcement intensified, peasants began to confront officials and defy orders. By late 1961, rural opposition and unrest threatened state control of the countryside, creating a state of ungovernability in many reserves that compounded the state's efforts to contain nationalist organisation and township protest. While intensified repression was a key component of the white minority regime's response, they also tried to reduce African opposition by modifying the NLHA and other racial regulations. These initiatives failed, however, provoking a political crisis within the settler community that led the government to reduce its role in the reserves and brought the extremist Rhodesian Front to power.

The events of the 1950s and early 1960s therefore played an important role in Zimbabwe's agrarian and political history, leaving legacies that continue to shape the political and social landscape today. The rural developments of this period, however, have received relatively little academic attention, particularly in comparison with the extensive discussion of the liberation war and the period from 1890 to 1945.[2] My intention in this paper, then, is to shed more light on this important period,

but I also want to emphasise the impact of the NLHA on peasant cultivation techniques, methods of environmental management, production strategies, and rural social relations. The paper will build on the existing scholarship on state intervention in the Zimbabwean countryside that explores land seizures and forced relocations of Africans, agricultural 'improvement' efforts in the 1920s and 1930s, and the role of agricultural innovators.[3] I also engage with the historical scholarship on the development of nationalism, exploring how the period of NLHA implementation saw a massive upsurge in rural political mobilisation and growing articulation of African grievances about land, key developments behind the recent political turmoil in Zimbabwe.[4]

This paper provides an extended treatment of the NLHA and its legacy. It discusses how the measure fit into the political economy of colonial Zimbabwe, why peasants objected so vociferously to its implementation, the rapid spread of rural resistance, and the political crisis that growing African opposition provoked, emphasising several themes. I argue for the continued importance of peasant agriculture to the colonial economy after the Second World War, when industrialisation and the dramatic expansion of settler tobacco production created a massive demand for basic foodstuffs, which was partially met by farmers in the reserves. Studying the NLHA also illuminates other contradictions of settler colonialism, particularly the conflicts within the bureaucracy and white interests that influenced the law's introduction and implementation. These came to a head in the political crisis of 1961 and 1962. On a different level, the discussion of peasant understandings of state initiatives argues that the NLHA imposed a much more onerous labour regime that undermined farmers' production strategies and ecological management techniques rooted in indigenous knowledge. It was these realities, combined with the social disruptions of the law and the coercive ways in which it was implemented, that fuelled rural opposition and created conditions of ungovernability in many reserves. While these developments laid the basis for the later liberation war and recent conflicts over land, I argue that the relationship between peasants and nationalists was a complicated one, compounded by the divisions that emerged in rural communities because of popular mobilisation. Finally, I want to emphasise the legacies of this period, which continue to shape social and political dynamics in Zimbabwe, particularly as many of the modernist assumptions of the NLHA can be seen in the technocratic approaches of the post-independence state agricultural extension services as well as the current agrarian policies of the opposition Movement for Democratic Change (MDC).

The bulk of this paper rests on a close reading of a variety of written sources that primarily illuminate the colonial political economy and the dynamics of the government and settler community, although they also provide insight into nationalist activity and, to a lesser degree, peasant protest. These sources include records of cabinet, newspapers, administrative files, government propaganda, and contemporary scholarship on the economy. To get at peasant understandings of state initiatives, rural social dynamics, and the complexity of peasant political activity, I am also drawing on material from an extended study of social, cultural, and agrarian change in the Madziwa Communal Area in northeastern Zimbabwe. This larger project rests on life history interviews with 115 elderly residents of Madziwa, which took the form of extended conversations that were shaped by the participants as well as my questions and the input of my research assistants, rather than a fixed protocol.[5]

The Law

A detailed discussion of the legislation itself is a necessary, albeit rather dry, first step to understanding the goals of, and reactions to, the NLHA.

The law was a complex measure that gave the settler state extensive powers over the inhabitants of the reserves and Special Native Areas (SNAs), allowing officials to direct peasant production, control land use, and determine who could have access to farm land.[6]

The first section of the law allowed the state to decide how people farmed and how they used the land through a range of regulations.[7] These included measures to proclaim permanent, separate grazing, arable, residential and garden areas, the right to allocate holdings within these spaces, and the authority to restrict access to them. Officials could also forbid cultivation in areas that were seen as ecologically sensitive, such as wetlands, river flats and stream banks, as well as issue orders to fence off or protect springs and headwaters. This section further empowered authorities to direct peasants' farming practices by requiring landholders to follow approved cropping systems and to build contour ridges, storm drains and grass buffer strips to control soil erosion in their arable holdings. In theory, the approved cropping systems were to be adapted to local environmental conditions, but in practice the state imposed a single model throughout the country. It forbade inter-cropping, while requiring farmers to grow crops in rows, work manure or compost into their lands to improve soil fertility, and to follow a four year rotation of maize with manure, followed by maize or sorghum, then groundnuts, beans or another legume, and finally finger millet.

Officials determined who could farm in the reserves and SNAs under the second and third sections of the act, which introduced a system of arable and grazing permits. Farm rights were distributed to male heads of households on the basis of permanent individual tenure within the arable blocks. Each man was allocated a standard holding of basically equal size, which officials set according to the area's rainfall; in the wetter regions of the country, the standard holding was 6 to 8 acres, while in the driest areas it could reach 15 acres. Polygynous men received an extra 1/3 of a holding for each wife after the first, while chiefs and village headman received an extra allocation in recognition of their duties. Holdings could not be subdivided, nor could they be used as collateral for loans as the farming permit conferred use rights rather than full ownership.

Grazing rights were issued in a similar fashion, and were restricted to recognised landholders. Officials calculated the stock carrying capacity of the area based on its size, rainfall, and soil conditions, then set a standard holding calculated in Large Stock Equivalents (LSE). One LSE was defined as 1 head of cattle or 5 goats or 5 sheep. The typical standard holding was 6 LSE, but this ranged up to 20 in drier regions where stock keeping was more important.

As the law was implemented, anyone who currently owned animals or had worked land in the last growing season was eligible to receive a land and grazing permit. Any person with the right to reside in the area could apply for left-over rights, but most reserves were overpopulated. Therefore, there were few, if any, permits available to applicants and many regions were so overcrowded that the current residents received smaller holdings than the ideal standard unit. Stock allocations were much more restrictive. Most animal owners had to reduce their herds, even those with 3 or 4 animals. Those who did not currently own stock, or had only one or two LSE were restricted to that number. Permits could be bought and sold, so that young men coming of age and returning labour migrants could look for rights, but they were unlikely to obtain them. Ambitious farmers could purchase additional holdings, although the NLHA imposed an individual limit of three grazing and three arable permits. While rights were basically restricted to adult men, women who were divorced, widowed, over 25 and unmarried, or whose husbands were missing, were eligible to receive their own allocation.

The fourth section of the law provided for the designation of village and business sites in the reserves and SNAs, as part of Rhodesia's grand segregation plans. Blacks were only allowed to live in towns or other designated white areas as long as they were employed, and were made to

return to their reserve of origin at the end of their contract. Before the NLHA was introduced, returnees took up farming, but as land access was restricted under the measure, village areas were seen as necessary to accommodate former migrants and others without farming rights. The fifth section of the law allowed officials to recruit forced labour for government conservation works in the African areas. Any male landholder who had not been employed for 3 months in the last year could be recruited for up to 90 days, paid at the prevailing wage rate in the area.

The NLHA was designed to be gradually implemented throughout the country. Each reserve and SNA had to be individually proclaimed to bring the act into force, while each section of the act could be introduced when local officials thought it was appropriate. Finally, the law also set penalties to enforce its provisions. Violations of regulations under the first section of the law were punished by a fine of £1 or a week in jail; this rose to £15 or three months for a third offense, while a fourth charge could lead to confiscation of the land right. Animals that were grazed illegally were seized and sold, while crops grow in violation of the law were ploughed under.

Despite the sweeping changes in peasants' lives implied by the NLHA, the law was not an innovation. Rather, it drew on models introduced by Christian missionaries throughout southern Africa and earlier state initiatives in Southern Rhodesia through the 'native' agriculture department and community betterment schemes.[8] What was truly new about the NLHA was that it provided officials with extensive coercive powers and brought a number of earlier programmes together into a comprehensive scheme. State betterment efforts in the 1920s and 1930s were haphazard, limited to a few areas, and relied on peasants voluntarily following the advice of agricultural and community demonstrators. More basically, the earlier measures were poorly funded, reflecting white farmers' deeply rooted fear of black competition as well as the reluctance of settlers to spend state revenues on Africans.[9] Thus the passage of the NLHA and its expansion into an expensive, extensive modernisation scheme is something of a dilemma, one that can only be understood in light of fundamental changes in the colony's political economy.

Origins of the NLHA

The Second World War and the years following it brought unprecedented prosperity for Europeans in Southern Rhodesia. The economy not only expanded rapidly, but diversified. In mining, the least successful of the major sectors, output grew by 157 percent from 1946 to 1953, as the

structure of the industry changed.[10] Gold production declined slightly, as many small white controlled mines that had emerged in the depression closed. Asbestos and chrome production, dominated by large foreign owned companies, grew in scale and importance.[11] The output of large scale agriculture, legally restricted to Europeans and heavily supported by state subsidies, expanded ten times between 1937 and 1958.[12] Maize, beef, and dairy production all rose, but tobacco grew the most quickly; the 1950 harvest of 107 million pounds was five times that of 1939. The number of registered growers increased from 1000 in 1945 to 2150 in 1950, then to 2669 in 1958, reflecting not just the conversion of existing farms to tobacco production, but expansion in the number of white farmers, fed by immigration, government land sales and the subdivision of large estates.[13]

However, it was manufacturing that expanded most quickly, with annual growth rates averaging nearly 25 percent between 1944 and 1948.[14] Overall output grew ten times between 1940 and 1955, while the number of factories rose from 299 in 1939 to 473 in 1948, 714 in 1953 and 918 in 1957.[15] Manufacturing overtook mining as the second largest sector in the economy during the war, behind European agriculture, and it continued to grow in relative importance through the 1950s. Firm size and output also increased, reflecting mechanisation and expansion in textile and metals manufacturing. Most of the larger operations were foreign owned, due to heavy investment by outside interests in secondary manufacturing.[16]

Overall rapid economic growth was encouraged by a number of factors. The war fostered import substitution, while rapid European immigration after 1945 provided skilled individuals, new markets and opportunities in construction. Capital flight from the UK and South Africa fuelled foreign investment, while the emergence of the sterling zone and tight dollar import restrictions within it provided ready markets for Southern Rhodesia's exports.[17] At its core, it remained a colonial economy, dependent on primary product exports; the most important of which were tobacco, replacing US imports in British markets, along with chrome and asbestos for military uses in the US and UK.[18] Despite falling production, gold exports were vital because of their support for the pound, and averaged £6 million a year.[19] Exports represented 45 percent of GDP; manufactured goods were of limited importance, serving only the small regional market.[20] Cheap labour underwrote all sectors of the economy, including secondary industry, but was especially important to the labour intensive commercial agriculture and mining sectors. Short term male migrancy, drawing large numbers from Southern Rhodesia, as well as colonial Malawi, Mozambique,

and Zambia was a key feature, secured by pass laws, low wages and extractive taxes. Most of the costs of reproducing labour were borne by peasants, especially rural women throughout the region.[21]

Economic expansion and diversification were not the result of consistent state policy, nor a clear commitment to promoting industrialisation.[22] Rapid growth in the 1940s and 1950s has blinded researchers to the divisions and contradictions of this period; they have created an image of unmitigated settler success which rested on white unity and the dominance of industrial interests. This in turn has made them far too ready to see the small openings offered to Africans under the liberal facade of 'racial partnership' that Southern Rhodesia and the Central African Federation promoted to contain black opposition and overseas criticism as real gains.[23] There were some new educational and employment opportunities and a slight easing of petty racial restrictions, mainly for the tiny black elite, but these did little to alter the structures of domination and exploitation, especially as they had no impact on the lives of the majority of Africans. There were indeed strong cohesive forces in the settler community. White Rhodesia was a small society. In 1951 there were only 138 000 Europeans in the country, with a pervasive culture and extensive informal social contacts which fostered an appearance of homogeneity. Moreover, whites were united by their desire to maintain their distance from the black majority, an undercurrent of fear of Africans, and a common goal of securing European privilege and domination.[24]

White political conflicts were also obscured by the dynamics of the state, which was effectively a corporatist system.[25] The colony was dominated by the ruling United Rhodesia Party (URP) despite the existence of several other political parties. Led by Godfrey Huggins, Prime Minister from 1933 to 1953, the URP had drawn in many of its former critics, merging several times with opposition organisations. Huggins built up a range of inclusive mechanisms to attract the major white interest groups, including formal consultative bodies and the governing boards of parastatal corporations that ran key sectors of the economy. The executive branch engaged in extensive informal consultation, a process that was reinforced by the small size of the European population, exclusion of Africans, and limited formal party organisation. Many important meetings took place between government officials and leading individuals over lunch, sundowners, or within social and sports clubs.[26]

Below the surface however, there were important fissures in whites' apparent unity. There were significant class divisions. Professionals, managers and owners of large business interests, and successful, well-

capitalised farmers generally felt their positions were secure. White workers, clerical employees, owners of small businesses and poorer farmers – many of whom were Afrikaners – were suspicious of the elite and concerned to protect their privileges which rested on a range of laws restricting opportunities for Africans. Large economic interests, particularly foreign owned companies in manufacturing and mining were much less committed to maintaining Rhodesia's rigid racial order, at least measures that protected lower level European employees and provided them with high salaries and generous benefits. They recognised that promoting blacks into'white' jobs would reduce their costs, while many manufacturers produced mainly for the African market, and could see that African advancement would increase their sales.[27]

These divisions were reflected in two competing visions of the best means to secure white dominance of the colony. To oversimplify a little, this split can be typified as a divide between 'little Rhodesia' types and advocates of a 'greater Rhodesia'.[28] Proponents of a greater Rhodesia believed that the future of white domination would only be assured by building a modern state in central Africa, based on an expanding industrial economy and political amalgamation with Northern Rhodesia and Nyasaland. They were generally willing to make some concessions to Africans, particularly economic changes that would give black workers and peasants more purchasing power while integrating them more fully into the capitalist economy. A few liberals within this group were ready to offer minor political and social openings to elite Africans, seeing such initiatives as away to contain black opposition and overseas criticism. Greater Rhodesia advocates were mainly drawn from the upper levels of white society; professionals, successful farmers, managers and owners of larger businesses, as well as government officials.[29]

Little Rhodesia types had a much narrower and defensive outlook. They were suspicious of the Federation, believing it was better for Southern Rhodesia to stand alone and push for constitutional concessions from Britain that would advance the colony towards dominion status, thereby guaranteeing white control. While they benefited from the growing industrial sector, they worried that it would lose momentum, an attitude that was rooted in a fear of African advancement and competition, as well as memories of earlier economic contractions. They were primarily concerned with securing white privilege and control by building on earlier measures that protected Europeans, including wider segregation, job reservation, and state support for settlers, particularly farmers. Africans were mainly seen as cheap labour, so little Rhodesia types were hostile

towards welfarist measures, especially as they would draw on government revenues. They held that the state's main concerns in the African areas were basic control and labour mobilisation. Support mainly came from white workers, lower level employees, and the less prosperous farmers, particularly the Afrikaner minority. Many government officials and MPs also adhered to this view.[30]

These divisions ran through post war debates on economic development, political reforms, and state policies towards Africans. Ideally consensus was supposed to emerge within Southern Rhodesia's corporatist mechanisms, but in the changing economic climate after the Second World War and the diverse interests it created, government decisions often rested on awkward compromises and some initiatives were only introduced after long delays, if at all. In the booming economy, there was wider support for some greater Rhodesia policies, such as the successful creation of the Federation.[31] But other measures were blocked by the defensiveness of the white lower classes and little Rhodesians, particularly commercial farmers and small gold mine owners who had disproportionate influence because they produced vital exports. Industrial interests were ready to compromise to maintain the basic stability of the colony; they also recognised that export earnings provided the income to purchase their products. Therefore, industrial policy remained ambivalent, reflecting fears of African urbanisation as well as worries about the impact of the growth of manufacturing on labour costs for mining and farming. For similar reasons, little was done to promote the stabilisation of the black urban workforce, particularly measures that were the logical compliments to the NLHA, such as allowing Africans to buy houses, settle permanently in urban areas, or creating a pension system.[32] Deep divisions flared over African education, which stalled expansion for years, reflecting conflict between industries that wanted increased funding to train semi-skilled workers, and the white majority who were concerned by the cost and implications for black advancement.[33]

The introduction of the NLHA illustrates the working of these uneasy compromises. Its passage rested on the seemingly contradictory promises it made, which allowed the law's proponents to win acceptance from diverse economic interests and overcome the suspicions of little Rhodesia types. In particular, the measure promised to address a number of the central challenges facing the colony after the Second World War, problems that threatened future economic expansion and the bases of white prosperity.

Having lost self-sufficiency in major foodstuffs during the war, the colony had a serious food crisis.[34] There were shortages of maize, beef

and dairy products in the late 1940s. These were partly met by rationing and other controls, but expensive dollar imports were necessary, bringing British pressure for self-sufficiency.[35] Concern about potential wider economic damage peaked during the 1947 drought:

> The seriousness of the maize position goes beyond the drought. The figures of the past twenty years read against the expanding economy of the Colony make it clear that unless we take a bold step now the maize supplies of the Colony are likely to falter, on from hand to mouth through a period during which prospective and expanding industry should not be disturbed by qualms on that account.[36]

Many white farmers were reluctant to grow food crops or to invest capital and scarce labour in increasing production of foodstuffs, as tobacco was far more profitable. The state refused to coerce them, a clear reflection of farmers' influence.[37] Instead, there was a new interest in peasant agriculture as a key sector of the economy, with African producers growing low return grains and groundnuts to supply basic foodstuffs for the expanding workforce in the towns, mines and commercial farms, as well as inputs for the growing food processing industry.[38] Despite entrenched racial inequalities in land access, land quality, and input availability, African farmers, mainly in the reserves, produced roughly a third of the marketed maize in the colony from 1947 to 1954, along with almost all the marketed groundnuts and small grains.[39]

The colony also faced a serious labour shortage, particularly in the vital mining and white farming sectors where wages were lower and conditions harder than in manufacturing. Shortfalls in these industries averaged 15 percent in 1949, ranging up to 45 percent for some farmers.[40] Like the food shortage, this challenge raised serious concerns about its impact on the national economy.

> It is clear that the rapid development of Southern Rhodesia and its neighbouring territories has outstripped the labour supply. Unless adequate steps are taken to meet the anticipated demand for labour, the Colony will suffer a severe setback during the most important time in its history.[41]

This was a regional problem. Not only did it affect the nearby territories, but more than half of Southern Rhodesia's waged workers were migrants from neighbouring colonies, where it was thought that post-war development would further reduce the numbers making their way to Rhodesia. The state faced intense pressure to increase the numbers of job seekers, especially as wages had risen as workers recognised that the labour shortage gave them new leverage with employers.[42]

The tight labour market encouraged a new assertiveness among black workers, reflected in the emergence of new worker organisations and successful strikes in Salisbury and Bulawayo. Scattered unrest grew through the post-war years, culminating in the 1948 general strike that was marked by worker frustration with the cautious leadership of the new unions and elite political movements.[43] The general strike particularly alarmed whites, feeding fears that state control of the urban townships was weakening. There was also growing concern about the countryside, as rural discontent and peasant restiveness accelerated during the same period, often associated with the activities of the new British African Voice Association (BAVA).[44]

Much of the rural unrest was the result of the state's efforts to forcibly relocate Africans living on designated white land, which was now wanted for farming by new immigrants. Peasants in such areas fought relocation through passive resistance and the courts, in some cases with BAVA's assistance.[45] The new white landowners were frustrated by the slow pace of the relocations. This had a wide political impact as the vast majority of Europeans supported intensified racial segregation and wanted to see Africans moved off designated white land as quickly as possible, fulfilling promises made when the Land Apportionment Act (LAA) was passed in 1930. In 1948, nearly one-third of the African population, 500,000 people, were living as tenants and squatters in European areas.[46]

Moving thousands of peasants presented a massive logistical problem. Many of the reserves were already overpopulated, especially in Matabeleland, so that thousands more people could not be forced into them without threatening the viability of the family farming that underwrote low wages. Despite intense white pressures not to assign more land to the designated African area, the government did add 4.1 million acres of SNAs in 1950. However, a significant proportion of this land was already densely occupied by Africans, so that it mainly eased the problem by making low quality, black occupied, white land part of the African area, effectively relocating thousands by a paper transfer.[47] NAD officials therefore concentrated on measures to increase the carrying capacity of the African areas, allowing more people to be pushed into the reserves and SNAs. With this goal, the state began to more aggressively support some aspects of the agricultural betterment programme and to force people to comply with them. The main initiatives were limiting and reducing cattle numbers, creating nucleated settlements and restricting individual land holdings as permanent arable and grazing areas were established.[48]

Linked to these measures was a settler environmental discourse that attributed the consequences of overpopulation – soil erosion, deforestation, declining soil fertility – to peasants' farming methods, particularly those who had adopted new tools and techniques:[49]

> As is to be expected, the Native is rarely alive to the importance of conserving the soil; his concern is to get crops, with the consequence that the disease of erosion is spreading at an alarming pace where the primitive methods of agriculture have given place to the plough. ... In some districts, the Natives' quest for more and more land has transformed once beautifully clad hills into gaunt spectres of ruin. One trustworthy witness instanced a hill, formerly covered with grass and trees, losing every atom of soil after having been attacked by Native cultivation.[50]

Environmental degradation was seen as a key part of what was increasingly presented as a rural crisis in the post war years. Looking back and assessing the extent of the damage to the African areas is difficult, although it would be hard to conclude that no important physical changes were happening. Officials used environmental concerns to justify intervention in the rural areas and to win greater funding for the NAD, probably turning to selective reporting and exaggeration to make their claims. More basically, environmental alarmism, which peaked during the Great Depression and again during the transitional years of the late 1940s and early 1950s, expressed wider settler insecurity.[51] Soil erosion became a powerful metaphor for the perceived undermining of white control of the colony and its resources in a period of economic transition and insecurity. Black tenant farmers were particular targets of concern. Not only were they damaging 'white' resources, but their presence on European land violated settlers' plans for segregation, as the black sea ate away the islands of white.[52]

The NLHA promised to address a variety of these settler concerns. By raising the carrying capacity of the African areas, it would facilitate forced relocations and promote racial segregation. In a more liberal vein, officials argued that the law would create a prosperous peasantry, forming the foundations for political stability. More in line with established Rhodesian racial policy, it gave the NAD greater powers to supervise and control the lives of peasants, intruding much further into rural society and production. It also held out the promise of a larger, cheaper, and more easily controlled work force, as young men and migrants lost access to land, becoming a dependent and vulnerable proletariat, subject to a range of controls. Proponents of the law argued that food production would increase as peasants adopted new methods and were drawn further into the market. This would provide cheap food, while reducing imports – but the strict

limits on the accumulation of holdings would prevent peasants competing with white farmers. As rural people produced and bought more and workers became more dependent on their wages, the cash economy would broaden, creating a larger market for the colony's industries. Further, the NLHA offered a solution to the rural crisis by protecting the physical environment at minimal cost to the state, while simultaneously allowing the NAD to cram more people into the African areas.

These diverse motives behind the NLHA highlight its complexity. Conservation, segregation, agricultural modernisation, and intensified state control intermingle in a manner that echoes one of Escher's famous drawings, where perspective suddenly shifts and new features jump out. The varied meanings and interpretations of the law are not an illusion. Their diversity reflects the government's efforts to placate competing political interests, and it is this very malleability of the NLHA that explains its passage when many other proposed initiatives failed, or were delayed or severely constrained in the late 1940s and 1950s.

Implementation and High Modernism

In the years immediately following its passage, implementation of the NLHA was very slow. Work began in only three of the 98 reserves and SNAs between 1951 and 1954. Financing for programmes under the law was limited, as its proponents were unable to build support within the government, and were fighting critics within the NAD who argued the measure was poorly thought out.[53] During this initial period, however, a technocratic group of officials drawn mainly from the agriculture division of the NAD and the Natural Resources Board drafted an ambitious and expensive programme to rapidly implement the NLHA throughout the country, arguing it would transform African farming. The proposal was successful, largely because it did not require any additional state funding; rather it relied on already planned expenditures on African agriculture, revenues from state development levies on African crop sales, and borrowing against future income from these levies – including the expected dramatic increase in production, sales, and crop levies because of the NLHA. Cabinet approval rested primarily on the implications of accelerated implementation that were most desirable for white settlers – that it would facilitate forced relocations by allowing officials to move more Africans into the reserves and provide funds for road and water development in remote SNAs, making resettlement in these areas feasible – as well as its proclaimed developmental, conservation, and propaganda benefits.[54]

So in 1955, the NAD launched a highly publicised £12 million plan to fully implement the NLHA in almost all the reserves and SNAs by the end of 1961, making the act the centerpiece of state development efforts for the colony's African population. The parallels with late colonial labour stabilisation and modernisation schemes in other parts of the continent allowed the Rhodesian regime to aggressively publicise the NLHA programme, using the plan to blunt growing international criticism of its racial policies, thereby creating conditions that would help to draw investment from outside the colony, and justify white rule.[55]

The Todd government promoted the NLHA programme extensively through film, government publications, the British *Journal of African Administration*, diplomatic tours, and African-targeted newspapers, eventually winning the approval of international agronomists. The act's liberal proponents within the NAD led these efforts, portraying the plan as a high modernist development scheme that would transform the reserves and the role of peasant agriculture in the colony.[56] By standardising land and cattle holdings and permanently designating the use of land areas, the NLHA was supposed to bring order, rationality and progress – in short, modernity – to the reserves:

> The methodical and systematic layout of lands has increased the grazing areas. Technical officers find it easier to check and organise their work. Administrative control, so essential to promote development and improvement programmes, is complete. The Native Land Husbandry Act stabilises an area, the fundamental problems are crystallised, it limits the maximum number of native farmers and lays the foundations for future land use and farm planning on an organised, intensive and progressive basis.[57]

State propaganda further presented the NLHA as a popular intervention that Africans supported, a modern developmentalist scheme to lift peasants out of their purported backwardness:

> Consulted on every detail in the Land Husbandry Act, the native people have had the courage and wisdom to participate in an agricultural revolution, which cuts straight across their time-honoured traditions and tribal customs. A revolution which is leading them to the first step on the ladder to western standards.[58]

The reserves were also supposed to be economically transformed by the implementation of the act. Officials argued that the plan for rapid national implementation would lead to a 50 percent increase in the value of crops produced in the African areas within 5 years, and a 50 percent rise in cattle output in 8 years, lifting the average cash income per peasant family

from £17 to £41 per annum.[59] The proponents of the NLHA argued that the benefits of this growth would be felt throughout the economy as rural Africans became model consumers:

> The doubling and more of the cash income from the produce of Native Agriculture will open up a huge market for agricultural and household requisites and a wide range of these and other commodities will find rapidly increasing sales in the Native areas, to the great benefit of trade and industry generally.[60]

Thus the NLHA was promoted as a model development scheme, a paternalistic measure that would bring modernity and economic progress to the reserves, while spreading its benefits to all the occupants of the colony under benevolent white rule.

These arguments for economic transformation were based on dubious figures from a single reserve, so that the prophetic image of the colony's future really rested on officials' belief in the inherent superiority of modernity, and assumptions about African primitivism and the need for European guidance.[61] In common with the general racism of white settlers, these ideas shifted responsibility for the consequences of state policies that impoverished blacks to essentialised African characteristics. Moreover, contrary to the assumptions behind the NLHA, black peasants were already heavily involved in produce markets, and had adopted a variety of new tools and techniques. Yields – for those who used indigenous methods as well as those who had adopted new ones – were much higher than officials thought.[62] There were real challenges facing peasant agriculture, but they were not some form of 'primitivism'. Rather, they were rooted in labour problems, shortages of draught power, lack of capital, land shortage, and soil exhaustion, in which state land policies, discriminatory pricing, low wages and measures to extract labour played a central role.[63] These were key features of the colonial political economy, which the modernist dreams of the NLHA did not challenge.

The plans for accelerated implementation of the NLHA rapidly ran into trouble, and fell far behind schedule. Financing presented tremendous difficulties, as the planned international loans did not materialise until 1960.[64] There were chronic staff shortages, organisational problems and planning confusion. More basically, the implementation schedule was wildly optimistic and therefore unrealistic. By April 1959, four years into the scheme, only 25 percent of individual land rights and 28 percent of stock rights had been distributed in the areas that were scheduled for completion by 1960.[65] Most importantly, implementation of the NLHA

encountered growing resistance from peasants throughout the country in the late 1950s and early 1960s. Initially these reactions slowed and complicated implementation, but as the coercive efforts of officials intensified, rural opposition expanded dramatically, eventually threatening state control and colonial dominance itself.

Resistance and ungovernability

The NLHA was wildly unpopular with Africans of all social positions. Once its implications became clear, criticism was almost universal, although many people did not express their grievances to colonial officials.[66] Peasants' objections to the act were complex, but at the core of Africans' complaints lay a rejection of the state's extension of its influence into rural people's lives, that is, to the essence of the developmental project. Until the late 1930s, the state generally had limited ambitions in the reserves: maintaining order at minimal cost, extracting taxes and labour, as well as some crops, which created space for peasants to carve out some independence from colonial demands.[67] Many men strove to limit their participation in the labour market, which required access to other sources of money for taxes and other family needs that required cash. Most oscillated between waged labour and farming, but some men, mainly older ones, were able to stay in the reserves, avoiding employment through crop and cattle sales, as well as cash provided by their sons and other relations. Their relative affluence rested on a variety of patriarchal social networks that allowed them to benefit from the work of women, their male relatives and the poor. These were complicated relationships, moderated by ties of affection and by promises of individual social advancement, but they were also exploitative.[68] The NLHA introduced a new balance of power to the countryside, giving the state a much greater role. This change threatened the bases of rural accumulation, unequal access to land resources and the social networks that made the 'partial autonomy' of people in the reserves possible.[69] The threat runs through peasants' specific grievances with the act, which are also bound up with coercion, dispossession, social disruption, and the loss of personal economic security, as well as wider objections to white domination.

Dispossession was the most basic grievance people had with the NLHA. Destocking – the forced sale of domestic animals in excess of the permitted number – looms large in people's memories, particularly as the worst-hit areas faced reductions of up to two-thirds of their animals. While only a minority, albeit a sizable one, of peasants owned cattle, stock were the key to rural accumulation, as a source of draught power for ploughing

and a rapidly reproducing asset that could weather poor seasons.[70] While men controlled cattle, women also recognised their importance for family success, as Ambuya Musonza made clear:

> They did, yes, the whites came to cut down [the numbers of] our cattle. It was wrong, very very wrong. Cattle are our [Africans'] wealth, our only wealth, the one way we have to become rich. How could they do that?[71]

The law also forcibly dispossessed people of land, as it denied labour migrants and young men access to arable holdings, especially as many reserves were so overcrowded that men who were not working the land at the time the NLHA was implemented would likely never receive a holding. Among both the Shona and Ndebele, community membership implied the right to a plot of land and access to the communal grazing. This basic right was cut off by the law. Africans refused to accept this decision, especially as land provided the basis for economic security in a country where the pension system and unemployment benefits were restricted to whites. A delegation of elders raised these issues while meeting with the Chief Native Commissioner:

> Is it lawful for the people to have their things taken away by force? We have been given lands, but our children have been told they cannot have lands or live in the area. We have had no good harvests since allocation. Now our cattle are going. The Native Commissioner says he is carrying out the laws of the Government when he takes our cattle away. The Native Commissioner said that we could make our complaints to Salisbury.[72]

Landlessness became a serious problem as NLHA implementation moved ahead. In August 1961 the NAD had registered more than 45,000 men across the country who had applied for land but could not receive plots as there was no land in their areas. If their families were of typical size, this meant 225,000 people, about one-fifth of the population, did not have land.[73] The crisis was especially marked in certain regions. In the Mangwende Reserve more than 40 percent of men from the area did not receive allocations.[74]

There were also strong objections to the farming methods promoted as 'improved' agriculture, as they clashed with many peasants' practices. Indigenous Shona techniques were based on the hoe, shifting cultivation and inter-cropping to ensure food security while minimising labour inputs. Maximal production was sacrificed to ensure a reasonable harvest and workload in all but the worst years. Many farmers, however, had adopted ploughs, new crops, and some innovative techniques to expand the area that they could use and ease workloads while increasing production and

sales. By 1950 field practices varied widely, but most farmers' options were disrupted by the NLHA. It cut off shifting cultivation, which was a key mechanism for peasants to preserve soil fertility. Inter-cropping was also threatened. It was used to reduce weeding and other labour demands, preserve moisture in the earth, and protect the soil from erosion by heavy rains. NLHA regulations prevented people working dambo land - flat naturally wet areas where groundwater rose to the surface – and riverbanks where water was readily accessible. Both of these areas were generally controlled by women and played a vital role in crop diversity and food security. Dambo land was used to raise rice and a tuber called tsenza, while river banks were used for gardens to produce vegetables, early maize and pumpkins that helped people to survive the hungry season, the time from mid-January to early April when last year's crops could run out while this year's were ripening.[75] Some plough owners worked large fields, allowing them to sell considerable amounts of grain; individual allocation was intended to block this route to accumulation.[76] More basically, while colonial authorities believed that 'improved' techniques produced vastly more than peasant methods, many Africans questioned this - as did the first comprehensive study that measured and compared the output of different cropping practices.[77]

Peasants' most basic complaint concerned the increased workload created by the methods advocated by the state, which imposed a much more onerous labour system to maintain fertility on permanent fields and to meet state conservation models than indigenous techniques. Digging and moving cattle manure to improve soil fertility was an onerous task, as was stumping fields. Fixed cultivation, especially while using manure, exponentially increased the number of weeds, and thus the work required to control them.[78] The physical conservation works required under the NLHA, particularly the contour ridges and the storm drains that they required took a tremendous amount of hard labour, work that had to be completed before the landholders were allowed to use their holding. Shingaidze Madewe remembered this difficult work well, seeing it as another form of forced labour:

> Those agriculture officers, people did not hate them; it was only that the work they gave us was too much. It was chibaro [forced labour]. It did not pay or help us in any way.[79]

Religious objections were also raised to new methods, with spirit mediums who were possessed by prominent ancestors proclaiming that people should not adopt imported techniques.[80]

The spatial rearrangements brought by the NLHA generated a wide range of concerns. Conflicts over field boundaries surfaced, and people found adjusting to living in nucleated settlements difficult. Minor tensions flared over personalities, children, dogs, and particularly because of closer observation of habits and consumption.[81] Maintaining family ties presented a special challenge, as parents preferred to have at least one son build his home close to them, who would have primary responsibility to assist them as they aged.[82] NLHA regulations about housing stands made this difficult. Some people argue that new living patterns had profound social and cultural effects.

> How can we stay with our ways? The Europeans came and forced us into lines. We used to live here, there, over there, way over there, scattered all about. Now we're all crowded together, and have to give up our customs.[83]

More importantly, the restrictions and demands of the NLHA disrupted relationships and social bonds. Land restrictions compounded gendered conflicts within the family as women and men argued over who could use which area and what should be grown. This eroded the bases of women's independence, rooted in their control of certain crops and types of arable land. Arguments also occurred over farming techniques, particularly where a man wanted to fully embrace 'improved' methods while the woman wanted to assert her right to plant pumpkins and beans in with male crops such as maize and millet.[84] Disagreements about production methods surfaced along generational lines, especially between fathers and sons.[85] Stock and land restrictions threatened broader social networks. Marriages, generally secured by the payment of 8 to 10 head of cattle to the woman's family, were complicated by the restrictions on individual holdings. Patronage links were strained. The relatively affluent had used surplus grain and lending cattle to hire labour and to secure support from other community members, practices that became increasingly difficult with destocking and land limitations.[86]

The burdens of the NLHA fell disproportionately on young men and women. They were called upon to perform much of the heavy labour of building contour ridges and digging storm drains by their parents and older relatives. Their prospects for marrying, establishing independent families, and progressing socially were shattered in areas where land was so short that further allocations were impossible after the initial implementation. Independence, accumulation and farming success lay at the centre of male identities, as men aspired to be patriarchs over extensive extended families. Older women and men also viewed the implications of

the NLHA with concern, as this severing of young people's rural opportunities threatened their long term security, which relied on the support and assistance of their children.

Thus the NLHA posed a wide threat to peasants' production strategies, economic security, and social networks. However, it met with little open opposition in the early years of implementation. In part, this was because the first areas selected were reserves where earlier betterment work had been done, so state intrusion was not something new for residents. This also meant people in these areas had developed evasion strategies. In Chinamora Reserve, the government's NLHA showpiece, people began 'illegally' cultivating in 1953, the year following individual land allocation, while in Manyene and Sabi North reserves people drove some of their cattle onto the underutilised Wiltshire Estate whenever officials came to conduct stock counts.[87] Previous improvement efforts had been poorly enforced, so residents appear to have assumed this would also happen with the NLHA.

These patterns of grudging acceptance and evasion remained the most common responses as implementation spread into new areas and intensified after 1955. The lack of open opposition, interpreted by the state as willing consent, did not mean that people did not have the grievances described above. Rather, it reflected their fear of the colonial authorities, and a general sense of powerlessness to affect state policy. Shingaidzo Madewe expressed this sense of resignation well, explaining people's failure to complain when implementation began in his village in Madziwa Reserve: 'That was not the time to do that, one could only agree'.[88] In a similar vein, Levison Chanakira also spoke of the inability to influence authorities, even when discontent was obvious: 'We did nothing, but the government realised we were angry. We did not do anything as we could not do anything'.[89]

Doing nothing meant avoiding confrontation, rather than accepting the state's diktats. After land allocation, many peasants expanded their arable holdings by moving beacons, working the areas designated for conservation works such as contour ridges, or taking over land proclaimed as grazing, particularly where it bordered their allocation.[90] From the beginning, many people refused to give authorities information about their stock and land holdings or simply ran away during the initial survey and census phases of implementation. Such action was so widespread that the administration had to introduce regulations requiring people to provide this information in 1955.[91] In Nata Reserve, communities who had been 'finally' moved five times to open up land for white settlers simply refused to obey their land allocations, and ploughed where they liked in 1960 and 1961.[92]

This move from evasion to defiance grew as the scale of implementation increased in the late 1950s, and the state's determination to enforce the Act became clear through coercive enforcement mechanisms. Cattle were seized and sold and people prosecuted for NLHA violations in many parts of the countryside. Disrupted meetings and gatherings with officials became common. Vociferous public grumbling occurred throughout Madziwa, often initiated by enraged women. In Levison Chanakira's community, residents chanted 'Hatidi, hatidi' – 'we don't want it, we don't want it' – when the Native Commissioner (NC) discussed individual land allocation.[93] Implementation had to be suspended three times in 1959 in one village in Mhondoro Reserve when people refused to move to new fields and residential sites. Authorities finally abandoned the effort for the year after a riot nearly broke out when the NC confronted women who had pulled up the wooden pegs marking allocations.[94] In another Mhondoro community, people discarded the land allocation cards as the NC distributed them at a public meeting, then surged forward, threw away his tea, and threatened him and the village headman until the NC pulled a gun and fired two shots into the air.[95] Many black agricultural demonstrators, the implementation line agents, were physically threatened, and some were reportedly killed; many ran away from their assignments.[96] Violence and sabotage directed against white and black NAD employees, chiefs, and village headmen became more common in 1960 and 1961. Chief Nyakena of Fort Victoria Reserve and his messenger were beaten in February 1961 for enforcing a destocking order, and then the NC was shouted down when he arrived to try and calm people. At a land registration meeting in Buhera in March of 1961, the crowd of 200 people prevented the first grantee from accepting his land right. This prompted the NC to hit a few people with his revolver, fire several shots into the air, and then to threaten to shoot people – seriously enough that the white Land Development Officer (LDO) at the meeting seized the gun. The crowd ran off but blocked the wheels of the NC's car with piles of stones. Later that month in Urungwe Reserve, an unknown group broke into the LDO's office, burned the land allocation files in the toilet, and then set fire to the office and the LDO's Landrover.[97]

While this intensified opposition was bound up with the state's accelerating efforts to implement the act, it was also tied to the spread of nationalist activity in the late 1950s. Evaluating the influence of the nationalist parties is difficult. The state attributed all rural discontent to outside agitators, and the new African political organisations gladly claimed responsibility. Security and police reports were extensive, but

scattered because settlers destroyed many sensitive records in 1979 and 1980 as majority rule loomed. Nationalist ideas clearly influenced people, as did rumours and stories of confrontations in other areas, but many incidents occurred in places where African politicians were not active. Nationalists may have played a key role in moving protest from expressions of anger and rejection to more pointed attacks on colonial structures and authorities. Several men in Madziwa Reserve made this association and said nationalist activists helped people to overcome their fear of Europeans.[98] Leaders of the African National Congress, which operated from 1957 until it was banned in 1959, did a lot of work in the rural areas. They frequently attacked the NLHA, saying settlers had stolen people's land and cattle, arguing the goal of the act was to provide cheap labour for Europeans.[99] The ANC was strongly supported in a number of districts where implementation pressures were intense, including Sipolilo, Umtali and the Mhondoro Reserve. Rural party activists detained in February 1959 often raised the NLHA in their complaints. Gibson Nyandoro of Mhondoro, said during his interrogation by the police:

> The complaints I want to put to the Government are that I have 8 cattle of which 6 are to be 'destocked', that I have 6 acres of land and have been told that I am to get 8 acres, which is not enough for my needs, that I am not allowed to plant rice in the vlei (dambo), and I am not allowed to have a garden.[100]

While he was being questioned in March 1959 George Chipfatsura of Umtali District explained that he had joined the ANC

> because I was not allowed to have enough cattle nor land enough to plough. Because my cattle were not allowed to walk on the contour ridges... Also my sons who work in town, if they wish to come back to the reserve are not allowed to have cattle or any land. I expect Congress to give me more cattle and more land.[101]

The move to open defiance and protest in rural communities was a difficult period for reserve residents, and many people in Madziwa were reluctant to discuss these developments. In part this reflected the sensitivity of protest strategies, especially for farmers who are increasingly frustrated with the current realities of life in Zimbabwe. It was also, however, due to the turmoil and tensions of the early 1960s, which continue to resonate. Young men and women, who were most sharply affected by the NLHA, often took leading roles in the protests, inverting the gender and age hierarchies of rural society. Many older people, particularly men, spoke painfully about the fear they felt during the disturbances - fear of the state's

retribution, but also of the nationalist activists and the young people from the area who had mobilised themselves against the state and the reluctance of their elders.[102]

State authorities were most concerned by intensified nationalist activity in the late 1950s, reflected in the declaration of the State of Emergency and banning of the ANC in February 1959. By the early 1960s, however, the government was worried not only by the activities of the new National Democratic Party, but by the growing disorder in the urban townships and reserves. Much of the countryside was in a state of ungovernability; while no alternative political order had emerged, state control was breaking down, and officials were no longer able to impose government policies, especially the NLHA.[103] By October 1960, concern with conditions in the countryside reached the cabinet, which said that the reserves 'while not yet explosive, were dissatisfied'.[104] A special three day meeting of the Native Affairs Advisory Board (NAAB) was called in March 1961 to discuss the impending likely breakdown of order in the reserves. It established a series of internal NAD review committees, while the government began public hearings into the operations of the NAD and the role of peasant production in the national economy.[105] By June, members of the internal Working Party D, set up to consider questions about land and the role of 'tribal' authorities phrased the problem as: 'We have no time in the bank. We have to buy it. How do we buy it?'[106]

Intensified repression was one part of the state's answer. The police and army were deployed in the reserves, and airforce jets flew over disturbed areas. Public meetings in the reserves had been forbidden since early 1960, and the NDP was banned in December 1961.[107] More than 1300 people were convicted of violating the NLHA in 1961, and a further 1836 were punished in the first six months of 1962.[108] The government's consideration of a number of political proposals formed the second part. These initiatives were bound up with efforts to win greater constitutional autonomy from Britain, including proposals to ease racial segregation, replace the NAD with a single nonracial administration, and abolish the LAA.[109] The third part of the state's answer was to try and reduce the immediate grievances of rural Africans, hoping this would quiet the reserves. NLHA implementation was officially slowed in March 1961, and discussions began on how to modify the law, focusing on landlessness, drawing the chiefs and headmen into the allocation of land, and finding additional African areas. The technocrats within the NAD launched a plan that included temporary land allocations in the grazing areas for the landless that were to be allocated by the chiefs, and a new system of unit

planning, whereby the chiefs and headmen would represent the community in meetings with NAD officials to plan land use and individual allocations for their area. This was part of a wider plan to deflect criticism from the state as a member of the NAAB made clear:

> The essence of the approach is to get the right-holders in a unit to resist demands from non-right holders, by making them conscious of the value of their rights and responsibility for the development of their unit. It is getting back to the classic principle in administration of dividing and ruling.[110]

All of these initiatives failed. Peasant defiance and rural unrest continued to spread. With the police and army presence, however, people increasingly turned to sabotage rather than public gatherings.[111]

Behind the scenes, the little Rhodesia faction within the NAD renewed its attacks on the NLHA. They argued that the law was the root cause of discontent in the countryside, claiming that its 'supreme confidence in the power of intellectual planning based on the slide rule and statistics' ignored important human considerations and the cultural context within which Africans operated.[112] Nationalists had taken advantage of this.

> The N.D.P. has used the Government's land policy as the principle weapon in inciting disaffection towards the Government in the rural areas in their attempt to drive a wedge between the Chiefs and their people. It is now abundantly clear that both in concept and application, the Native Land Husbandry policy has ignored in some ways both tribal authority and Native law and custom and so enabled the agitator to foment trouble and opposition.[113]

This critique of the NLHA was part of the broader strategy that the 'culturalist', little Rhodesian clique in the NAD developed to respond to intense criticism of the department. Rural ungovernability had led to calls for the abolition of the department and two major inquiries into the breakdown of state control.[114] The culturalists directed criticism towards the technocrats and NLHA to save the NAD, arguing that the methods used by the department before the act was introduced had been far more effective, a form of benevolent paternalism that was compatible with cultural differences. They presented an essentialised construction of Africans as communal people, rather than individualists, who could not operate outside of 'their' framework of kin, chiefs, and patriarchal dominance. The culturalists called for a drastic scaling back of interventionist programmes in the reserves and to return control of land, minor administration, and local judicial matters to the chiefs. This was not

presented as a simple return to the past, but a reaffirmation of the 'real' NAD as part of a new philosophy, Community Development. This approach had the additional advantage of wide international acceptability, particularly from the United States, which provided and paid for a community development advisor in Rhodesia as part of the containment strategy.[115]

The culturalists' effort was partially successful. Rural disturbances continued, but the technocrats were marginalised. In February 1962 the cabinet suspended NLHA implementation, leaving it only partially completed in many reserves. This decision was never publicly announced to avoid any appearance of weakness on the state's part. Without the NLHA, the budget for African agriculture was slashed, and the NAD, renamed as the Department of Internal Affairs, continued as a separate administration for the African population under the Community Development policy, retaining many of its staff.[116] The culturalists' ascendancy was secured by the December 1962 election, when the Rhodesian Front (RF) ousted the URP. There were already strong ties between the RF and the culturalists, and Internal Affairs was rapidly reorganised to push out any critics of the Front.[117] African Community Development, until then an ill-defined policy, became an articulated plan for separate development, that is apartheid. The RF victory reflected a shift in white politics. Urban and rural unrest, growing international criticism of Rhodesia's racial policy, Britain's demands for constitutional reforms, and especially a marked economic decline that threatened white prosperity fueled a shift in the white polity, undercutting support for greater Rhodesia measures. The RF was the embodiment of little Rhodesian thinking, with its harsh racial policies, extensive support for the European community, and willingness to pursue a separate independence for the colony. Its victory rested on the support of white workers and clerical employees, but it also reflected a shift in the middle, as people who had supported some aspects of a greater Rhodesia in the expanding economy of the late 1940s and 1950s became defensive, looking to secure white domination and the bases of their privilege.[118]

Conclusion

The withdrawal of the NLHA was an ambiguous victory for Zimbabwe's peasants. The settler state was forced to back down, but this was part of its response to broader challenges than rural ungovernability, including urban unrest, intensifying nationalist activity, a contracting economy and political struggles within the European polity. No further implementation took place after February 1962 and the administration largely disavowed

reserve development schemes. Rural conditions eased as thousands of people received land from the chiefs and headmen, destocking ended, and people regained some of the partial autonomy that they had fought to defend against the intrusive liberalism of the state. However, land allocation and the settlement patterns of the nucleated villages were not generally reversed, so that they remain important features shaping the landscape of many reserves today, albeit as one of several factors. People have received land from the chiefs, bought it from villagers, or simply occupied it in the ensuing years. Houses have been built along varied patterns, some adjoining the colonial lines and others scattered across the countryside. But many who received allocations under the NLHA use its provisions to legitimate their claim to the limited resources of the communal areas.[119]

Abandoning the NLHA did not undo racial land apportionment, and the limited post- independence land reform of the 1980s and 1990s did little to redress that reality, so that most peasants continued to face overcrowding, environmental degradation, and their social consequences. The current confusion of the Fast Track Land Reform - compounded by the economic crisis and political turmoil - makes it difficult to see what benefit the recent land seizures will have for residents of the communal areas. While some land has been redistributed to peasants, the clearest goals behind the programme have been to undermine popular support for the MDC by extending the promise of new land, to reward senior ZANU members and to increase the number of black commercial farmers.

Moreover, as the liberation struggle intensified after 1962, the nationalist leadership attacked many dimensions of Rhodesia's complex web of racial oppression, but their focus on juridical and constitutional issues meant that peasants' objections to the forms of earlier state intervention in the countryside were obscured. The obvious racism and political allegiances of the culturalist faction within the NAD discredited their critique of the NLHA and the technocrats' approach to peasant agriculture. After 1980, the dramatically expanded agricultural extension service in the communal areas revived many of the technocrats' methods. The service emphasised mono-cropping, manuring, building contour ridges, and other modernist techniques while maintaining the restrictions on riverbank and wetland cultivation. Although the post-independence extension officers lacked the coercive means of the NLHA, many reproduced colonial ideas about peasant backwardness and the dangers of indigenous farming techniques, as Michael Drinkwater has argued.[120] The idea of individual tenure as a modernising measure that encourages

'responsible land use' has also continued. The majority of resettlement areas in the 1980s operated on the Model A basis, which gave use rights, rather than full tenure, to individual peasants, and the current Fast Track programme is using the same model for small scale redistribution. The opposition MDC's agrarian policy emphasises moving to individual tenure in the communal areas, as well as resettlement schemes.[121]

Despite the short life of the NLHA, the legacies of the measure therefore continue to influence developments in Zimbabwe today, shaping the rural landscape, state policies, reform proposals, and agrarian services. The political legacies of the period are also important, reflected and refracted in the intense demand for land redistribution, the turmoil around the Fast Track Land Reform, and deep popular discontent with the economic and political situation facing the country.

Notes

1. I would gratefully like to acknowledge financial support for this project from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, the University of Alberta, as well as the Graduate School, History Department and the MacArthur Interdisciplinary Program on Global Change, Sustainability and Justice of the University of Minnesota. I would also like to thank the members of the Department of Economic History at the University of Zimbabwe for their input and support.
2. This comment applies to the published literature; there are a number of conference and seminar papers, theses and dissertations that discuss events in the countryside during this period, but they are, unfortunately, not widely available.
3. Major works on the period before 1945 include Giovanni Arrighi, *The Political Economy of Rhodesia*, (The Hague, Mouton, 1967), Giovanni Arrighi, 'Labour Supplies in Historical Perspective: A Study of the Proletarianization of the African Peasantry in Rhodesia', *The Journal of Development Studies*, 6 (1970), pp.197–234, H. Moyana, *The Political Economy of Land in Zimbabwe*, (Gweru, Mambo Press, 1984), Robin Palmer, *Land and Racial Domination in Rhodesia*, (London, Heinemann, 1977), Robin Palmer, 'The Agricultural History of Rhodesia', in Robin Palmer and Neil Parsons (eds.), *The Roots of Rural Poverty in Central and Southern Africa*, (Berkeley and Los Angeles, University of California Press, 1977), Ian Phimister, 'Discourse and the Discipline of Historical Context: Conservationism and Ideas about in Development in Southern Rhodesia, 1930–1950', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 12 (1986), pp. 263–275, Ian Phimister, 'Commodity Relations and Class Formation in the Zimbabwean Countryside, 1898-1920', *Journal of Peasant Studies*, 13 (1986), pp. 240–257, Ian Phimister, *An Economic and Social History of Zimbabwe*, 1890–1948: Capital Accumulation and Class

Struggle, (London and New York, Longman, 1988), Robin Palmer, *Land and Racial Domination in Rhodesia*, (London, Heinemann, 1977), Robin Palmer, 'The Agricultural History of Rhodesia', in Robin Palmer and Neil Parsons (eds.), *The Roots of Rural Poverty in Central and Southern Africa*, (Berkeley and Los Angeles, University of California Press, 1977), T. Ranger, 'Growing from the Roots: Reflections on Peasant Research in Central and Southern Africa', *Journal of Southern African Studies* 5 (1978), pp. 99–133, Elizabeth Schmidt, *Peasants, Traders and Wives. Shona Women in the History of Zimbabwe, 1870–1939*, (Portsmouth, Heinemann, 1992).

4. There is some scattered published scholarship on the NLHA, including William R. Duggan 'The Native Land Husbandry Act of 1951 and the Rural African Middle Class of Southern Rhodesia', *African Affairs*, 79 (1980), pp. 227–239, Victor E.M. Machingaidze, 'Agrarian Change from Above: The Southern Rhodesia Native Land Husbandry Act and African Response', *International Journal of African Historical Studies*, 24 (1991), pp. 557–588, Ian Phimister, 'Rethinking the Reserves: Southern Rhodesia's Land Husbandry Act Reviewed', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 19 (1993), pp. 225–239. While the older literature on the growth of nationalism before the liberation war mainly focuses on urban developments, formal organisations and constitutional debates, there is a growing body of work that looks at rural identity and engagement with nationalism in this period; see Jocelyn Alexander, JoAnn McGregor, Terence Ranger, *Violence and Memory: One Hundred Years in the Dark Forests of Matabeleland*, (Portsmouth, Heinemann, 2000), Ngwabi Bhebe, Benjamin Burombo: African Politics in Zimbabwe, 1947–1958, (Harare: The College Press, 1989), Terence Ranger, *Peasant Consciousness and Guerrilla War in Zimbabwe*, (London, James Currey, 1985), T. O. Ranger, *Voices from the Rocks: Nature, Culture and History in the Matopos Hills of Zimbabwe*, (Oxford: James Currey, 1999).
5. I would like to thank my research assistants, Rangarirai Gurure, Solomon Mahdi, and Obert Kufinya for their invaluable assistance. For full details see my doctoral dissertation, 'Cultivating Conflict: 'Improved' Agriculture and Modernisation in Colonial Zimbabwe, 1920–1965', (PhD Dissertation, University of Minnesota, 2000).
6. Southern Rhodesia's Land Apportionment Act restricted land access along racial lines and was the cornerstone of racial segregation in the colony. The more desirable areas were reserved for Europeans, and were made up of large farms· the minimum economic size was considered to be 750 acres. There were three categories of African land: reserves which were constitutionally protected tracts scattered throughout the country; Special Native Areas allocated for African occupation in 1949, ostensibly on a temporary basis; and Native Purchase Areas where approved black applicants could purchase farms that averaged 200 acres. For details see Palmer, *Land and Racial Domination*.

7. The section that follows describing the law is based on: 'The Native Land Husbandry Act' in Southern Rhodesia, *The Statute Law of Southern Rhodesia, 1951*, (Salisbury, Government Printer, 1952), pp. 893–916; A. Pendered and W. von Memerty, 'The Native Land Husbandry Act of Southern Rhodesia', *Journal of African Administration*, v. 7, no. 3 (1955), pp. 99–109, particularly pp. 103–108; J.E.S. Bradford, 'Survey and Registration of African Land Units in Southern Rhodesia', *Journal of African Administration*, v. 7, no. 4 (1955), pp. 165–170; Mary Elizabeth Bulman, 'The Native Land Husbandry Act of Southern Rhodesia: A Failure in Land Reform', (MSc Thesis, University of London, 1970), pp. 5–10.
8. See John L. Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution, Volume 1: Christianity, Colonialism and Consciousness in South Africa*, (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1991) and John L. Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, *Of Revelation and Revolution, Volume 2: The Dialectics of Modernity on a South African Frontier*, (Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1997), William Beinart, 'Soil Erosion, Conservationism and Ideas About Development: A Southern African Exploration, 1900–1960', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 11 (1984), pp. 52–83, Ian Phimister, 'Discourse and the Discipline', Eira Kramer, '"Coercion, not Persuasion". Transformation of the Centralisation Policy in the Reserves, 1935–1951', Paper presented at *The Zimbabwe Economy*, August 4th to 10th 1998, University of Zimbabwe.
9. See Phimister, 'Discourse and the Discipline'.
10. United States Department of Commerce, *Investment in the Federation of Rhodesia and Nyasaland. Basic Information for United States Businessmen*, (Washington, US Government Printing Office, 1956), p. 101.
11. Arrighi, *Political Economy*, pp. 40–41, pp. 46–48, Phimister, *Economic and Social*, pp. 220–223.
12. H. Dunlop, *The Development of European Agriculture in Rhodesia, 1945– 1965*, (Salisbury: Department of Economics Occasional Paper No. 5, Department of Economics, University of Rhodesia, 1971), pp. 7–8, Mandivamba Rukuni, 'The Evolution of Agricultural Policy: 1890-1990' in Mandivamba Rukuni and Carl K. Eicher (eds.), *Zimbabwe's Agricultural Revolution*, (Harare, University of Zimbabwe Press, 1994), pp. 22–24, p. 22 fn, Roger Riddell, 'Zimbabwe's Land Problem: The Central Issue', *Journal of Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*, 28 (1980), pp. 5–6, Arrighi, *Political Economy*, p. 46.
13. Phimister, Economic and Social, p. 225, p. 227, Arrighi, *Political Economy*, p. 41, pp. 46–47, Dunlop, pp. 7–8, Ranger, *Peasant Consciousness*, p. 103.
14. Southern Rhodesia Development Coordinating Commission, *Third Interim Report: The Pattern of Progress*, (Salisbury, Rhodesian Printing and Publishing for the Government Stationery Office, 1949), p. 16.
15. Leonard Tow, *The Manufacturing Economy of Southern Rhodesia: Problems and Prospects*, (Washington, National Academy of Sciences, 1960), p. 16, Christine Sylvester, *Zimbabwe: The Terrain of Contradictory Development*, (Boulder and San Francisco, Westview, 1991), p. 37.

16. Rukuni, p. 22, Howard Simson, *Zimbabwe – A Country Study*, (Uppsala, The Scandinavian Institute of African Studies, 1979), p. 43, Tow, pp. 123–125, p. 12, p. 17, Arrighi, *Political Economy*, p. 42, p. 45, p. 49, Phimister, *Economic and Social*, p. 255.
17. Arrighi, *Political Economy*, pp. 40–41, National Archives of Zimbabwe (NAZ) S2223/23, Cabinet Resolutions of 9/9/47, NAZ S3238/8 Memo from the Chairman of the Public Services Board to the Acting Prime Minister, 17/11/47, pp. 1-2, NAZ S2223/25 SRC (49), 49th Meeting of the Cabinet, 4/10/49, p. 6, NAZS2223/26 SRC (50) 22nd Meeting of the Cabinet, 13/5/50, p. 5–6, SRC (50) 42nd Meeting of the Cabinet, 24/10/50, pp. 9-10, SRC (50) 48th Meeting of the Cabinet, 29/11/50, pp. 1–3.
18. Riddell, p. 4, p. 8. Simson, p. 17, US Commerce, pp. 78-79, Tow, pp. 119–120.
19. US Commerce, p. 78.
20. Simson, p. 17.
21. Riddell, p. 8, Colin Leys, *European Politics in Southern Rhodesia*, (Oxford, The Clarendon Press, 1959), pp. 107–108, US Commerce, p. 71.
22. This insight is partly derived from a series of comments by Timothy Burke in *Lifebuoy Men, Lux Women. Commodification, Consumption and Cleanliness in Modern Zimbabwe*, (Durham, Duke University Press, 1996), p. 92, p. 95, pp. 107–110.
23. These faults mark all the major works on the period, although not all make both mistakes. Arrighi does make both, while Phimister proclaims the dominance of industrial interests. Leys is far too ready to see the small openings made to Africans during the Federation period as significant.
24. White unity is Ley's central argument; see pp. 88–94 for his arguments about homogenising forces in settler society. For more on white culture and dynamics, also see Dane Kennedy, *Islands of White: Settler Society and Culture in Kenya and Southern Rhodesia, 1890–1939*, (Durham, Duke University Press, 1987). The population figures are from Tow, p. 93.
25. For a fuller discussion of white political dynamics, see my doctoral dissertation, Guy Thompson, 'Cultivating Conflict: Modernism and "Improved" Agriculture in colonial Zimbabwe, 1920-1965' (PhD Dissertation, University of Minnesota, 2000). This insight into the corporatist nature of the Southern Rhodesia state is derived from Leys's work and particularly from D. J. Murray's *The Governmental System in Southern Rhodesia*, (Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1970), although he never uses the term.
26. See Murray and Kennedy throughout, Leys pp. 88-94, pp. 144–146, pp. 158–161, Richard Gray, *The Two Nations: Aspects of the Development of Race Relations in the Rhodesias and Nyasaland*, (London, Oxford University Press for the Institute of Race Relations, 1960), p. 22.
27. See Murray throughout, as well as Arrighi's arguments in *Political Economy*. Arrighi, however overstates the importance of class divisions, downplaying the unifying forces within the settler community. Leys also has a good section on the major interests and the differences between them on pp. 104–128, but he sees them as unimportant, especially on pp. 93–97.

28. This model is derived from an extensive rereading of the secondary literature, but the main influence is Larry W. Bowman, *Politics in Rhodesia. White Power in an African State* (Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1973). His central argument is that while Europeans had a common goal of securing white domination, they disagreed over the best methods to do so. He pays little attention, however, to the class roots of different positions. See particularly pp. 17–19, pp. 31–3, pp. 43–44. For other insights into this division, see Hardwicke Holderness, *Lost Chance: Southern Rhodesia 1945–58*, (Harare, Zimbabwe Publishing House, 1985), especially pp. 106–107 on arguments about the Federation, and Gray, p. 227–228.
29. For insight into greater Rhodesia views and the interests that promoted them, see Leys, pp. 156-158, Gray, pp. 24–25, p. 277, and Ian Hancock, *White Liberals, Moderates and Radicals in Rhodesia, 1953-1980*, (London and Sydney, Croon Helm, and New York, St Martin's, 1984), especially pp. 28–33.
30. Little Rhodesia views are discussed in Leys, pp. 158-159, Gray, pp. 310–312. Details on the little Rhodesian Liberal, Confederate and Democratic Parties are in Leys, p. 164–7, Murray, pp. 105–110, pp. 152–160, pp. 173–179, pp. 185-186, pp. 265-266, and Gray pp. 306-308.
31. Burke, p. 114.
32. Burke, p. 92, p. 105, pp. 108–110, p. 116.
33. See NAZ S3240/6, SRC (55) 49th Meeting of the Cabinet, 24/10/55, pp. 5–6.
34. NAZ SRG - 4 'Report of the Southern Rhodesia Government to the Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations for the Year 1949–1950' p. 1.
35. Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the Chief Native Commissioner, 1947*, (Salisbury, Government Printer, 1948), p. 9, Southern Rhodesia, Development Coordinating Commission, *Second Interim Report - Agricultural Production in the Early Future*, (Salisbury, Rhodesian Printing and Publishing Company, 1949), p. 6, p. 2, NAZ S2238/28, SRC (51) 57th Meeting of the Cabinet, 11/12/51, p. 1.
36. NAZ S3238/7, Cabinet Memoranda, 1946-1947. 901/47 Ministry of Agriculture and Lands, Long Term Maize Policy and Drought Relief. Dated 24/2/47.
37. Dunlop, pp. 11–12, Phimister, 'Discourse and the Discipline', pp. 266-269.
38. 'Native Reserves' Part in the Country's Economy', *Harvester*, v. 2, no. 9, 5/10/49, p. 1, 'Real Contribution to Progress', *Harvester*, v. 3, no. 10, 18/10/50, p. 2.
39. *Annual Report of the Chief Native Commissioner, 1947–1954, Annual Report of the Grain Marketing Board, 1951–1954*. These numbers are based on official estimates, which likely underreported African production. Unfortunately there are no figures on African production and sales available between 1939 and 1946.
40. Development Coordinating Commission, *Third Interim Report*, p. 18, Development Coordinating Commission, *Second Interim Report*, p. 8, NAZ S2223/24 SRC (48), 27th Meeting of Cabinet, 26/10/48, NAZ S3240/1, SRC (52), 19th Meeting of the Cabinet, 15/4/52, pp. 7–8. See also the reports of the Chief Native Commissioner for 1945 to 1950. For a discussion of wages and working conditions, see Bhebe, *Burombo*, pp. 9–18, E.G. Howman, *Report*

of the Committee to Investigate the Economic, Social and Health Conditions of Africans Employed in Urban Areas, January 1944.

41. 'Report of the Commissioner of Native Labour for the Year 1947,' in Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the Chief Native Commissioner, 1947*, (Salisbury: Government Printer, 1948), pp. 38–39.
42. Development Coordinating Commission, *Third Interim Report*, p. 18, Development Coordinating Commission, *First Interim Report*, (Salisbury: Rhodesian Printing and Publishing Company for the Government Stationery Office, 1948) p. 28-29, *Report of the CNC, 1947*, pp. 38-39, Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the CNC, 1948*, (Salisbury: Government Printer, 1949), p. 2, NAZ S2223/22, Cabinet Meeting of 8/3/46, NAZ S2223/24 SRC (48) 13th Meeting of the Cabinet, 6/7/48, p. 4, NAZ S2223/25, SRC (49) 44th Meeting of the Cabinet, 30/8/49, p. 2, NAZ S2223/26 SRC (50), 42nd Meeting of the Cabinet, 24/10/50, p. 10, SRC (50) 48th Meeting of the Cabinet, 29/11/50, pp. 8–9.
43. See Bhebe, *Burombo*, pp. 37–72, Terence Ranger, *Are We Not Also Men? The Samkange Family and African Politics in Zimbabwe, 1920 - 1964*, (Portsmouth, Heinemann, 1995), pp. 108–122, and Phimister, *Economic and Social*, pp. 274–82 for detailed discussions of the general strike and worker militancy.
44. See Bhebe, *Burombo*, pp. 85–89, pp. 101-102, Phimister, *Economic and Social*, pp. 262–4.
45. See Bhebe, *Burombo*, pp. 85–89, pp. 101–102.
46. NAZ S2959/1, Report of the Committee Appointed to Investigate the Question of Additional Land for Native Occupation, June 1948, p. 4.
47. John Godfrey Mutambara, 'Africans and Land Policies: British Colonial Policy in Zimbabwe, 1890 – 1965', (PhD Dissertation, University of Cincinnati, 1981), p. 543, pp. 564–, Dunlop, p. 3.
48. Kramer, Phimister, 'Discourse and the Discipline', pp. 271–4.
49. NAZ RG - P/NAT 3, 'Secretary for Native Affairs Memorandum and Plan for the Development and Regeneration of the Colony's Reserves and Native Areas', dated 4/9/43, p. 3, Annexure 4, p. 1, Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the Commission to Enquire into the Preservation* etc. of the Natural Resources of the Colony, (Salisbury, Rhodesian Printing and Publishing Co, 1939), pp. 11–12, p. 19, p. 57, Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the Native Production and Trade Commission*, (Salisbury, 1945), p. 10, p. 29, Roger Howman, 'Industry and Human Erosion', NADA (*Native Affairs Department Annual*), No. 21 (1944), p. 20.
50. *Native Production and Trade Commission*, p. 12, p. 19.
51. See Beinart, 'Soil Erosion', especially p. 53, p. 65, p. 68, William Beinart, 'Introduction: The Politics of Colonial Conservation', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 15 (1989), pp. 143-161, Kate B. Showers, 'Soil Erosion in the Kingdom of Lesotho: Origins and Colonial Response, 1830s - 1950s', *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 15 (1989), pp. 263-286, NAZ RG - P/NAT3, Secretary for Native Affairs 'Memorandum and Plan for the Development and Regeneration of the Colony's Reserves and Native Areas', dated 4/9/43,

pp. 1-3, pp. 9-10, C. Winnington-Ingram, 'Note Following a Visit to Some African Farming Areas in Southern Rhodesia', *Journal of African Administration*, v. 7, no. 2 (1955), p. 68.

52. *Commission ... Natural Resources*, p. 38. The phrase 'islands of white' is taken from Kennedy's work; it serves as a metaphor for Europeans' cultural isolation from Africans, as well as the pattern of Rhodesian land segregation which, in an oversimplified image, reserved the central highlands of the country for Europeans as an island surrounded by the sea of African reserves.
53. Paul Carbery, 'The Land Husbandry Act of 1951: The Dialectic of Exploitation and Improvement of African Reserves', (MA Thesis, University of Zimbabwe, 1987), pp. 29-30, Bulman, p. 11; for the bureaucratic attacks on the law see NAZ S2818/12.
54. NAZ S2808/1/34, 'LHA: Minutes of a Meeting in the Office of the Secretary, Native Economic Development, 8/6/53', p. 1, S3001/3, 'Implementation of the NLHA', dated 21/4/54, pp. 2 -3, NAZ S2818/12, Natural Resources Board to Secretary, Mines, Lands and Survey, 1/5/54, Southern Rhodesia, *What the Native Land Husbandry Act Means to the Rural African and to Southern Rhodesia*, (Salisbury, Government Printer, 1955), pp. 18-22, NAZ S3240/5, SRC (55) 18th Meeting, 18/4/55, p. 7, 21st Meeting of the Cabinet, 6/5/55, pp. 1-5, SRC (55), 22nd Meeting of the Cabinet, 13/5/55, pp. 1–2, NAZ S3240/6 Cabinet Conclusions July-December 1955, SRC (55) 53rd Meeting, 17/11/55, p. 2–3, NAZ S2808/2/7 NLHA Review, 'Report by the Secretary for Native Agriculture'. [1958], Schedules 9 and 10.
55. See Frederick Cooper, *Decolonization and African Society. The Labor Question in French and British Africa*, (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1996), and Alexander, pp. 45-46, NAZ S2818/12, NLHA Circulars, MB 8873/LAN 20/2/51 Undersecretary Native Economic Development to Assistant Secretary Native Economic Development, 2/3/53, NAZ S3240/5 Cabinet Conclusions January to June 1955, SRC (55) 14th Meeting, 31/3/55, p. 1, NAZ S 3240/4 Cabinet Conclusions 1954, SRC (54) 48th Meeting, 31/8/54, p. 8, SRC (54) 57th Meeting, 19/10/54, p. 1.
56. For example, see the newspaper *Nhume*, published for African staff of the government, Reports of the CNC and Director of Native Agriculture, 1955-1961, as well as *What the Land Husbandry Act Means*; the two films made by the Central African Film Unit were *The New Acres* and *Changing the Land*. For international academics' approval, see Kingsley G Garbett, 'The Land Husbandry Act of Southern Rhodesia', in Daniel Bieybuck (ed.) *African Agrarian Systems*, (London: Oxford University Press, 1963) and Montague Yudelman, *Africans on the Land* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1964). I am working from James Scott's definition of high modernism in James C. Scott, Seeing Like a State: *How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998).
57. Pendered and von Memerty, p. 109.
58. *What the NLHA Means*, p. iii.

59. *What the NLHA Means*, p. 13.
60. *What the NLHA Means*, p. 13.
61. The figures were extracted from crop sale figures for Chinamora reserve in 1952 and 1953; see Pendered and von Memerty, p. 109. I suspect the increase in sales and production figures reflected closer state supervision, particularly of sales, and the assumptions of officials who made the estimates for production figures.
62. NAZ FG-P/STA, Federation of Rhodesia and Nyasaland, *Sample Survey of African Agriculture, Southern Rhodesia, 1959/60*, (Central Statistical Office, July 1962), Preface.
63. Kramer, pp. 15-16, NAZ S2818/12, Natural Resources Board to Secretary Mines, Lands and Survey, 1/5/54, p. 4, Minutes of the Meeting of the Assessment Committee in ANC Shabani's Office, 1954, p. 4, S483/2/43 'Memo - NLHA', circa May 1950, p. 2, J.D. Jordan, 'Zimutu Reserve: A Land Use Appreciation', *Rhodes-Livingstone Journal*, No. 35 (1965), pp. 59-77. For a full discussion of these problems, see my dissertation.
64. The World Bank, IBRD, and United States International Cooperation Administration gave the project very low ratings and refused to make loans; the administration funded implementation through overdrafts, loans against the next year's budget and stripping the Native Development Fund's price stabilisation funds. In 1960, the World Bank extended a £2 million loan for African agriculture, including the NLHA. NAZ S 3240/10 Cabinet Conclusions July-December 1958, SRC (58) 44th Meeting, 23/9/55, SRC (58) 46th Meeting, 8/10/58, p. 2, NAZ Records Centre, Box 45595 Ministry of Agriculture, MB 1702/LAN 20/12/B NLHA Finance, Accelerated Implementation 1956-1959, pp. 2-5, Financing the NLHA Programme for 1958, dated 4/1/58, p. 2 NEM 2234/MAR 40/3/4 Under Secretary, Native Economics and Marketing to NLHA Committee, /9/57, pp. 3-5, NLHA Standing Committee, Minutes of Fourth Meeting, p. 3-4, NAZ S2808/2/3 Appointment of Assessment Committees, B 621/3359/176/1 Memo, NLHA: Five Year Implementation Plan, 21/1/56, pp. 1-2, 3359/196/1 Under Secretary Native Economic Development to CNC, 30/6/56.
65. Two years earlier, in April 1957 only 16 percent of the area planned for implementation by 1960 had had individual land rights assigned; stock rights had been distributed in only 18 percent of that area, so the rate of implementation was slowing down. National figures hid substantial variation between areas; the 1959 survey found that stock allocation had been completed in 9 percent of the African areas covered by the plan in Manicaland and only 9 percent of Mashonaland West had had land rights distributed. NAZ S2808/2/7, NLHA Review, Annual Report of the Under Secretary, Department of Native Agriculture and Land Husbandry, 1957, p. 8, Native Land Husbandry Act, dated April 1959, p. 6, Table 8a.
66. When the legislation was introduced, it provided a propaganda triumph for the white authorities. They held Select Committee hearings in which a number

of African political organisations took part. Most gave their grudging approval, mainly as they were convinced by their lawyers that as the NLHA would be introduced regardless of their arguments, it would be better to offer amendments and suggestions than to reject the act outright. See Holderness, pp. 84-94.

67. This oversimplifies a little as there were arguments from missionaries and some officials for a more extensive state role in the reserves, but until the economy changed during the Second World War, only a few token programmes were introduced.
68. See Schmidt, and the detailed discussion of these issues in my doctoral dissertation.
69. The idea of 'partial autonomy' of peasants is derived from Allen Isaacman's work. See Allen Isaacman, *Cotton is the Mother of Poverty: Peasants, Work and Rural Struggle in Colonial Mozambique, 1938-1961*, (Portsmouth, Heinemann, 1996), especially the conceptual discussion on pp. 8-10. For a fuller explanation of its manifestations in Zimbabwe see my doctoral dissertation, as well as Terence Ranger's arguments about self-peasantisation in *Peasant Consciousness*.
70. State cattle ownership figures are extremely inaccurate because of widespread evasion of registration to avoid dipping fees and destocking. This included lending animals and registering them in the user's name, building on older cattle lending practices called *kuronzera* in Shona and *mafisa* in siNdebele. While figures varied from area to area, I believe it can be safely assumed that on average about 1/3 of reserve families had their own animals, and roughly half owned or had use rights of at least one animal. See Kramer, pp. 15-16, NAZ S2818/12, Natural Resources Board to Secretary Mines, Lands and Surveys, 1/5/54, p. 4. For a brief description of disguising stock ownership, see Ngwabi Bhebe's descriptions of the ways his mother 'hid' her animals in the introduction to *Benjamin Burombo*.
71. Interview with Ambuya Musonza, Madziwa Communal Area, 18/4/97.
72. NAZ S2808/2/6, 'Record of a Meeting'. Undated, but likely circa June 1960.
73. NAZ S2817/2, DSD 39/10/2, Working Party D, Paper No. 16 Annexure B, August 1961.
74. Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the Mangwende Reserve Commission of Inquiry*, (Salisbury, Government Printer, 1961), p. 12.
75. For a fuller discussion of different farming methods - indigenous, adopted and innovative - see my dissertation. These arguments are partly derived from Paul Richards' work, especially 'Ecological Change and the Politics of African Land Use', *African Studies Review*, 26 (1983), pp. 1-72. *Dambo* land is also commonly known by the Afrikaans term, *vlei*. The Latin name for *tsenza*, also called *shezha*, is *coleus esculentus*; I have not been able to find an English name for it, or to see it as it is now rarely grown, but it is supposed to be similar to a sweet potato. For a full discussion of *dambo* farming see Richard Owen, Katherine Verbeek, John Jackson and Tammo Steenhuis (eds.) *Dambo Farming in Zimbabwe: Water Management, Cropping and Soil Potentials*

for Smallholder Farming in the Wetlands, (Harare, University of Zimbabwe, 1995).

76. See Ranger, *Peasant Consciousness*.
77. NAD officials complained constantly about Africans' refusal to see the superiority of 'improved' methods, and had estimated crop production and yield figures, rather than measuring them. The first rigorous evaluation of farming outputs found African yields were roughly three times the figure that the NAD had unquestioningly used since at least the 1920s. See *Sample Survey of African Agriculture*.
78. Group interview with the women of the Dambaza family, Madziwa Communal Area, 27/10/97. This was a recurrent complaint about using manure.
79. Interview with Shingaidze Madewe, Madziwa Communal Area, 24/5/98, Kramer, p. 3.
80. Interview with *Mhondoro* Gumboromwe, Madziwa Communal Area, 20/5/98. The *mhondoro* is the ancestral spirit, who agreed to be invoked and interviewed.
81. Interview with Jojo Mandaza, Mai Sophia and Mai Rita, Madziwa Communal Area, 16/10/97.
82. Interview with VaMukeri, Madziwa Communal Area, 17/10/97.
83. Conversation with anonymous man in Madziwa Communal Area, 6/11/97.
84. Interviews with VaKapfunde and VaNyamapfene, 23/10/97, women of the Dambaza family, 27/10/97, Madziwa Communal Area.
85. Interviews with Sinet Makamba, 6/5/98, Charles Mutyakambizi, 28/5/98, Madziwa Communal Area.
86. Interview with VaMutmabi, Madziwa Communal Area, 10/11/97.
87. NAZ LAN 20/7/D14/52, NLHA, 'Chinamora Reserve, 1953', NAZ LAN 20/7/D18/53, Administrative Assistant, NLHA to Assistant Secretary, Native Economic Development, 27/3/54.
88. Interview with Shingaidzo Madewe, Madziwa Communal Area, 24/5/98.
89. Interview with Levison Chanakira, Madziwa Communal Area, 30/5/98.
90. NAZ S2808/1/5, Land Development Officer, Buhera, Report for the Assessment Committee, undated, but likely from 1959.
91. NAZ S2808/2/3, Confidential, NC Nkai to PNC Matabeleland, 6/10/55.
92. Carbery, pp. 48-49, pp. 55-56.
93. Interviews with Joseph Musikiwa, 9/10/97, Levison Chanakira, 30/5/98, Madziwa Communal Area.
94. NAZ S2825/4, clippings of 'Mhondoro Reserve', *African Daily News*, 27/10/59, and 'Near Riot in Mhondoro', *African Daily News*, 21/10/59.
95. Nathan M. Shamuyarira, *Crisis in Rhodesia*, (London: Andre Deutsch, 1965), p. 97.
96. Interviews with Cephas Mushonga, Mutare, 23/5/97, VaCotto, Madizwa Communal Area, 2/11/97, Shamuyarira, p. 95.

97. Ngwabe Bhebe, 'The National Struggle, 1957-1962' in Canaan S. Banana (ed.), *Turmoil and Tenacity: Zimbabwe 1890-1980*, (Harare, The College Press, 1989), p. 97. For a nationalist interpretation of resistance to the NLHA, see Machingaidze.
98. Interviews with Charles Mutyakambizi, 28/5/98, Agrippa Zuda, 8/5/98, Starben Barwa, 5/5/98, Madziwa Communal Area.
99. NAZ S3240/12 Preventative Detention (Temporary Provisions) Act, 1959, Statement of Case, Morris Nyagumbo, p. 1, Preventative Detention (Temporary Provisions) Act, 1959, Statement of Case, John Chikoya, p. 2, Preventative Detention (Temporary Provisions) Act, 1959, Statement of Case, Faiba Dombo, p. 1.
100. NAZ S3240/12 Preventative Detention (Temporary Provisions) Act, 1959, Statement of Case, Gibson Nyandoro, p. 2.
101. NAZ S3240/12 Preventative Detention (Temporary Provisions) Act, 1959, Statement of Case, George Solomon Majoki Chipfatsura, p. 2.
102. Interviews with VaMutmabi, 10 November 1997, Titus Musokwa, 25 May 1998, Nelson Kabvundu, 5 May 1998, VaMrewa and VaMushoniwa, 18 October 1997, Staben Barwa, 5 May 1998, Joseph Musikiwa, 9 October 1997, Madziwa Communal Area.
103. I am using ungovernability as it was promoted by the South African liberation movements in the late 1980s, particularly the African National Congress, South African Communist Party and United Democratic Front, who advocated defying the apartheid government's authority to the point where it lost control. Their efforts concentrated on the townships, rather than the rural areas.
104. NAZ S3240/18, SRC (60), 57th Meeting, 10/10/60, pp. 1-5.
105. NAZ Records Centre Box 84526, DSD 38/1, 'Special NAAB Meeting, 20-22 March 1961', pp. 1-3.
106. NAZ Records Centre Box 98229, 1195/DSD.39/10/2 Working Party D Paper 8, Robinson Commission Report, p.1.
107. NAZ S 2827/2/2/8, volume 2, 'Annual Report of the Native Commissioner, Matobo District, 1961', S2827/2/2/8 volume 3, 'Annual Report of the Native Commissioner, Sipolilo, 1961', p. 19. Bhebe, 'National Struggle', pp. 106-107.
108. Bhebe, 'National Struggle', p. 107.
109. Bowman, pp. 35-44, Hancock, pp. 92-100.
110. NAZ Records Centre Box 84526, DSD 38/1, 'Special NAAB Meeting, 20 to 22 March 1961, Annexure B', p. 3.
111. NAZ S2827/2/2/8, volume 2, 'Annual Report of the Native Commissioner, Matobo District, 1961', S 2827/2/2/8 volume 3, 'Annual Report of the Native Commissioner, Umvuma', p. 11, 'Annual Report of the Native Commissioner, Umtali', p. 28.
112. From the *Mangwende Commission of Inquiry*, cited in Machingaidze, p. 585.
113. NAZ Records Centre, Box 98229, 1131/DSD.39/10/2 Working Party D, First Meeting, 6/7/61, p. 1.

114. *Mangwende Commission of Inquiry*, Southern Rhodesia, *Report of the Commission Appointed to Inquire into and Report on Administrative and Judicial Functions in the Native Affairs and District Courts Departments*, (Salisbury, Government Printer, 1961).
115. NAZ Records Centre, Box 98229, 1131/DSD.39/10/2 Working Party D First Meeting, 6/7/61, NAZ Records Centre Box 84526, 'Prerequisites to African Development' by James Green, NAZ S 2973/8 Community Development Adviser to Chairman, Natural Resources Board, 31/7/62. James Green, the US-provided advisor's, records are in Box 84526. For a fuller discussion of this struggle within the NAD, see Guy Thompson, 'Peasants, Production and the NLHA, 1945 - 1965' in Alois Mlambo and Evelyn Pangetti (eds.), *The Zimbabwe Economy*, (Harare: University of Zimbabwe Press, 2003).
116. NAZ S 3240/21, SRC (61) 55th Meeting of the Cabinet, 3/10/61, pp. 6-11, NAZ S3240/22, SRC (62) 7th Meeting of the Cabinet, 6/2/62, pp. 6-8, Southern Rhodesia, *Financial Statements, 1961-1962*, p. 7, Southern Rhodesia, *Financial Statements, 1962-1963*, p. 7, Southern Rhodesia, *Financial Statements, 1963-1964*, p. 7, pp. 10-11, pp. 52-53. For details on the extent of implementation, see Phimister, 'Rethinking the Reserves', pp. 236-238.
117. Interview with J.D. Jordan, Harare, 21/2/97.
118. Bowman, pp. 41-44, p. 104, Hancock, pp. 97-100. Community Development was also the official policy for Europeans, but operated under a separate administration, in line with the RF's racial definition of communities.
119. Interview with VaChiimbira, Madziwa Communal Area, 17/10/97, Pius S. Nyambara, 'Land Disputes in the "Communal" Areas of Zimbabwe: The Case of Gokwe District in the 1980s and 1990s'. Seminar Paper, Department of Economic History, University of Zimbabwe, October 1997, personal communication from Jens Andersen.
120. See Michael Drinkwater, *The State and Agrarian Change in Zimbabwe's Communal Areas*, (New York, St Martin's Press, 1991), and Martin Whiteside, *Encouraging Sustainable Smallholder Agriculture in Zimbabwe*, (Lypiatt,Glos, UK, Environment and Development Consultancy Ltd/ Agricultural Services Reform in Southern Africa, 1998).
121. Whiteside, pp. 49-51, Movement for Democratic Change, *Restart: Our Path to Social Justice. The MDC's Economic Programme for Reconstruction, Stabilisation, Recovery and Transformation*, (Harare: MDC), p. 43, available at http://www.zwnews.com/RESTARTpdfa.pdf. See also MDC, '5.1.2 In Communal Areas, Recommendations', *Agriculture, Land and Water Policy Statement* (June 2000) available on the MDC website at http:// www.mdczimbabwe.org/policy/policy.htm.


Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 40–57

(ISSN 0850-3907)

Informing Approaches in Establishing Stand Alone Community Literacy Programmes in South Africa

Chris Kanyane*

Abstract

Literacy is usually considered the ability to read at a basic level. Now it is beginning to be defined more broadly to include applying reading, writing, and mathematical skills to obtain and use information and solve problems at levels of proficiency necessary to function in society, to achieve one's goals and develop one's knowledge and potential. 'Family Literacy' is an intergeneration approach to literacy activities. Comprehensive family literacy services provide a holistic, fully integrated, family-focused approach, providing parents and children most in need of improving their literacy skills with intensive, frequent and long-term educational and non-educational services. Through the Technikon Northern Gauteng Research Capacity Building project, I initiated the Soshanguve Family Literacy programme in the surrounding community of Soshanguve. The Soshanguve Family Literacy Programme provides the following activities: Adult Education, Childhood Education or Program Your Child for Success, Parent Education, Interactive Parent/Child Activities (PACT TIME).

Résumé

Ne pas être analphabète signifie savoir lire à un niveau basique. A présent, ce concept commence à être élargi, et inclut les diverses applications à la lecture, à l'écriture et aux mathématiques, permettant d'obtenir, d'utiliser des informations et de résoudre des problèmes, à un niveau de compétence favorisant une certaine évolution au sein de la société, de sorte que chacun puisse réaliser ses objectifs et développer ses propres connaissances, ainsi que son potentiel. Le concept d' «éducation familiale» est une approche intergénérationnelle aux activités d'éducation. Les services intégraux d'éducation familiale offrent une approche holistique, pleinement intégrée et centrée sur la famille, qui fournit aux parents et aux enfants qui ont le plus besoin d'améliorer leur niveau d'éducation, des

---

* Economic and Management Librarian, Technikon Northern Gauteng, South Africa.

services éducationnels et non éducationnels intensifs et fréquents, dans le long-terme. A travers le projet 'Technikon Northern Gauteng Research Capacity Building' – projet de renforcement de capacité – j'ai initié le programme Soshanguve d'éducation familiale, dans la communauté voisine de Soshanguve. Le programme Soshanguve d'éducation familiale propose les activités suivantes : Education pour les adultes, Education des Enfants ou encore 'Program Your Child for Success' (Programmez votre enfant pour la réussite), l'Education Parentale, activités interactives parents/enfant(PACT TIME.

Background

In South Africa, nearly 1.5 million babies are born each year (*The Star* 2002). Each baby enters the world with immense promise. Each arrives with billions of brain cells just waiting to have their power unlocked. Many of these cells have already begun to link up to one another, but a newborn's brain has yet to form the roughly 100 trillion connections that make up an adult's complex neural networks. From the very first days of life, brain cells connect at an astonishing pace. Young brains forge more than enough connections in the first 3 years of life. For these connections to form and proliferate, cells need a crucial ingredient: experience in the world (United States Department of Education 1999).

At this stage, the brain's capacity is nearly unfathomable in terms of its intricacy and power. It defies even the greatest modern computer technology. It is capable of processing up to 30 billion bits of information per second and boasts the equivalent of 6,000 miles of wiring and cabling. Typically the human nervous system contains about 28 billion neurons (nerve cells designed to conduct impulses). Without neurons, our nervous systems will be unable to interpret the information we receive through sense organs, unable to convey it to the brain and unable to carry out instructions from the brain as to what to do. Each of these neurons is a tiny, self-contained computer capable of processing about million bits of information; this is the immense power 3-year old children have at their disposal (Robbins 1992). This incredible computer only awaits programming from parents and guardians.

This is good news for humans. It means that our newborns' capacities, their unique ways of thinking, knowing, and acting, develop in the world, under the sway of the adults who love and nurture them. This is in line with the well-regarded adage that the family is the strongest element in shaping lives.

The family is an essential element in literacy development

National Center for Family Literacy – Kentucky (2001) views the family, as 'the most powerful support network there is where the cycle of learning begins, where the attitudes of parents about learning become the

educational values of the children. The family is an essential element in the economic and social development of a progressive and compassionate society. It is within the bosom of the family that values are handed down from one generation to the next'. Children who grow up in a family where reading and books are valued develop an attachment to books and learning. Conversely, children who grow up in a family where parents are illiterate or have low literacy skills do not go very far in their educational endeavors. Parents are their children's first and most important teachers. They are uniquely qualified to pass on the richness of literacy to their children.

The importance of family literacy programmes

What if the parents have low literacy levels such that they are unable to transfer literacy values to their children? Does this mean that their children are doomed for failure in life just because they have illiterate parents who poison them with illiteracy? This is the clarion call of setting up community family literacy programmes in identified needy communities. The potentials of such programmes are that educational values are instilled in parents who eventually transfer them to their children. In this way, the cycle where parents automatically pass on their illiteracy to their children is halted. Once parents are empowered to be able to impart educational values to their children in their early age our society is also empowered (NCFL 2000).

Family literacy programmes can play an important role in reconstructing and developing townships like Soshanguve LVV, which were marginalised by the apartheid government. The Soshanguve LVV, like most black townships, has a high concentration of people who are functionally illiterate. Family literacy programmes hold immense potential to the global developmental initiatives of balancing the scales of the rich nations and the poor nations.

Problem statement

According to Project Literacy Annual report (2000), 40 percent of South African adults are functionally illiterate, and these include Soshanguve LVV residents. This results in parents not providing good support in their children in early literacy development. Consequently, these parents pass on their low literacy to their children, creating an ongoing cycle of illiteracy, poverty and under-achievement with a devastating impact on the economic development of the country.

Objectives of the study

The objectives of this study were to:

- Identify the literacy level of parents in the community of Soshanguve LVV;
- Identify the level in which parents support the literacy development of their children at home in the community of Soshanguve LVV;
- Identify the a suitable intervention programme which could be used to promote literacy in the community of Soshanguve LVV;
- Pilot the intervention programme in Soshanguve LVV families.

Significance of the study

After the implementation of the family literacy programme, it is hoped that parents in Soshanguve LVV will:

- Learn to become more self-sufficient and independent;
- Be able to share challenges and to support one another;
- Have the chance to reach their educational goals and gain valuable skills needed for better job opportunities;
- Learn to blend work and educational activities;
- Nurture their children become better prepared to be successful students as they continue their education;
- Become active participants in their children's education and are better prepared to take the role as their children's first teachers;
- Grow together through learning and shared experiences.

Literature review

In seeking to solve the problem, it would be futile should we simply accept the idea that adult basic education programmes can solve this problem. In almost all developing countries, Adult Basic Education programmes have been running for more than fifty years but this vicious cycle has been continuing at a breath-taking tempo. Tanzania and Nicaragua had world-renowned adult literacy campaigns, yet their current adult illiteracy rates are Tanzania 32. 2 percent and Nicaragua 34. 5 percent, respectively. Cuba is generally recognised as having the most successful Adult Literacy Programme with 4. 3 percent illiterate adults, but there were fewer than one million illiterate adults at the time when the Adult Basic Education started (Project Literacy annual report 2000).

Through a large-scale literature search in the quest to answer these questions, one comes across the concept of family literacy programmes. Sharon Darling (1996), the President of the United States Center for

National Family Literacy, regards family literacy programmes as powerful interventions, which holds great promise for the future in breaking the intergenerational cycle of under-education, poverty and dependency. Brizius and Foster (1993) remark that family literacy programmes improve the educational opportunities for children and parents by providing both learning experiences and group support. They argue that family literacy programmes provide disadvantaged children with educational opportunities that can enable them to lift themselves out of poverty and dependency. According to Gordon (2000), family literacy programmes are effective in that instead of repairing ruined, brokenhearted children who come from illiterate families, they prepare children for a good start in their schooling and empower parents with educational values and skills, which they transfer to their newborn children.

What exactly are family literacy programmes? Family literacy programs are services of sufficient intensity and duration to make sustainable changes in a family and that integrate the following activities:

- Interactive literacy activities between parents and their children;
- Training for parents regarding how to be the primary teacher for their children and full partners in the education of their children;
- Parent literacy training that leads to economic self sufficiency; and
- Age-appropriate education to prepare children for success in school and life experiences.

The International Reading Foundation (2001) regards family literacy programmes as those services encompassing the ways parents, children, and extended family members use literacy at home and in the community.

A family literacy programme is one which:

- Is conceptualised around the needs and concerns of the family; in contrast to adult basic education programmes, which serves individual family members in isolation.
- Contains an educational component, which affects the child's literacy or development.
- Contains an educational component for the adult-providing both literacy activities and a parenting education component for the adult to attain proficiency in basic skills;
- Includes at least one activity focussing on the exchange of knowledge and information between the adult and the child;
- Is developed based on the community needs and family recommendations (Minnis 2001:2).

Activities include side-by-side reading, modeling of child development practices, reading aloud, storytelling etc.

Description of family literacy models

The most commonly used frame of reference for classifying family and intergenerational literacy programs, is Ruth Nickse's typology of four basic models. Nickse classifies family literacy programmes according to the type of participant (adult and/or child) and the degree of intervention (direct or indirect). The degree of intervention refers to 'whether or not the adult and the child are present together for literacy development any or all of the time' (Nickse 1990: 29). 'Primary' participants receive direct services, 'secondary' participants benefit indirectly.

Briefly these four models are:

Type 1: Direct Adults – Direct Children

This model involves programming for both parents and pre-school child. Parents attend literacy instruction and may participate in parenting education, vocational training or volunteer in the program or children's classroom. 'Parent and child together' activities are also a key feature, and may include instruction on how to interact and play with children, as well as how to read to them. Programmes use a dual curriculum and direct instruction that is class-based. Children take part in a structured early childhood or preschool programme.

Type 2: Indirect Adults – Indirect Children

Adults (who may or may not be the parents) and children attend together. The goal is the promotion of literacy for enjoyment. There is no sequential curriculum, rather a series of reading enrichment events, such as storytelling, book talks, and library activities. Reading pal programmes involving adult volunteers are another example of this type of programme.

Type 3: Direct Adults – Indirect Children

Adults are the main targets for this type of programme, while children do not participate regularly, if at all. Programmes may include literacy or English language instruction, or instruction in reading children's stories or other behaviours that assist children. The goal is to help adults become more literate so they may positively influence their children's literacy development.

Type 4: Indirect Adults – Direct Children

Pre-school and school-going children are the primary recipients of the service in this type of programme. Parents may be invited to participate, but usually do not receive literacy instruction for their own needs.

Family literacy programmes can be set up in any community with relative ease and with little or no costs. The key factor in setting up a family literacy programme in any community is to undertake community research in order to get to know the people in the community. To familiarise ourselves with a typical family literacy programme in practice let us look at five successful family literacy programmes in Canada: Parent-Child Mother Goose, Books for Babies, Book Bridges, and Homespun.

Parent – Child Mother Goose

In this family literacy programme, parents and their children are invited to attend weekly sessions for about one and half-hours each week. This is a group experience for parents and their babies and young children, focusing on the pleasure and power of songs and stories together. The Programme is preventative in nature. The parents are helped to gain skills and confidence, which can enable them to create new and positive family patterns during their children's crucial early years.

The activities of the programme are centered on oral literature. Parents and children sit in a circle on the floor with two group leaders and listen to stories. Teaching is directed to parents with children participating, napping or wandering as is appropriate to their age. The atmosphere is relaxed and accepting, with time for informal visits and snacks.

The teachers encourage the parents to:

- Use language with their children from infancy on;
- Touch their children appropriately: firmly but gently;
- Really look at their children: making eye contact and observing the child accurately;
- Notice what the other children are doing.

Each session ends with a story told to the parents – giving them the same sort of pleasure in language and listening that they can give to their children. The stories told, usually folk tales, often prompt discussion of important issues.

Books for babies

The primary objective of the Books for Babies family literacy programme is to contribute to family well-being by enhancing literacy development of children beginning at birth and continuing through pre-school years, so that each child has a greater opportunity to become a self-directed, lifelong independent learner. Volunteer librarians present children's books to parents of newborns at the Cardston Municipal Hospital. The volunteers explain both the project and the importance of reading to children from birth (Canadian Literacy Database 2000).

Book bridges

Book Bridges is a family literacy programme that uses children's literature selections to engage learners and explore reading of family stories, fables and folk tales. The programme also includes writing workshops where parents create their own biographies and develop their own family stories. The children of participants are indirectly involved sharing these biographies and family stories which their mothers bring home each week. The programme also seeks to enhance the relationship between the participants and their children and to encourage reading as a lifelong activity. Effort is made to make explicit connections between the writing and reading strategies participants are learned in the workshops and how they may support their children at home. The volunteers, many of whom are parents themselves, also find the strategies beneficial.

Children's literature selections constitute the reading material. Good stories have the power to draw the reader back again and again. Within this context, half-formed ideas are explored and resolved through listening and responding to the interpretations of others. Reading also provides the motivation for writing. In identifying with the stories of published authors, we are reminded of similar happenings in our own lives and we, too, are inspired to write. The programme also embeds reading, listening and speaking by employing a process approach to writing. Writing provides opportunities for both listening and oral expression, as successive drafts are read, ideas shared and feedback sought through conferencing. (Canadian National Literacy Database 2000).

Homespun

The best known of family literacy programmes in Alberta is the Homespun Family Literacy Project developed at Brooks Campus of Medicine Hat College. Homespun officially began in January 1991 with the mandate of reaching at-risk families and providing parents with instruction on how to read with their children and how to encourage a supportive literacy environment in the home.

Homespun began with a model developed in Raleigh, North Carolina called 'Motheread'. In the Motheread, programme mothers met once or twice weekly to share children's literature centred on a particular child development theme. The Homespun instructor/coordinator received the curriculum and training from the Motheread headquarters.

Modifications to the Motheread model to more truly reflect our population and to include Canadian content led to the evolution of the new model: Homespun. Three primary components make up Homespun's

curriculum: (i)) a focus on children's literature as well as extended discussion about the book and activities related to the story, (ii) opportunities for parents to explore ideas on encouraging an environment in the home that is conducive to literacy development through readings, discussion, videos, and instruction, and (iii) exploration and development of the parent's own literacy abilities, beliefs, and attitudes through personal journals, writing for children and discussing adult readings.

Homespun sessions run for 15 weeks, with evening or daytime workshops offered for 2 hours each week. There is an average of 10 parents in each workshop. In addition to regular classes, Homespun has a volunteer in-home programme for parents who can't come to class (Canadian Literacy Database 2000).

Parents as Tutors (PAT)

Parents as Tutors (PAT) is a partnership project between the Rainbow Literacy Society and the schools in the County of Vulcan #2. The objective of the project is to provide training and support to parents who are interested in helping their child become a better reader through a process known as Paired Reading.

PAT is available to families who have elementary school children in the County of Vulcan. A trained person from the community goes into the family's home five times a week for eight weeks. These sessions are fifteen minutes long, and are used to demonstrate Paired Reading. The trained community person is a non-teacher who acts as a liaison between the school and the family. This person's primary role is not to tutor the child, but to provide training and positive support to the parents as they develop skills as their child's tutor. In order to join the programme, parents must agree to participate in each of the Paired Reading Sessions, and to take over from the tutor before the end of the sixth week.

As you can see from the overview description of these five widely family literacy programmes there are no prescribed formulae in developing a family literacy programme. The character and curriculum are predominantly dictated by the needs of each community.
(Canadian Literacy Database 2000).

Definition of concepts

In this study, by the term 'family' we mean any group of two or more people that considers itself a family: parents, children, siblings, foster parents, grandparents, aunts, uncles, cousins, friends, and any others who consider themselves a family. The emotional tie is noted as a key ingredient

in the overall definition of a family, so the exact technical nature of the relationships among the various people is irrelevant, just as long as they consider themselves 'family' (Porritt 1995)

'Family literacy' refers to the ways families develop and use literacy skills to accomplish day-to-day tasks and activities. Examples of family literacy include writing a note to a child's teacher, sharing a bedtime story, making shopping lists, and using a recipe as well, adult reading and writing for different purposes at home, and literacy-related adult discussions typify family literacy, where adults may be literacy role models in the home.

'Family literacy programmes' refer to a broad spectrum of initiatives, which recognise the influence of the family on the literacy development of family members and try to support families in literacy activity and in accessing literacy resources.

Methodology

Research design

For the collection of data in the Soshanguve LVV, community survey research was used. For piloting of the family literacy programme, action research was used.

Population of the study and sampling

From the 488 Soshanguve LVV families we selected 70 families which had children between the ages of zero to six. In selecting these 70 families random sampling method was used (Research assistants would go into a house and ask whether there have children aging from zero to six years).

Data collection and analysis

Data from the Soshanguve LVV community were collected with a self-administered open-closed questionnaire. The collected data were analysed using scientific analysis methods.

Ethical considerations

The research was undertaken with dignity and respect. Questions were be asked by trained research assistants. The purpose of the research was explained to the respondents before the questions were posed. The data collected were kept confidential and not used for any other purpose except for this study.

Ensuring reliability and validity

Clear instructions were given on how the questionnaire should be completed. A pilot study was undertaken to make sure the data collected consisted of the desired information.

Data presentation, analysis and interpretation

Literacy/educational level of parents in Soshanguve LVV

In order to develop an effective family literacy programme for a specific community it is crucial to know more about the literacy/educational level of parents in that community. Consequently the first objective of the study was to get to know the educational level of the Soshanguve LVV community. In our endeavours in getting to know more about the literacy/educational level of the community of Soshanguve LVV; 70 parents were asked the following questions:

- What is the highest standard you reached?
- Do you read newspapers/magazines?
- If you read magazines/newspapers how often do you do so?
- Do you use the community library?

The first question was designed to gauge the literacy/education level of the parents. Questions 2, 3, 4 were designed to see if the parent was using her/his literacy (assuming she/he was literate).

Highest standard reached

Fifty-six parents interviewed reached secondary level and beyond; i.e. out of 70 parents interviewed, 50 had reached the secondary level and six had reached tertiary level. Only a small number of parents had never reached the secondary level; i.e. eight had primary schooling while six had never gone to school.

Magazines and newspapers

The ultimate aim of any literacy campaign is to enable people to function in society. The best ways of gauging the benefits of literacy skills is investigating people interested in reading magazines and newspapers. Newspapers and magazines provide their readers with current and informative news through its news, comments, sports business reports and leader pages designed to promote national culture.

In these set of questions, we wanted to know more about those parents who have basic literacy. The quest here was to see whether the parents were developing themselves through reading. Knowing how parents use their literacy skills would provide us with guidance when identifying a suitable literacy programme.

Of the 70 parents interviewed, 50 parents read newspapers and magazines while 20 parents did not. Nine parents read newspapers and magazines once a week, 18 parents read them 2-3 times a week, while 21 read newspapers and magazines 'as they are available'. The 22 parents

classed under 'not responded' include those who said they did not read magazines and newspapers in the previous questions.

One of the most important things that parents can teach their children is the love of reading and writing. The fact that parents can read newspapers and magazine is a good thing. The important thing is to enable parents share their reading experiences with their children so they can discover the joys and benefits of reading: new worlds, new ideas, fun and entertainment. In this way parents are able to transfer educational values to their children. By sharing what they read with their children parents are able to understand their children's world.

Number of parents using community libraries

One of the principal roles of a community library is to promote community literacy and the impartation of educational values to the community. Thus the community library if utilised to its ideal mission can be a key institution in the community's development.

A large number of the parents did not use the community library. Out of 70 parents only nine used the Library, while three did not respond to the question, and a total of 58 did not make use of the community library.

The high number of parents not using the library should not be attributed to parents' lack of interest in it, but rather be attributed to the fact that the community library is not making the community aware of its existence and service. There are no signposts or boards on the major corners and centres of the community as to where the library is situated. In addition, most of parents when asked about the use of the library said they are not aware that a library existed in the community.

Putting the findings together, we have a better idea of the literacy level of the parents. We can deduce from the findings that most parents are literate. The outstanding feature that comes out from these findings is that a high number of parents who reached secondary level correlate with the number of the parents reading newspapers and magazines.

Identify the level in which parents support the literacy development of their children at home

The second set of questionnaires was aimed at getting to know how parents interact with their children at home. The questions posed were:

- Do you watch TV/Radio with your children?
- What types of programmes do you watch with your children?
- Is your child asking questions when watching or listening to the programme?

We have already seen that the first few years of life, a child is very open to the environment. Like a sense organ, the little one is completely susceptible, open to any stimulation. This is the time for further development and maturation of the senses. Unlike adults, children are not able to filter out incoming stimulation. Any sense impressions experienced will be built into their sensitive organisms. Parents are their children's first teachers. The rationale in seeking answers to these questions is to see the manner in which parents influence their children's literacy development through TV/radio; whether for the positive development of their children's literacy development or to the detriment of their children's literacy. It is vital for us to have knowledge of this aspect if we are to provide a suitable intervention programme.

The results of the questionnaire were as follows: Of the 70 parents interviewed, 63 said they watch TV and/or radio while seven responded that they did not watch or listen to radio with their children. On the question on the types of programme they watched or listened to, 25 said they watched and listened to the TV and children educational programmes. The high number of parents watching TV with their children is a cause for concern noting the effects that television can have on the development of children. The negative effects of TV on children are varied and can be presented as follows:

- *Effects on sensory development*: By its very nature, TV is an impoverished sensory environment. In a recent study comparing TV viewing with laboratory simulated sensory deprivation, researchers found that 96 hours of laboratory induced sensory deprivation produced the same effects on the person as only a few minutes of TV viewing. Normal sensory experience is vital to maintaining a balanced state of mind and body. Therefore, children who are actively playing will have more opportunity to develop their senses than children passively viewing will.
- *Sight and Hearing:* While viewing, the eyes are practically motionless and 'defocused' in order to take in the whole screen. Excessive TV viewing, one of the most passive visual activities, can seriously impair a child's observational skills. Viewing affects not only eye mechanics, but also the ability to focus and pay attention. Since TV is more visual than auditory, children's sense of hearing is not being fully exercised. Active listening is a skill that needs to be developed. Children need practice in processing auditory stimulation, making their own mental pictures in response to what they hear. In addition, when a TV is constantly on, the sense of hearing may be dulled by the persistent background noise.

Effects on Creativity and Imagination: Boredom is the empty space necessary for creativity. With TV filling a child's leisure moments, the necessary void is never experienced. Furthermore, when children are bombarded with TV images, their own ability to form imaginative pictures becomes severely impaired. This process of generating internal pictures is critical to the development of dendrites and neural connectors, which lay the foundation for intelligence and creativity (Long and Buglion 1999).

Family Literacy Programme: Identification and implementation

Workshop with parents

A workshop with the parents of Soshanguve LVV community was conducted to explain to them the concept and benefits of family literacy programmes. Parents were also introduced to different kinds of family literacy programmes offered overseas. The aim of the workshop was to familiarise the parents with the objectives of the research and assist in the identification of a suitable family literacy programme.

The workshop, together with the results obtained from the survey, provided us with a better understanding of family literacy in the Soshanguve LVV community. The findings revealed that the majority of parents in Soshanguve LVV can read and write well enough to function effectively in society; and well enough to interact educationally with their children to impart lasting educational values. We saw that the majority of parents interviewed had attended school up to the secondary level, which indicated that they could read and understand. Another factor in the results was that parents read magazines and newspapers. With this knowledge, we could see that whatever programme we might suggest for the development of family literacy in the community should take note that parents can read and write. This served us a premise to decide on the type of a suitable family literacy programme.

Identifying literacy programme

In the light of the findings of survey, we conceptualised a community family literacy programme called the Soshanguve Family Literacy Services. Soshanguve Family Literacy Services is a community based family literacy service that delivers comprehensive family literacy services to the Soshanguve LVV community. It recognises that the education of children and parents is interdependent. Therefore, it provides for the needs and goals of the adult leaders of the family, helping them to acquire new educational, social, and entrepreneurial skills. Adults are able to enhance their own literacy skills while promoting literacy with their children. The

family literacy programme has been designed for those most in need of these service in the community. Therefore, most participants cae from the following populations: (i) teen parents, (ii) single mothers, (iii) undereducated parents, (iv) and (v) fathers.

Structure of the Soshanguve family literacy project
In each programme session, the following literacy categories are covered:

(i) Financial literacy: In this workshop, the subjects of credit control, budgeting and frugal living are dealt with. Frugal tips and ideas to get more for your dollar, save money, and have more for less. Being frugal is not just about saving money, it is a way of life.

(ii) Childhood Education: In this workshop, parents are engaged in their children's educational programmes in order foster involvement that will be maintained throughout the child's educational career.

(iii) Parent Education: This is an interactive workshop forms the core of the entire programme. It consists of a lively interaction and discussion with instructions on how children grow, develop, and learn. It addresses issues critical to family well-being, connects parents with community resources, and provides opportunities for parents to network and develop mutual support systems.

Complementing the residential program is the monthly *Parenting Bulletin* for parents of the Soshanguve LLV community. The reason for the creation of this kind of Bulletin is that since our research found that parents read magazines and newspapers, then it would be logical to assume that they could read a parenting journal, which guides them further in raising their children.

Copies of *Parenting Bulletin* are hand-delivered free to families in Soshanguve LVV community to study in their own time, in the comfort of their homes. Parents can put the advice contained in *Parenting Bulletin* to immediate use and help develop their children for success in life. This is the kind of advice offered. Every month *Parenting Bulletin* offers its subscribers a number of practical plans on three main topics:

(i) Parenting Education: Parents learn about their child's developmental stages and strategies to support their children's education at home and in the school;

(ii) Childhood Education: Scientific early learning activities are presented;

(iii) Parent and Child Time Together: Information on how parents can best utilise the time they have with their children. This is a crucial time where the parent can consciously transfer educational habits

in the home. This is the time when a learning partnership between parents and their children is strengthened.

Feedback and recommendation

The *Bulletin* has been well received in the Soshanguve LVV community. On our third issue in May 2002, parents were asked how they valued Parenting Bulletin. All parents said that the bulletin was educationally helpful. Since the comments we received were numerous we have selected few of them for presentation:

Through the Parenting Bulletin I have learned that helping my children understand that there are consequences for every action whether it be a positive or negative consequence helps us in our home.

> Interesting and at a time when I really need it. My husband and I are having trouble with our six year old and through the Parenting Bulletin we are trying to solve it.
>
> ...You are a very good person to help others and render your services and advice. We are really appreciate your self sacrifice for providing us with this information. I hope that it shall be continued forever. It's my prayer that the Lord will bless you and reward you abundantly.
>
> We have enjoyed your Parenting Bulletin. I am always waiting the end of the month to get new issue, it makes a lot of sense.
>
> I enjoyed reading the May issue...I liked it... I think you really hit us where it hurts. Let's all tear ourselves away from watching TV and interact with our kids!
>
> *Parenting Bulletin* help lies in the ability to teach the general public that the impossible is possible... I am presently using the skills I learned for myself and my children.

Some parents from other areas of Soshanguve have read the Bulletin and feel strongly that the journal should cover the whole Soshanguve. They find it unfair that only Soshanguve LVV is benefiting and not the whole of Soshanguve. It is recommended that the local government should consider supporting the *Bulletin* so that it can cover the whole Soshanguve.

Conclusion

Community family literacy initiatives work for many reasons. Parents become active participants in their children's education and are better prepared to take the role as their children's first teachers. Parents are able to share challenges and to support one another. Parents have the chance to reach their educational goals and gain valuable skills needed for job opportunities. Parents learn to blend work and educational activities. Children, growing under educationally empowered parents become better prepared to be successful students as they continue their education. Families grow together

through learning and shared experiences. The programme builds upon family strengths and strengthens the mother-child bond.

A truly integrated approach to literacy cannot just teach adults to read. It must be equally devoted to raising children who are enthusiastic, regular readers. Family literacy programmes are about community empowerment, support and hope. Once parents realise their role as children's important teachers, and are made to realise the importance and value of education, the impact on the children is enormous (Minnis 2001).

We have gone a long way in our quest in finding the suitable family literacy programme for the literacy development of the Soshanguve community. We have seen that a family literacy programme, if designed appropriately, helps illiterate parents create an educational environment at home, an environment necessary for the development of better citizens. We looked into different types of family literacy programmes, which gave us a better understanding of how they are created and structured. We also saw that, though there are no rigid rules in the creation of such programmes they have three aspects in common: parent education, child education, and parent-child together. In designing the family literacy programme in Soshanguve LVV we were restricted to the educational standards of parents and their conditions so the programme we designed was ultimately well received by the community.

References

Brizius, J. A., and Foster, S. A., 1993, *Generation to generation: Realizing the Promise of Family Literacy*, Ypsilanti, MI: High/Scope Press, ERIC (Document Reproduction Service) No. ED 357 869.

Canadian National Literacy Database, 1997, *Nationwide Family Literacy Programs.*

Darling, S., 1996, Testimony Before the Committee on Appropriations Subcommittee on Labor, Health and Human Services Education and Related Agencies, United Sates House of Representatives.

Gordon, Mary, 2000, 'Keynote Address : A Thousand Cups of Tea' Proceedings from the conference on Building an Alliance for Family Literacy Gathering Voices.

International Reading Association, 1998, *The concept of family literacy*, Newark: IRA.

Long, P.J. and Buglion, G., 1999, *How and why to discover the joys of family life without television*, The Green Mountain Waldorf School.

National Adult Literacy Database, Canada, 26–28 Oct. 2000.

Minnis, P.A., 2001, 'Family Literacy: The Perfect Fit', Paper presented to the International Conference on The Role of Adult Education in Sustainable Development.

Morrow, Paratore & Tracey, 1994, *Family Literacy: New Perspectives, New Opportunities,* Newark: International Reading Association.

National Center for Family Literacy, 2001, Annual Report 2001, *The Power of Family Literacy.*

Nickse, R., 1990, 'Family and intergenerational literacy programs: An update of "The noises of literacy"', ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 327 726.

Porritt, K., 1995, *Family volunteering, the ties that bind,* (http://www.nald.ca/fulltext/heritage/ComPartnE/Family.htm).

Robbins, A. 1992, *Awaken the giant within,* New York: Simon & Schuster.

South African Rail Commuter Corporation (SARCC), 2000, Johannesburg. Transnet.

The Star Newspaper, 2002, 'Dreadful low increase in births', *The Star,* Johannesburg: 31 July, p. 2.

Takala, Sauli, 1994, 'Action Research in the Classroom', in *Content Instruction Through a Foreign Language,* Report on the 1992-93 TCE Programme, ED 383 197.

Taylor, D. and Dorsey-Gaines, C, 1988, *Growing up literate: Learning from inner-city families,* Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.

United States Department of Education, 1999, 'How Are the Children?', Report on Early Childhood Development and Learning.

United States National Literacy Act of 1991, H.R. 75.

CODESRIA *Africa Development*, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 58–69

(ISSN 0850-3907)

The Determination and Analysis of Constraints in Resource Use Efficiency in Multiple Cropping Systems by Small-Holder Farmers in Ebonyi State, Nigeria

Michael U. Awoke* and Chukwuemeka Okorji**

Abstract

The constraints militating against the smallholder farmers in multiple-cropping system in Ebonyi State, Nigeria were analysed. A multi-stage sampling technique was adopted to sample and administer questionnaires to 240 smallholder multiple-croppers. Data were collected and analysed using descriptive statistics. High lease charges (45 percent), problems of land fragmentation (35 percent), the low fertility of the land (78 percent), the distance of cultivable land (52 percent) and sex discrimination (100 percent) were constraints militating against the efficiency of land use. The constraints against efficient labour use were the high cost of labour, emigration, sex discrimination, and other competing labour uses, which constituted 23 percent, 22 percent, 19 percent and 14 percent respectively. Responses regarding constraints against capital use referred to the non-availability of improved varieties of yam and cocoyam (29 percent), the high cost of modern inputs (36 percent), the lack of adequate finance (33 percent), and the lack of collaterals (22 percent). The study confirmed that multiple-cropping system would have been more efficient if these constraints were reduced or eradicated. Effective extension services as well as efficient policy formulation and implementation by government are therefore recommended.

Résumé

Cette contribution analyse les contraintes auxquelles sont confrontés les petits exploitants agricoles engagés dans le système de la multi-culture dans l'état d'Ebonyi, au Nigeria. Une technique d'échantillonnage à plusieurs niveaux a été employée pour tester et soumettre à un questionnaire 540 petits exploitants

* Department of Agricultural Economics and Management, Ebonyi State University, Abakaliki, Nigeria.

** Department of Agricultural Economics, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, Nigeria.

agricoles spécialisés dans la multi-culture. Les données ont ensuite été collectées et analysées à l'aide de statistiques descriptives. Les redevances de location (45 pour cent), les problèmes liés au morcellement de la terre en parcelles (35 pour cent), la faible fertilité de la terre (78 pour cent), la distance des terres cultivables (52 pour cent), ainsi que la discrimination sexuelle (100 pour cent) ont été les éléments avancés, constituant un frein à la bonne utilisation de la terre. Les éléments constituant un frein à une utilisation efficiente des ressources humaines disponibles sont le coût élevé de la main-d'œuvre, l'émigration, les discriminations sexuelles, ainsi que les autres formes d'utilisation des ressources humaines ; ceux-ci constituaient respectivement 23 pour cent, 22 pour cent, 19 pour cent et 14 pour cent. Les réponses relatives aux contraintes pesant sur une bonne utilisation du capital portaient sur l'absence de variétés améliorées d'ignames et de tarots (29 pour cent), le coût élevé des frais modernes de production (36 pour cent), le manque de financement adéquat (33 pour cent) et de collatéraux (22 pour cent). L'étude a confirmé que la multi-culture aurait été plus efficace, si ces contraintes étaient réduites ou supprimées. Des services de vulgarisation, ainsi que la formulation et la mise en place par le gouvernement d'une politique efficace ont été recommandés.

Introduction

Agricultural systems in Ebonyi State, whether mono, mixed or multiple cropping system have been traditional in nature and mainly concentrated in the hands of peasants or smallholder farmers. These smallholders are farmers whose production capacity falls between 2.5 and 5 hectares per season. They constitute the majority of the farming population and cultivate mostly the backyard land. Agbilibeazu (1984) described them as those farmers who produce on small-scale, not involved in commercial agriculture but produce on subsistence level, and cultivate less than five hectares of land annually on the average. Moreover, they constitute about 80 percent of the farming population in Nigeria (Madu 1995). As a result of the low-income status of these farmers, they are seldom able to accumulate capital goods. This makes their level of capacity utilisation in terms of credit facilities very low (Awoke and Obeta 1998).

Generally, smallholder farmers in Ebonyi State are mostly multiple-croppers who constitute about 85 percent of the farming population. Multiple cropping system can be defined as the practice of growing several crops in one field during a production year. Akinsanmi (1978) defined it as the cultivation of more than one type of crop on a piece of land at the same time. Multiple cropping is also the simultaneous growing of two or more crop species in an irregular manner, without a well-defined planting pattern (Andrew and Kassan 1976; Francis 1986; Forbes 1992). The importance of this cropping system to the smallholder farmers in Ebonyi State cannot be over emphasised.

The problems and prospects of smallholder farmers in resource use relative to multiple-cropping system are enormous. For instance, Olayide (1980) observed that the kinds and qualities of resources used in primary production activities in tropical countries are characterised by old techniques and crudity or simplicity of forms, which tend to give rise to low output. In general, resource use or allocation efficiency in the developing countries such as Nigeria may be said to be faced with the problem of under-utilisation of capacity, which is associated with low returns. For example, Mac Arthur (1983) and Onwuekwe (1994) have observed that there is low labour utilisation and productivity in traditional agriculture.

In addition, it is observed that out of a total land area of 92.457 million hectares in Nigeria, about 75.3 percent (69.62 million hectares) can be brought under cultivation. These vast areas of arable land are believed to be capable of growing almost all types of tropical and sub-tropical crops, but problems of supply and demand militate against the efficient use of the land resources. Anthony, Ezedinma and Ochapa (1995) pointed out that land fragmentation is a constraint in the optimal utilisation of land in tropical agriculture. Alimba and Ezinwa (2001) also noted that resource allocation under the existing traditional system of farming in eastern Nigeria is inefficient.

In addition, according to Ogunfowara and Olayide (1981), resources are not efficiently utilised or allocated under the small scale farming which is mainly traditional in style. This is largely attributable to the fact that most of the farmers are of low educational status. Thus, irrespective of the vast quantities of factor productivity existing in the African continent, the peasant farmers largely under-develop them due to lack of requisite skills. Consequently, the problem of resource allocation and utilisation has assumed critical dimensions in traditional agriculture among the small holder farmers.

In relation to the process of resource utilisation for food and fibre production, under conditions of rapid economic development, rural communities are faced with problematic decisions regarding what, how and when to produce and utilise the scarce resources. Specifically, there is the problem of deciding on how much of the available factor productivity or resources should be devoted for future growth as well as how much to satisfy current consumption needs (Johnson 1982).

Again, the problems of resource availability, resource allocation, scarcity of resources in relation to human wants, with the difficulty of tapping the resources or controlling them in the production process including the accessibility of the resources are great obstacles to efficient resource

utilisation. In addition, the problem of economic efficiency in the utilisation of resources has been the greatest concern of production economists. Efficient utilisation of productive resources may be affected by factors such as government policies, customs and institutions or cultural configuration, cost structures, resource management, ownership patterns and policies, resource administration and services (Upton 1976; Nweke 1979). Generally, it is expected that farmers in Nigeria need to exploit fully the opportunities for capital formation, improved resource base, higher productivity, innovation and improved management techniques. (Nweke and Winch 1979). Also, Collinson (1972) opined that developing supportive policies and policy instruments should take into account, the ecological, social demographic and economic issues for effective sustainable natural resource utilisation.

It is the aim of this study to examine the problems and prospects of resource use in multiple cropping system by smallholder farmers in Ebonyi State. Ultimately, it is hoped that the study will help to bridge the gap between resource availability and efficient utilisation in the multiple cropping system in Ebonyi State.

Materials and methods

Study area

The study area is the whole of Ebonyi State, with thirteen Local Government Areas. These include: Abakaliki, Ebonyi, Izzi, Ishielu, Ohaukwu, Ikwo, Ezza South, Ezza North, Afikpo South, Afikpo North, Ohaozara, Onicha and Ivo. Ebonyi State belongs to the Igbo ethnic group with a total population of about 1.7 million inhabitants (National Census Figures, 1991). It is bounded on the North by Benue State and in the South by Abia State. On the East, it shares a common boundary with Cross-River State and on the West with Enugu State. The area is drained by the tributaries of Ebonyi River and has a land area of approximately 5,935 square kilometers lying between latitude 7030' and longitude 5040' E and 6045' E (ABCCIMA 1997).

Climatically, Ebonyi State is semi-savannah with seasonal variations of hot, mild cold weather and mixed grid vegetation with all eastern prototypes including agrarian, forestry and swamp ideal for rice cultivation. It has a mean temperature of 300C during the hottest period (February–April) and mean temperature of 210C during the coldest period (December– January). The mean annual rainfall is between 1,500mm and 1,800mm. Naturally, the climate is a tropical hot humid type characterised by high rainfall, high temperature and sunshine with two marked seasons: the rainy and dry

season. However, the rainy season occurs for a period of seven months, from April to October, while dry season last for a period of five months that is, from November to March. Ebonyi State is richly endowed with natural resources and solid mineral deposits which are at present largely unexploited. These minerals are found in commercial quantities across the state and include: Zinc, Copper, Aluminium, Coal, Granite, Lignite, Gypsum, Salt, Limestone, Kaolin, Bauxite and others. However, agriculture appears to be the mainstay of Ebonyi State economy since Idachaba (1993) noted that about 80 percent of the inhabitants are mainly smallholder farmers. Hence, Ebonyi State is popularly known as the 'food basket' of the nation.

Sampling procedure

For the purpose of this study, the first sampling procedure was to carry out a pilot survey in the three zones of the state. This enabled the researchers to become acquainted with the socio-cultural and physical environment of these farmers. It was convenient to use extension staff, teachers and local leaders in order to obtain more useful information and also assist the illiterate farmers in answering questions as contained in the questionnaire.

Specifically, the sampling techniques adopted for this research was a multi-stage sampling technique. It was not necessary to adopt 'EBADEP' model of blocks, circles, sub-circles and contact farmers because of the geopolitical spread. Therefore, the multi-stage sampling method adopted here involved a stage by stage technique of simple-random sampling of the small-holder farmers in all the autonomous communities of the twelve Local Government Areas studied. Thus, the first stage was to purposively choose twelve out of the thirteen existing Local Government Areas in the state. This was done for reasons of proximity and accessibility. The next stage was a random sampling of five autonomous communities in each of the already chosen twelve local government areas. This gave a total of sixty autonomous communities. Then, stage three involved sampling three villages in each of the sixty autonomous communities. This gave a total of one hundred and eighty villages required for the study.

Furthermore, two small-holder farmers were randomly sampled out of the one hundred and eighty villages. This then gave a total of three hundred and sixty small-holder farmers which represented the required sample for the study. Finally, it was necessary to sample randomly a total of two hundred and forty multiple-cropping smallholder farmers out of the three hundred and sixty farmers for the research sample size.

It is also important to note that for a proportional representation of each village, a proportional percentage of the population per village was

a sine qua non in the simple random sampling. This was properly adopted in the study.

Source of data and analytical techniques

Data for this study were obtained from mainly primary sources. These were obtained by using a well-structured questionnaire, which was augmented with interview schedules. The respondents for the research were the smallholder farmers who engaged in the multiple cropping system.

Therefore, the information provided by these farmers formed the bulk of the primary data including direct field observation. It is noteworthy that the data also provided useful information on socio-economic status of the smallholder farmers, resource sources and uses including the crop types adopted in multiple cropping system in the study area.

Other sources of data include secondary data collected from journals, research reports, and Ebonyi State Agricultural Development Programme (EBADEP). Such information was mostly related to the characteristics and list of smallholder farmers in the chosen villages for this study.

The primary data collected for this study were analysed using descriptive and inferential statistics. Specifically, frequency distribution and percentages were employed in order to determine the constraints facing the small-holder farmers in resource uses in multiple cropping.

Results and discussion

In the course of this study, specific problems were identified to be militating against the efficient use of production resources (land, labour and capital) in the area. These problems included the following:

Constraints against the efficiency of land use

From Table 1, it can be seen that 45 percent of the respondents disclosed that high lease charges/cost of buying land militated against the efficient use of land in their farming activities. This is closely followed by the problem of land fragmentation, reported by 35 percent of the sample. However, about 4 percent and 15 percent of the farmers respectively revealed that the stringent customary laws and the sharing of communal family land(s) on a merit basis are constraints against land acquisition in the study area.

Most of the farmers saw sex discrimination as a factor militating against the efficiency of land use. About 69 percent of the respondents believed that not allowing women to use all lands for farming activities led to inefficient land use. Some 31 percent of the respondents revealed that the practice of not allowing women to own land is a form of sex discrimination, which does not favour efficient land use.

Further examination of the data in Table 1 disclosed that about 78 percent of the farmers are faced with the problem of low fertility of the land. Twenty-two percent of the respondents however, believed that low fertility of the land is not a constraint to the efficient use of land in the study area.

Table 1: Constraints against the efficiency of land use

Type of Constraints	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Land Acquisitions Constraints		
Stringent Customary Laws	11	4.42
High lease charges/cost of buying	91	45.00
Sharing of Communal Family land not lands on merit basis to leased out	30	14.78
Land Fragmentation	70	35.00
Total	**202**	**100.00 %**
Sex discrimination		
Women do not own land	76	30.52
Women cannot use all lands	173	69.48
Total	**249***	**100.00 %**
Low fertility of Land		
Effect	186	77.5
No effect	54	2.5
Total	**240**	**100.00 %**
Land Distance		
Effect	124	51.67
No effect	116	48.33
Total	**240**	**100.00 %**
Land Inheritance Traditions		
Female do not inherit land	76	25
Age grade membership as a prerequisite	30	9.87
Communal land sharing for only taxable adults	198	65.13
Total	**304***	**100.00 %**
Other Competing Land use		
Building	120	33.33
Plantations	167	46.39
Animal rearing	25	6.95
Crop drying	30	8.33
Hunting	18	5.00
Total	**360***	**100.00 %**

Source: Field Survey, 1999.* Multiples responses were obtained in some cases.

From Table 1 it can also be seen that 124 farmers (about 52 percent) agreed that the distance of land from the farming community was a great problem facing efficient land use in the study area. A relatively significant percentage of about 48 agreed that land distance does not pose any problem to land use efficiency. Additionally, land inheritance traditions constitute constraints to the efficiency of land use. Sixty five percent of the respondents opined that the tradition of sharing communal land among taxable adults only decreases the efficiency of land use. Equally, 25 percent of the farmers sampled said that the non-inheritance of land by females negatively affected the efficiency of land use in the area.

Finally, the establishment of plantations, construction of building and crop drying among other constraints posed a problem to land use efficiency. These constraints were noted by about 46 percent, 33 percent, and 8 percent of the sample respectively.

Constraints against the efficiency of labour use

The analysis of the results reported in Table 2 shows that the greatest problem militating against the efficient utilisation of labour in the study area is its high cost. This problem was mentioned by about 23 percent of the respondents. Nearly as many reponses mentioned the issue of emigration. Sex discrimination and other competing labour uses were respectively identified by about 19 percent and 14 percent of the respondents as factors militating against the efficiency of labour use.

For instance, it was found that in some places it has become a norm for certain farm operations to be exclusively reserved for either males or females. Thus, at times, there existed surplus supplies of male labour for some operations while another area of operation might be suffering shortages. Invariably, this brought about a rise in the price of labour in those areas where the female labour force was not be sufficient for the specified task.

Table 2: Constraints against the efficiency of labour use

Type of Constraints	Frequency	Percentage
High cost of labour	221	23.36
Sex discrimination	180	19.03
Emigration	210	22.2
Conflicting seasons	120	12.68
Traditional beliefs	85	8.99
Other competing labour uses	130	13.74
Total	946*	100.00%

Sources: Field Survey, 1999. Note: *Multiple responses.

Also, about 13 percent and 9 percent of the respondents respectively disclosed that conflicting seasons and traditional beliefs affected the efficiency of labour use in the study area. This is because both planting and harvesting seasons of the crops were found in most cases to conflict with the periods of schoolwork. As a result, children and some parents (teachers) who form a good proportion of the available family labour supply could not put in maximum labour during the period. Moreover, some of the markets were found to be drawing most of the available work force on certain days and this brought about the shortage of labour supply at such times while there was an excess on other days. Other competing uses of labour such as masonry and crafts were also constraining factors in labour availability for multiple cropping purposes.

Constraints against the efficiency of capital use

The study revealed several constraints militating against the efficient use of capital in the area. These constraints are presented in Table 3. From the Table, it can be seen that the non-availability of improved varieties of various crops was an impediement to efficient capital utilisation. The following deficiencies were reported: yam and cocoyam (about 29 percent each); pepper and okra (22 percent and 16 percent); and finally much lower problems encountered with reard to improved varieties of cassava and maize (3 percent and 2 percent respectively).

Again, further scrutiny of Table 3 reveals that the high cost of modern inputs, the lack of adequate finance and the non-availability of fertilizer pose great problems to the efficient utilization of capital. These constraints were respectively identified by about 36 percent, 33 percent and 31 percent of the farmers.

Severally and individually, the inaccessibility of formal credit sources is caused by rigorous processes involved in obtaining loans (22 percent); lack of collateral (about 22 percent), and the short-term repayment period (about 20 percent). Equally, the problems of high interest rates and the late arrival of loans were identified by about 18 and 17 percent of the respondents as constraints facing the efficient utilisation of capital in the study area.

Table 3: Constraints against the efficiency of capital use

Type of Constraints	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Non-availability of Improved Varieties		
Yam	240	28.64
Cassava	25	2.98
Maize	16	1.91
Okra	132	15. 75
Cocoyam	240	28.64
Pepper	185	22.08
Total	**838**	**100.00 %**
Problem of Logistics		
High cost of modern inputs	234	35.89
Lack of adequate	215	32.98
Non-Availability of fertilizer	203	31.13
Total	**652***	**100.00 %**
Inaccessibility of Formal credit sources because of:		
High Interest rate	189	18.31
Lack of collaterals	223	21.61
Rigorous processes	230	22.29
Late arrival of loan	180	17.44
Short repayment period	210	20.35
Total	**1034***	**100.00 %**
Adverse effect of the use of modern inputs		
Fertilizer use causes rotting	215	61.60
Tractors compacts the soil	134	38.40
Total	**349***	**100.00 %**

Source: Field Survey, 1999. *Multiple responses.

Other constraints against the efficiency of resource use in multiple cropping

Other constraints found militating against the efficient use of resources in the study area include the lack of storage facilities (about 21 percent); the incidence of pests and diseases (25 percent); poor marketing facilities (22 percent); and poor transportation facilities (15 percent). Other constraints mentioned included high processing costs and the damaging effect of some crops on others. These constitute about 9 percent and 7 percent respectively.

Table 4: Other constraints against the efficiency of resource use in multiple cropping

Types of Constraint	Frequency	Percentage
Lack of storage facility	196	21.37
Pest and diseases	231	25.19
Poor marketing facilities	203	22.14
Poor transportation facilities	140	15.27
High processing cost	85	9.27
Damaging effect of some crops on other crops	62	6.76
Total	917*	100.00 %

Source: Field Survey, 1999. *Multiple responses.

Conclusion

This study shows that the multiple croppers are faced with several problems in their production processes. These problems significantly affect the efficiency of resource use (land, labour and capital). Notable among them are high lease charges, discrimination against women on land use, low fertility of land, long distance of cultivable lands, high cost of labour, emigration, non-availability of improved varieties of yam and cocoyam, rigorous processes involved in obtaining loans, among others.

Hence, for any meaningful agricultural development in the area, these constraints must be drastically reduced. This can be done through efficient policy formulation and implementation, proper supervision of agricultural programmes, effective extension services and proper agricultural financing.

References

ABCCIMA, 1997, *Abakaliki Chamber of Commerce, Industry, Mines and Agriculture Brochure.*

Agbilibeazu, L.O., 1984, *Source, Uses and Credit Problems of Peasant Farmers in Ikwo Local Government Area.*

Akinsanmi, O., 1978, *Certificate Agricultural Science*, London, Longman Group Limited.

Alimba, J.O. and Ezinwa, J.O., 2001, 'Resource Productivity of Yam-Based Mixed Cropping System of Anambra State, South Eastern Nigeria', *Journal of the Science of Agriculture, Food Technology and Environment*, Vol. 2, No. 1, October 2002, pp. 63 – 67.

Andrews, D.J and Kassan, A.H., 1976, 'The Importance of Multiple Cropping in Increasing World Food Supplies', Pub. N° 27, Wisconsin, pp.1-10.

Anthony, Y, Ezedinma F.O. and Ochapa, C.O., 1995, *Introduction to Tropical Agriculture*, 3rd Edition, London: Longman Group Ltd.

Awoke, M.U. and Obeta, M.E., 1998, 'Economic Analysis of Small-Scale Yellow Pepper Enterprises in Nsukka Area', *Citadel Journal*, Vol 2, No 5. 1998.

Collinson, M.P., 1972, *Farm Management in Peasant Agriculture*, New York: Frederick Praeger.

Forbes, J.C., 1992, *Plants in Agriculture*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Francis, C. A., 1986, *Multiple Cropping System in West and Central Africa*, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons.

Heady, E.O., 1952, *Economics of Agricultural Production and Resource Use*, Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall Inc.

Idachaba F. S., 1993, 'Agricultural and Rural Development Under the Babangida Administration', in J.O. Osakwe, *Seven Years of IBB – The Economy*.

Johnson, D.T., 1982, *The Business of Farming: A Guide to Farm Business Management in the Tropics*, London: Macmillan.

Mac Arthur J.D., 1983, 'Some Characteristics of Farmers in Tropical Environments', in Hands Ruthenberg ed., *Farming Systems in the Tropics*, 3rd Edition, Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Madu, E., 1995, *Agro-Raw Material Production and National Growth. A Case of Farmer's Response*.

Nweke, F.I. and Winch, F.E., 1979, *Bases for Farm Resource Allocation in the Small Holder Cropping Systems of South Eastern Nigeria: A Case Study of Awka and Abakaliki Villages*, International Institute of Tropical Agriculture, Ibadan Discussion Papers N^{0} 4/80.

Olayide, S.O., 1980, *Food and Nutritional Crisis in Nigeria*, Ibadan: Ibadan University Press.

Ogunfowara, O. and Olayide, O., 1981, 'Resource Problems of Rural Economies', in *Elements of Rural Economies*, Ibadan: Ibadan University Press Publishing House.

Onwukwe, C.C., 1994, 'Resource Use Productivity Under the Mixed Cropping System of Anambra State: A Case Study of Yam-based Mixed Cropping System', Unpublished M.Sc Thesis. Department of Agricultural Economics and Extension, ESUT Enugu.

Upton, M., 1976, *Agricultural Production Economics and Resource Use*, London: Oxford University Press.

Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 70–83

(ISSN 0850-3907)

The Challenge of the Participatory Approach to Rural Poverty Alleviation: The Example of Olugbena Group of Villages, Ewekoro, Ogun State, Nigeria

Adetoye Faniran* and Thompson Adeboyejo**

Abstract

This paper draws from the experiences of a Non-Governmental Organisation, Man and Nature Study/Action Centre (MANASC)—concerning a rural development project being undertaken in Olugbena, a group of six villages in Ewekoro Local Government of Ogun State, Nigeria—to highlight the challenges of participatory rural development in Africa. The project part, funded by the Australian High Commission in Nigeria under its Direct Aid Scheme, comprises a component of a much broader development plan for the area as contained in a pre-feasibility report undertaken in 1995 by MANASC for the National Primary Health Care Development Agency (NPHCDA), a Parastatal of the Federal Ministry of Health. It is observed that one of the challenges for rural development facilitators, policy makers and practitioners, revolves around appropriate strategies for managing unpredictability, especially those that reduce the unknown elements to acceptable levels and impose the minimum of appropriate structures.

Résumé

Cette contribution s'inspire de l'expérience d'une organisation non gouvernementale, Man and Nature Study/Action Centre – MANASC – (Etude de l'Homme et de la Nature/ Centre d'action), concernant un projet de développement rural en cours à Olugbena, un groupe de six villages appartenant au gouvernement local d' Ewekoro, dans l'état d'Ogun, au Nigeria. Elle tente d'identifier les défis au développement rural participatif, en Afrique. La partie «projet», financée par l' «Australian High Commission» (Haut Commissariat Australien), au Nigeria, dans le cadre du «Direct Aid Scheme» (Programme d'aide directe), prévoit une composante appartenant à un programme de

* Department of Geography, University of Ibadan, Nigeria.
** Department of Urban & Regional Planning, Ladoke Akintola University of Technology, Ogbomoso, Nigeria.

développement plus large, destiné à cette zone, tel que prévu dans un rapport de pré-faisabilité préparé en 1995 par le MANASC (pour la «National Primary Health Care Development Agency» – Agence Nationale pour le Développement des Soins de Santé de Base – (NPHCDA), une structure semi-publique du Ministère Fédéral de la Santé. Il a été noté que parmi les défis auxquels sont confrontés les facilitateurs, décideurs et praticiens du développement rural, figure la définition de stratégies adaptées à la gestion des imprévus, particulièrement celles qui permettraient de réduire les éléments imprévus à des niveaux acceptables et qui favoriseraient la mise en place de structures appropriées.

Introduction

Development strategies directed at poverty alleviation and the enhancement of the living standards for rural communities on a sustainable basis have undergone fundamental transformations which many countries are striving to adopt. With each passing year, a gathering momentum is shifting the traditional, centrally-based or managed, supply-driven and expert-controlled emphasis towards demand-based participatory approaches that place people, especially the stakeholders, at the heart of the development process. Increasingly, governments and other support (external and internal) agencies, instead of the traditional practice of encouraging communities to contribute to development as seen by the government, now see the wisdom in providing support for community centred initiatives. This, it is believed, will provide a more conducive atmosphere for a collective or joint initiation, identification and prioritization of needs; the investigation and assessment of available resources for the satisfaction of the identified needs; and discussion and agreement on the preferred resources, strategies, and processes of providing the means of satisfying the needs of a democratic, participatory environment.

The argument is that, by involving all stakeholders, especially the eventual users – preferably as a community rather than as individuals – in project identification, analysis, development and implementation, the participatory development strategy will be able to build local confidence and capacity to resolve problems that arise in the course of development. It will also facilitate sound decisions that are in the people's interest. In the final analysis, the chances that facilities will be claimed by users are enhanced. There is also the prospect that the facilities will be used and maintained locally with minimum assistance from outsiders.

However as shown in this paper, even this approach does not solve all the problems, in fact it raises new ones, especially in peri-urban areas where the community spirit has suffered serious regressions. This has been the experience in both the Olugbena and Mokoloki communities in the vicinity of Abeokuta, capital of Ogun state of Nigeria. The case of Mokoloki

community in Owode Local Government area of Ogun State, has been reported elsewhere (Faniran et al. 1985). Here government's well intentioned farmer-based small farm schemes – according to which land was cleared, prepared, sown to crops and then allocated to prospective farmers – failed woefully. Most of the allotters failed to show up to work on the farms but they still appeared to share in the proceeds.

The myth of a communal African society

While communalism was a major characteristic feature of the pre-colonial African society, it may be mythical to continue to assume, in the present-day, that all societies in different parts of the continent still live communal lives. The communal spirit of African societies has, since European colonisation of the continent, been subjected to the capitalistic and individualistic ideologies of the western and oriental world. The complete enthronement of this foreign doctrine in African societies, has been fostered in recent times by the forces of globalisation, which carry with them what appear to African societies as superior Western and oriental culture. If elements of communalism exist, it is more as traces rather than a solid pattern that is observable in the socio-political and economic lives of the people. For instance in Nigeria, many experts point to the existence of ubiquitous Community-Based Organisations (CBOs) throughout the country (see Onibokun and Faniran 1995a). But the evidence seems to point in the direction of Nigerians having turned largely capitalistic and basically individualistic, including in the rural areas. Indeed, as shown by Onibokun and Faniran (1995a), among others, the most active CBOs are those with government support or patronage, namely the Co-operatives and Community Development Councils or Associations. This is largely because of the government 'largesse' or 'share of national cake' that many such institutions expect. It is, therefore, not surprising that several die with the withdrawal of government and other external support, meaning they are not intrinsically sustainable. This emphasises the need for a closer look at the institutions if they are to be used under the envisaged new dispensation.

In this connection it is possible, at this initial stage, to think of a few things that need to be done. Among other things, there is the need to galvanise partnerships on equal basis among the people as organised members of communities and government and its agencies, Non-Governmental Organisation (NGOs), and the external as well as internal development agencies for the purpose of rekindling or reawakening the erstwhile community spirit. Until this is done i.e the communal living and the

associated community attachent and loyalty are aroused, we shall continue to pay lip service to development at the community level in Africa.

The envisaged or proposed shift, interestingly, has been part and parcel of the spirit, if not the practice, of what is traditionally referred to as 'community development':

> ...Community development possesses a set of principles which are often applied universally, rather than specifically... while the basic ideas... can remain constant, the practice differs greatly from one area to another. This is because different communities have different needs, the same community may even have different needs at different times... Community development must be viewed as involving the improvement of a community's system of values, its structures, as well as the usage through which this system functions and is maintained.... It involves social change, whose primary purpose is to bring about better living within the community (Onibokun, and Faniran 1995a:196).

Yet the question as to how best to achieve this remains largely unanswered and the vast majority of the citizens of developing countries, close to 70 percent in places, continue to live below the poverty line (Onibokun and Faniran 1995b).

The Olugbena Rural Development Project

Comprising six villages of Olugbena, Baasi, Aroge, Asipa, Daba and Akiode, the project area appears to be one of those impoverished peri-urban areas lacking in the infrastructural base necessary for modern type development. According to a feasibility report (Faniran 1995:iii), 'the area is completely locked up from innovations, whether in the area of the economy or infrastructure. It is best described as a rural-rural-area, if there is any term like that'. However, like many areas in the forest zone in the south of Nigeria, it is blessed with natural resources, including abundant water in form of rainfall, surface water, near-surface and the deep-seated types, which can be tapped for supplementary irrigation, inland fishery and associated agro-allied industries. Other natural resources in the area include abundant fertile soil and well-drained rolling topography, all of which are an asset to small-medium scale agriculture. There are also trees with economic value such as the oil palm and a whole range of timber-producing plants. In short, the area is well suited to both arable and permanent (tree) crops in addition to a wide range of livestock-based agriculture.

The population is rather scanty, ranging between 250 and 500 in each settlement and comprising mostly the young and the old. However, the advent of immigrant farmers and the down-turn in the urban economy which is sending some of the middle aged emigrants back to the area have

started to introduce new elements into the depressed rural economy. But perhaps the greatest asset currently is the leadership being offered by the paramount ruler of the Owu people, of which Olugbena is a part, Oba Olawale Adisa Odeleye Lagbedu I, the Olowu of Owu-Abeokuta.

The original idea of the rural development project as agreed with the leadership of the NPHCDA was to use the area as a test for the actualisation of the National Health Policy of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, hinged on the Primary Health Care (PHC) strategy. A major component of this strategy, which is central to the present project, is the involvement of all health related sectors of the economy in planning and management (FMHSS 1994: xii). The overall development of the economy generally and of agriculture in the rural setting are therefore very crucial components or sectors of the health programme.

Accordingly, the packaged project prepared for implementation in the project area comprised:

- health care, including immunisation, drug revolving scheme (essential drugs) training and deployment of Village Health Workers (VHWs), Traditional Birth Attendants (TBAs) and other village based health personnel;
- water improvement schemes;
- economic activities or income-generating projects (fish ponds, poultry, piggery, etc) and agricultural inputs for increased farm yield;
- adult education and functional literacy;
- agro-based (food processing) industry; and
- improvement of access roads in the area, and the provision of electricity.

The purpose of the Olugbena project was the effective, sustainable rural development of a poverty-stricken region, using the participatory approach. Towards this goal, a workplan spanning 33 months from August 1995 was prepared. The plan, was for purposes of this work, divided into three phases or sub-stages, viz: the project concretisation/consultation phase, the fund sourcing phase, and the actualisation or implementation phase. For the last phase we used the example of the fish-pond project, which is the only one that was amenable to the participatory development strategy.

Project consultation phase

The project consultation phase started immediately after the pre-feasibility report was submitted to the NPHCDA, precisely on August 17, 1995. Mid-way into the following month, on September 14, 1995, a meeting

was held at Olugbena village among the major stakeholders in the project, namely:

- NPHCDA; represented by Chief (Mrs.) Iyabo T. Koleoso, the then Project Officer, and Mr. Akinwumi, of the same unit;
- The Olugbena community, represented by the paramount ruler of the community, Oba Olawale Adisa Odeleye 1, Olowu of Owu Abeokuta, and the Baale of Olugbena village, (now late),
- and the NGO, which is the Project Facilitator, Man and Nature Study/ Action Centre (MANASC), represented by Prof. Adetoye Faniran (the Executive Secretary and Project Manager/Co-ordinator) and Dr. A. T. Adeboyejo, the Assistant Project Manager Dr. O. Ogundeji of the Health and Social Service unit of MANASC was also present. He was then on the staff of NPHCD but later retired.

The meeting and subsequent discussions streamlined the recommendations of the prefeasibility report in some key areas. Among other things, it was agreed that the following projects be pursued in the area in sequence:

i) Because of the focus on health, a mini-pharmacy was to be sited at Olugbena, with the community providing the space ('a shop') and two adults for training by both NPHCDA and MANASC. The scheme was to be self-financing and managed on semi-commercial basis by the community. It was also agreed that the scheme would be extended to the other villages in the community.

ii) This was to be followed by institutional reforms that would involve the revitalisation of the existing development-oriented institutions, based on the then reigning Community Development Council system in the state. Each tier, especially at the level of the project area, was to be assisted by MANASC and NPHCDA to among other things:

- Draw up an appropriate constitution and bye law that would guide their operations;
- Constitute the various committees; as approved and prescribed by the constitution and byelaws
- Identify, study, plan, implement, monitor, evaluate and replicate development projects and schemes;
- Oversee financial matters, especially sourcing, accounting and management; and undertake any other activities at the expressed request of the people in the project area.

The fundraising phase

Unfortunately, by the time the report of the tripartite meeting was submitted to the NPHCDA, staff changes among other developments in the agency led to withdrawal of the body from the development project, in spite of all approaches made by both the community and the facilitators. This was a big set-back and nearly killed the entire programme, but for the resilience of the facilitators.

The withdrawal of NPHCDA did not only mean the complete cut-off of the envisaged source of initial finance for the project, it also sent the facilitators and the community back to the drawing board. Alternative sources of fund had to be sought, and with that, a fresh look at the projects too was necessary, in line with the requirements of the potential funding agencies. The alternative sources of funds explored were the foreign embassies/High Commissions in the country and the multi-lateral development agencies, whose focus was basically socio-economic transformation of the people through the implementation of viable socio-economic development projects. Therefore the emphasis in the area shifted to this sector, especially agricultural development, within which context fishery development was adjudged as having the best prospects of success. It therefore occupied the highest priority among the projects presented to would-be donors for funding. Others, mostly in the livestock group, included piggery, poultry, and goatery projects and associated arable crops. The idea was to integrate all these in such a way that they would support one another and minimise the importation of wares from outside the area. In other words, they were to be mutually self-supporting.

Of all their bilateral and multi-lateral agencies approached, only the Canada Fund for Local Initiatives (CFLI), Nigeria, responded positively; it agreed to sponsor the construction of a fish-pond. However, as in the case of the NPHCDA, this was not to be as the time of offer coincided with the closure of the Canadian High commission in Nigeria, occasioned by the political crisis in the country in the mid 1990s. Efforts to resuscitate the project after the crisis was over have so far been unsuccessful. Fortunately, in October 2000, after five years of searching, and countless applications and interviews, the Australian High commission approved a sum of N500,000.00 under its 'Direct Aid Programme' toward the fishery project. The amount requested, based on construction cost estimates, was N790,000.00.

The project implementation phase

With the grant secured, the facilitators immediately mobilised to get the fishery project started. Among other things, a technical crew was engaged

in December 2000 to identify a suitable location for the fish-pond and to undertake the necessary survey and construction works. The site chosen could accommodate three fairly large ponds instead of the one pond quoted for, and the price differential was such that it could easily be met by the community and the facilitators. The design also made adequate provision for the non-impairment of the domestic water supply, particularly for downstream communities.

However, no sooner were the contractors engaged that new problems started to surface. To begin with and contrary to expectation and promises, the local people were not only unfamiliar with the type of work, i.e. pond digging, they were also not too ready to learn. Moreover, the original idea was to apply the much quicker and more efficient mechanised method for pond preparation, but this was not feasible for financial and technological reasons and so was abandoned in favour of the manual method. A couple of reasons accounted for the change of method. First, the machines were not readily available in the vicinity; second, the cost was higher, indeed prohibitive; and third, it was feared that the site might not be firm enough for the heavy equipment. The site was also not very accessible for the needed machinery.

The decision to undertake manual operations faced other problems, which turned out to be so serious as to threaten the project implementation. Among other things, efforts to recruit the needed labour from the locality, including as far away as Ifo and Abeokuta, did not succeed. Eventually, labour, had to be imported from the contractor's base in far away Ilesa, Osun State. This had an unexpected impact on the cost of construction. It also caused a delay in the completion period, which dragged on for close to six months, instead of the envisaged two or three months. Stocking could only therefore begin on 29 June, 2001, and lasted until the middle of the following month.

The problems encountered did not end with the construction phase but extended to the operation and management stage. Among other things, poultry feed had to be brought in from Ibadan and Lagos. Also, communication often broke down between the site and the project manager (based in Ibadan) causing up to two weeks' delay in feed supply on a few occasions, which impacted negatively on the development of the stock. Consequently, harvesting had to be delayed from December 2001 to March 2002, to allow for optimum growth. As at the time of writing, efforts were being intensified to link with an Abeokuta-based fisheries practitioner – O. B. Farms & Fisheries Consultancy Services. An effort was also being made to engage a full-time resident manager to block the various loopholes in the management of the project.

As a result of the myriad of problems encountered during the implementation phase of the fishery project, the harvest was rather disappointing (Table 1).

Table 1: Fishery performance projections compared with actual production

Stock	Survival %		Survival (No)		Price/kg in N		Total price in N	
1,500 x 3	P	A	P	A	P	A	P	A
4,500	80	20	3,600	900	200.00	280.00	540,000	201,600

P = Projected;
A = Actual.

Instead of an expected revenue of N540,000.00, only N201,600 or 37.33 percent of that amount was realised. A major reason for this was the marked drop in the yield; just 240kg was harvested per pond, totalling 720kg, instead of the expected 2,700kg.

This loss was traced to three indeterminable sources: at the point of stocking, during operation (poaching and preying), and during the harvesting/sale. The facilitators could not ascertain the actual number of fingerlings seeded by the 'contractor' who stocked the ponds. Second, every assurance was given by the site staff that no poaching took place and that few, indeed a negligible, number of the fish died during operation. There was however no full-proof way of ascertaining these claims, given the fact that the site was not fully secured. All told, it has been a rather harrowing experience. The only encouraging thing is that the ponds are there, and more can be constructed, such that, from the lessons learnt so far, the future looks much brighter.

Discussion

Experience with the Olugbena community development project has provided number of valuable lessons both for scholars, policy makers, practitioners in the field and donor agencies. Among these are the limitations of blue-prints and models; the crucial role of accurate/adequate knowledge of local situations as against generalised statements and beliefs; the significance of patience and forbearance in the execution of community development schemes; and the need to further explore the full implications and rudiments of the participatory approaches to community development.

Limitations of Blue-prints/Designs

One major lesson learnt at virtually every stage of the implementation of the Olugbena village project was the near-unpredictability of the situation on the ground, leading to the need to modify the programme on several occasions. First, it was the sudden withdrawal of the NPHCDA, which dictated the review of the entire project make-up. Also, in the process of fund sourcing, the emphasis shifted from one project to another, to meet the conditions of different prospective donors and partners. Thus, although fishery was a constant, the ancillary project changed between livestock and arable crops, depending on the client. An example, not stated in the body of this paper, was the University of Agriculture, Abeokuta (UNAB), which promised assistance in the area of citrus fruits and banana/plantain cultivation. In virtually every case, except fishery, however, all hopes were dashed. Third and finally, the design for the fish-pond was modified and continued to be modified, based on experience in the field. Apart from the change from a mechanised to a manual operation, the number and mix of fingerlings per pond as well as the feeding method was changed as occasion demanded. In other words, blue-prints, designs, plans etc, are not more than working papers which will need to be modified or adjusted to suit the local situation. There is no limit to the number of such changes, particularly in areas where local knowledge is limited as in many parts of this country.

Role of indigenous knowledge

The pre-feasibility study made for the project tried to cover as much ground as was necessary to provide as complete information as possible about the study area and the envisaged development project. The study, however, proved to be inadequate in a number of key areas, which surfaced at the implementation phase. First, the assurances of the people as to their contributions to the project were not met. Among other things, there were no ready hands to employ as labour, notwithstanding promises of paying for work done. It took the intervention of the Oba to convince the people not to insist on receiving cash compensation for the economic trees (kolanut trees) affected by the site clearing. However, perhaps the worst areas were in the technical details. No proper soil tests were done; the assumptions about using machines were therefore way off target; so too were the project cost estimates. Whereas the study showed that just about N300,000 only would be sufficient for the fishery project, the sum of well over N1 million was actually expended. Inflation accounted for much of the increase. The initial estimates were made in 1995 while the project actually took off more than five years later, in year 2000.

One other major aspect, which did not surface during the survey but came to the fore during implementation was the farming practice in peri-urban forest-based agriculture. Among other things, this culture does not incorporate much manual work such as was required for the manual preparation of the fish-ponds. The people in the village live a dual life, partly in the village and partly in the neighbouring towns, especially Abeokuta and Lagos. It thus happened that the site caretaker was absent from the site, sometimes for up to two weeks, during which management, especially feeding, was disrupted. This affected the growth of the fish and largely accounted for the almost three months' extension of the harvest period.

Patience and forebearance

The frustration that attends most community-based efforts calls for a lot of commitment on the part of the stakeholders, particularly the facilitators. Apart from a waiting period of more than five years spent on fund raising for the project and the 'helplessness' shown by the community after the initial survey, the constantly changing scenarios were also enough to kill the enthusiasm of an outsider. The coincidence that the Oba was also the Chairman of MANASC as well as a long-time friend of the MANASC Executive Secretary kept the project going and to achieve the minimum result recorded so far.

The participatory strategy: the genuinely participatory approach to development, according to Odeleye-Lagbedu (1997) and MANASC (1997) is that which, among other things, teaches and encourages a marked shift from the traditional dependence and reliance on elaborate and detailed blue-prints, which also provide a basis for control and prediction of outcomes, on the basis of which the project is monitored and evaluated, usually by an external expert. This is because of the experience which shows beyond doubt that elaborate, detailed and 'finished' blue-prints are rarely feasible at the onset nor at any stage for that matter. Instead, decisions throughout the project life are best made jointly by all stakeholders, particularly the target community or ultimate owners/users of the facilities being provided. Moreover, rather than serving the needs of the external development agencies, the monitoring and evaluation processes are worked into the others in a learning process, with a view to building local capacity for decision making and community-oriented (participatory) development. The greatest challemge for community development project managers or facilitators, therefore, revolves around best strategies for managing unpredictability, especially those that reduce the unknown elements to acceptable levels and impose the minimum of appropriate structures.

There is no doubt that efforts made to discover and apply these strategies to the project at hand proved largely abortive. The government at all levels (Local, State and Federal) could not be persuaded to play its traditional role of mentors and encouragers of rural development. As if to make a bad case worse, the initial enthusiasm of the local people did not translate into action. Those who showed interest did so either (reluctantly) out of respect for the Oba, or for the financial benefit that accrued to them from the project. There was not a single member of the local community that appeared to be convinced about the long-term benefits of the project and so become committed altruistically to it. In the final analysis, the project turned out to be virtually one run by the Facilitators. And if we add on the experience of the Mokoloki project (see above) the prospects of participatory development for poverty-striken rural communities in Ogun State would appear bleak indeed.

Another relevant experience is provided by the failure of MANASC to interest local government and their agencies in Nigeria in short-term training programmes on the theme of participatory development strategies. A programme organized in Oyo State in 1997 saw only five participants in each of two centres, out of the over 200 expected at 5 different centres. The experience was worse in other states where there was no positive response at all.

One possible explanation of the negative attitude of the people to participatory development is the apparent breakdown of the communal spirit and tradition under the combined onslaught of 'modernisation' and capitalism. Individualism and personal gain have replaced communalism and community interest respectively in the urbanised forest communities.

Conclusion

The projects described in this paper provide valuable lessons for community development agencies. First, although every state and local government (as in other parts of the country) has units/departments or Ministries responsible for activities related to Co-operatives and community development, the full import of this arrangement has yet to be realised, as the communal spirit, particularly of the selfless type, is declining by the day. The people embrace the system for what they stand to gain rather than contribute to it. The authors' disappointing experience in the field can therefore be understood. The interest among the people is how much money they can obtain quickly from it; any project that will not provide it, is not relevant to the people's life.

Second, the government's approach to community development needs drastic review. It seems that the emphasis is on what the government intends

to do for the people rather than the other way round. Participatory development emphasises both sides of the development spectrum, and so cannot succeed in an environment such as we have presently in Nigeria and many communities in Africa. With respect to government, the issue of who occupies which position or exercises what power is still very crucial. Thus the retirement of the executive director of NPCDA and the deployment of the project officer in charge of the Olugbena project resulted in the complete withdrawal of the agency from participation in the project.

Third, the ability to secure fund for community development projects cannot be taken for granted. One might expect that the community would be able to harness the money needed for the take off of the project. But in a society where the communal spirit is ailing or dead, this was not the case. The people were only eager to alleviate their poverty and so looked on the facilitators for virtually all their financial requirements. Given that the people resident in the village were poor, the same can however not be said of their kith and kin outside, who could easily have come to the aid of the village people. So far this kind of help is not forthcoming.

Another possible source of project funding are the bilateral and multi-lateral agencies. However, there are too many NGOs on the ground, which flood these agencies with applications for funds. Apart from the fraud which features in the process, the precariousness of the rural development process and the attendant high rate of failure are not too encouraging. Thus the Nigerian rural and urban settings alike are littered by failed projects, some of them highly capitalised. The loss of enthusiasm on the part of the donor agencies is therefore to be expected. It is from this perspective that one should view the Australian Government grant, without which the project would not have taken off.

Fourth and finally, it is gratifying that with the right attitude, no matter the weight of the problems, commitment on the part of any one of the stakeholders will likely see a project through. In the case of the Olugbena project, the facilitators and the Paramount Ruler showed this type of commitment which saw the development of three fairly large fish ponds (18m x 20m x 1m each) at the site and the prospects of adding more. The results achieved so far are not too encouraging, but hopes are high that by the time all loopholes are filled, the project will pay off tremendously. At that time, the people, who are probably yet to be convinced, will rally round and a truly participatory spirit which marked the beginning of the project will be renewed and rekindled.

References

Ademiluyi, I.A., 1992, 'Rural settlement and development', in S.O. Onakomaiya, K. Oyesiku and F.J. Jegede, eds., *Ogun State in Maps,* Department of Geography and Regional Planning, Ogun State (now Olabisi Onabanjo) University, Ago-Iwoye, pp 45-53.

Areola, O.O., Faniran, A. and Akintola, F.O., 1985, 'The farmer-based small farm schemes of the Ogun Osun River Basin Development Authority, S.W. Nigeria', *Agricultural systems*, Vol. 16, pp. 7-21.

Faniran, A., 1995, *Accelerated Comprehensive Rural Development in a part of Wasimi Health District; Ifo Local Government of Ogun State*, National Primary Health Care Development Agency. FGN, Yaba, Lagos, 42p.

Federal Ministry of Health and Social Services (FMHSS), 1994, *Nigerian Country Plan of Action for Implementing the Minimum District Health for all Package, 1995–2000.*

Gleewe P. and Twum-Baah, K.A., 1991, 'The distribution of welfare in Ghana 1987–88a', L.S.M.S. Working Paper No 75, Washington D.C., World Bank.

Man and Nature Study/Action Centre (MANASC), 1997, *Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation (PME) of Environment, Water, Sanitation and Health Projects. Module, Course Code NSH3. MANASC in-service Short-Time Training in Skill improvement for Sustainable Development*, 47p.

Odeleye-Lagbedu I. O. A., 1997, 'Towards a Genuinely Participatory Approach to Nigeria's Development', Keynote Address, Workshop on Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation (PME) of Community-Based Environment, Water Supply, Sanitation and Health Projects, held at Igbo-Ora, Oyo-State, 13 Oct, 1997.

Onibokun, A.G. and A. Faniran, 1995a, *Community Based organizations in Nigerian Urban Centres: A Critical Evaluation of their Achievements and Potentials as Agents of Development*, (CASSAD) Monograph series 7; 260pp.

Onibokun, A.G. and A. Faniran, eds, 1995b, *Governance and Urban Poverty in Anglophone West Africa*, Ibid. Monograph Series 4.


Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 84–102

(ISSN 0850-3907)

The Informal and Formal Sector Inter-linkages and the Incidence of Poverty in Nigeria: A Case Study of Ilorin Metropolis

Gafar.T. Ijaiya* and Chika A. Umar**

Abstract

Using a multiple log-linear regression analysis, this paper examines the influence of the inter-relationship between the informal sector and the formal sector of Ilorin on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis. The study, carried out using a structured questionnaire to 480 informal sector operators, reported that 200 and 280 of the operators are not poor and poor respectively. Based on those that are poor, their relationship (in terms of the supply of labour, supply goods and raw materials, supply of equipment, provision of financial and technical assistance) with the formal sector is used in determining their influence on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis. The incidence of poverty thus proxied with their consumption-expenditure. The results obtained (with the exception of the financial linkage) show that the relationship between the informal sector and the formal sector is inversely related to the incidence of poverty, thus confirming our a priori expectations. The paper further suggests measures that would continue to make the informal sector a catalyst for poverty reduction in particular and relevant to the economic development of Ilorin in general.

Résumé

En utilisant une analyse à régression log linéaire multiple, cet article étudie l'influence de l'inter-relation entre le secteur informel et le secteur formel d'Ilorin sur l'incidence de la pauvreté, dans la métropole d'Ilorin. L'étude a été menée sur la base d'un questionnaire structuré envoyé à 480 opérateurs du secteur informel ; elle a révélé que 200 et 280 personnes parmi les personnes interrogées sont respectivement non pauvres et pauvres. Concernant les pauvres, leur relation (en termes d'offre de travail, d'offre de biens, de matières premières et d'équipement, de fourniture d'une assistance financière et technique) avec le

* Department of Economics, University of Ilorin, Nigeria.
** Department of Economics, Usmanu Danfodiyo University, Sokoto, Nigeria.

secteur formel permet de déterminer leur part dans l'incidence de la pauvreté à Ilorin. L'incidence de la pauvreté était ainsi liée à leur consommation-dépenses. Les résultats obtenus (à l'exception de la relation financière) montrent que la relation entre le secteur informel et le secteur formel est inversement proportionnelle à l'incidence de la pauvreté, ce qui confirme nos conclusions a priori. Cet article propose ensuite des mesures qui continueraient de faire du secteur informel un catalyseur de lutte pour la réduction de la pauvreté, en particulier, et un élément indispensable au développement d'Ilorin, en général.

Introduction

A number of studies[1] on the informal sector have shown that the sector is an important development phenomenon in less developed countries. For instance, it is known to have contributed to job creation, apprenticeship training, income generation, asset accumulation, and the provision of credit facilities and social services. Similarly, interaction in this domain and with the formal sector in terms of the supply of labour, goods and raw materials, equipment and the provision of financial and technical assistance is known to have contributed tremendously to economic development. Take the case of Nigeria, where a visit to formal large-scale supermarkets such as United Trading Company (UTC) and Leventis shows that most of the things they sell (since importation became unprofitable as a result of the excessive devaluation of the Naira) come from the informal sector. On the other hand, many of the goods sold by informal sector petty traders and street hawkers are from the formal sector factories and wholesale enterprises. Also many of the large-scale sector enterprises from trading companies to manufacturing enterprises are engaged in sub-contracting to the informal sector (Abumere 1995).

However, how these linkages have contributed to household welfare have not been clearly stated or investigated in Nigeria because there are very few empirical studies linking these linkages to the improvement of household welfare in any community or communities.

Drawing from the above, the aim of this paper therefore, is to provide an empirical investigation using household survey data and regression analysis to determine the influence of the informal sector (given its numerous contributions to economic development) on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis through its interactions with the formal sector.

The rest of the paper is structured as follows: In section two a conceptual and empirical overview of poverty and the contribution of the informal sector to economic development proposed for this study is provided. Section three provides a brief background of the study area and the methodology used in determining the influence of the interactions between the informal sector and the formal sector on the incidence of

poverty in Ilorin metropolis. Section four presents and discusses the results. The conclusion is contained in the last section.

Conceptual issues: Poverty and the informal sector

Poverty: Definition and measurement

According to Friedman (1996) to be poor is defined as a form of disempowerment viewed from three dimensions: socio-economic, political and psychological. Socio-economic disempowerment refers to poor peoples' relative lack of access to the resources essential for the self production of their livelihood; political disempowerment refers to poor people's lack of a clear political agenda and voice; and psychological disempowerment refers to poor people's internalised sense of worthlessness and passive submission to authority.

Sanyal (1991) and Schubert (1994) view poverty as either absolute or relative or both. Absolute poverty is that which could be applied at all time in all societies, such as for instance the level of income necessary for bare subsistence, while relative poverty relates the living standard of the poor to the standards that prevail elsewhere in the society in which they live.

Related to the definition of poverty is the measurement of poverty. According to Foster et al (1984) the most frequently used measurements are: (i) the headcount poverty index given by the percentage of the population that live in households with a consumption per capita less than the poverty line; (ii) the poverty gap index which reflects the depth of poverty by taking into account how far the average poor person's income is from the poverty line; and (iii) the distributionally sensitive measure of squared poverty gap defined as the means of the squared proportionate squared poverty gap which reflects the severity of poverty (see also Grootaert and Braithwaite 1998, Ravallion 1996).

The importance of the measurement of poverty is to know who is poor, how many people are poor, and where the poor are located. Levy (1991) stresses that in measuring poverty two tasks have to be taken into consideration; (i) a poverty line which is set at $275 and $370 per person a year for the extreme poor and for the moderate poor respectively must be determined[2]; and (ii) the poverty level of individuals have to be aggregated. He furthermore states that to determine the poverty line two methods are employed: (i) the use of nutritional intake which is set at 2500 calories per head per day; and the use of a list of certain commodities considered essential for survival, for instance, food, housing, water, health care, education vis-à-vis income.

Recent studies by the UNDP advocate the use of Human Development Index (HDI) and Capability Poverty Measure (CPM). According to UNDP (1998) the HDI combines three components in the measure of poverty which include life expectancy at birth (longevity), educational attainment, and improvement in standard of living determined by per capita income. The first relates to survival – vulnerability to death at a relatively early age. The second relates to knowledge – being excluded from the world of reading and communication. The third relates to a decent living standard in terms of overall economic provisioning. On the other hand, CPM focuses on the average state of peoples' capabilities by reflecting on the percentage of people who lack basic or minimally essential human capabilities which are ends in themselves needed to lift one from income poverty and to sustain strong human development.

Causes and consequences of poverty

According to the World Bank (2001), poverty has various manifestations which can be linked to the lack of income and assets to attain basic necessities of life, such as, food, shelter, clothing and acceptable levels of health and education. Such manifestations include the sense of voicelessness and power-lessness in the institutions of the state and society, which subjects the poor to rudeness, humiliation, shame, inhumane treatment and exploitation in the hands of the people in authority; the absence of rule of law, the lack of protection against violence, extortion and intimidation, and the lack of civility and predictability in interaction with public officials, the lack of economic opportunities, threats of physical force or arbitrary bureaucratic power that makes it difficult for the people to engage in public affairs; and vulnerability to adverse shocks and disruptions linked to an inability to cope with them. Example of such shocks and disruptions are when people live and farm on marginal lands with uncertain rainfall, when people live in crowded urban settlements where heavy rain can wipe out their houses, when people have precarious employment in the formal or informal sector, when people are faced with higher risks of diseases, such as malaria and tuberculosis; civil conflicts and wars, when people are at risk of arbitrary arrest and ill treatment at the hands of local authorities and when people most especially women and the minorities are at risk of being socially excluded and victims of violence and crime.

Yahie (1993) reiterates that the factors that causes poverty include: (i) structural causes that are more permanent and depend on a host of (exogenous) factors such as limited resources, lack of skills, locational disadvantage and other factors that are inherent in the social and political

set-up. The disabled, orphans, landless farmers, households headed by females fall into this category; and (ii) the transitional causes that are mainly due to structural adjustment reforms and changes in domestic economic policies that may result in price changes, unemployment and so on. Natural calamities such as drought and man-made disasters such as wars, environmental degradation and so on also induce transition poverty.

Discussing the consequences of poverty Von Hauff and Kruse (1994) highlighted three major consequences: (i) consequences for those affected. That is, for the people affected, poverty leads to physical and psychological misery, caused inter alia by inadequate nourishment, lack of medical care, a lack of basic and job related education and marginalisation in the labour markets; (ii) consequences for the national economies of countries affected arising from the formation of slums in cities, a worsening of ecological problems, particularly as a result of predatory exploitation in the agricultural sector and through the failure to use the available human resources; and (iii) consequences for the political and social development of the countries affected. That is, mass poverty tends to preserve or reinforce the existing power structures and thus also the privileges of a minority of the population. In some cases this involves corrupt elites. These privileged minorities in the population are not generally interested in structural changes for the benefit of the poor population. As a consequence, mass poverty tends to inhibit the development of democratic structures and higher levels of participation in policy decisions.

According to Narayan et al (2000), many households crumble under the weight of poverty. While some households are able to remain intact, many others disintegrate as men, unable to adapt to their failure to earn adequate incomes under harsh economic circumstance, have difficulty accepting that women are becoming the main breadwinners that necessitates a redistribution of income within the households. The result is often alcoholism and domestic violence on the part of men and a breakdown of the family structure. Women in contrast, tend to swallow their pride and go out into the streets to do demeaning jobs, or in fact, to do anything it takes to put food on the table of their children and husbands.

Trends of poverty in Nigeria

In Nigeria, the incidence of poverty was 65.5 percent in 1996. As indicated in Table 1, this percentage rate represents in absolute term 67 million people out of an estimated population of about 102 million people.

The poverty situation in Nigeria also displays regional variation, for example, within the same period the poverty rate was higher in the northern

agro-climatic zone at 40 percent compared with the middle and southern zones at 38 percent and 24 percent respectively (Francis et al. 1996, FOS 1999). Similarly, Nigeria's rank in the Human Development Index remained low at about 0.462, being the 137th out of 174 countries (ADB 2003).

Table 1: Estimated total population and rate of poverty in Nigeria (1980–1996)

Year	Estimated Total Population (in million)[a]	Absolute No. of Poor People (in million)[b]	Percentage (%) that are Poor[c]
1980	64.6	18.1	28.1
1981	66.7	21.3	32
1982	68.4	24.2	35.5
1983	70.6	27.5	39.0
1984	73.0	31.4	43.0
1985	75.4	34.9	46.3
1986	77.9	35.8	46.0
1987	80.4	36.5	45.4
1988	83.1	37.4	45.0
1989	84.9	37.7	44.5
1990	86.6	38.0	44.0
1991	88.5	38.5	43.5
1992	91.3	39.0	42.7
1993	93.5	45.8	49.0
1994	96.2	52.6	54.7
1995	98.9	59.3	60.0
1996	102.3	67.1	65.6

Sources: (a) National Population Commission 1993; Central Bank of Nigeria. Annual Report and Statement of Account (various issues) and Federal Office of Statistics Annual Abstract of Statistics (various issues). (b) Computed by the author from (a) and (c). (C) Federal Office of Statistics (FOS) (1999) Poverty Profile for Nigeria 1980–1996; and Federal Office of Statistics' National Household Consumer Survey (various issues).

The poverty situation in Ilorin metropolis is not too different from that of the whole country. For instance, in the study by Ijaiya (2002) in 1997, the headcount poverty index was estimated at 0.58, representing 58 percent of the population with consumption-expenditure below the poverty line of N1288.00 per month.

Specifically, these trends are manifested in a steady decline in total factor productivity, and decline in real average family income in the rural and urban areas. The decline in GDP at factor cost in 1987 prices at an average annual rate of 1.8 percent between 1981 and 1985 with a slight

increase by only 2.28 percent in 1992, 2.28 percent in 1993 and 1.3 percent, 2.21 percent and 3.25 percent in 1994, 1995 and 1996 respectively also has taken its toll on the level of poverty in the country. Stagnation in agricultural and industrial production, an increase in the rate of unemployment, decline in per capita consumption by 1 percent, an increase in the rate of inflation from 45 percent in 1992 to about 73 percent in 1994 and a deteriorating state of the nation's infrastructural facilities are some of the indicators of poverty (CBN various issues).

The informal sector: Definition and characteristics

The informal sector, often referred to as the subterranean economy, underground economy, shadow economy, non-corporate enterprises, micro-enterprises and petty producers, is defined as a large volume of self employed in developing countries who are engaged in small-scale intensive work such as tailoring, food preparation, trading, shoe repairing, etc. These people are often regarded as unemployed or underemployed as they cannot be included in the national employment statistics but they are often highly productive and make a significant contribution to national income. Their work in general is characterised by low capital-output ratio, that is, the ratio of the level of equipment or capital relative to output is low (Pearce 1992; Stearns 1988; Trager 1987; Wickware 1998).

Fluitman (1989) views the informal sector as a heterogeneous phenomenon which encompasses a wide variety of economic activities which tend to be overlooked in statistics, including all sorts of manufacturing activities, construction, trade and commerce, repair and other services. For example, informal sector workers make beds, pots and pan, they repair watches, cars and radios, they write letters, lend money, run restaurant, and barbering shops in the side walk, they transport goods and people on their motorbikes, they sell fruit and cooking oil and cigarettes by the piece. Informal sector activities are mostly carried out in small units owned and operated by one or a few individuals with little capital, they are usually labour intensive activities which result in low quality but relatively cheap goods and services.

According to ILO (1972) the characteristics of the informal sector include among others: ease of entry, predominant use of local resources, family ownership of the enterprises, small scale of operation, largely labour-intensive technology, acquisition of skills mainly outside the formal system of education and training, and operation in an unregulated competitive market.

The importance of the informal sector

The contribution of the informal sector to economic development is enormous. As Morgan (1989) puts it, 'though detailed statistics on the enterprises are hard to come by owing to lack of extensive databases, it is clear that in many countries their role is extremely important as contributors to the nation's wealth. Experience from economies which have exhibited success in developing the informal sector shows that micro-enterprises are a major engine in industrial and commercial development. These businesses also contribute important connecting points between the various sectors of the economy where flexibility of products and services supplied play a crucial role in the commercial network of the country. They also have in addition the highly desirable quality of being in virtually all cases home grown enterprises and as such do not carry with them the same risks encountered by foreign firms seeking to introduce operating methods that are inapplicable to local conditions'.

Evidence from a number of countries has shown that an increased proportion of employment, income and output are originating from this sector. For instance, the International Labour Office (ILO) has estimated that in the poorest countries, 80 percent of workers operate in the informal and agricultural sector while for middle-income countries the informal/ agricultural figure exceeds 40 percent. On average, 30 percent of workers in developing world cities are informal. In a few cases, this percentage is lower; in many it is substantially higher. According to a recent statistical compilation by the ILO of total urban employment, the informal sector portion accounts for 49 percent in Peru, 40 percent in Ecuador and 54 percent in Columbia. Among 15 Sub-Saharan African nations urban informal employment as a percentage of total informal employment ranges from 9 percent in Zimbabwe to 80 percent in Benin with a median of 49 percent. In five Asian countries, the corresponding percentages range from 17 percent to 67 percent (Wickware 1998).

A study conducted in 1992 by the Economic Commission for Africa indicates that the informal sector's contribution to GDP in the African countries is estimated at about 20 percent and its contribution to the GDP of the non-agricultural sector stood at 34 percent. For instance, its contribution to GDP was 38 percent in Guinea, 10.3 percent in Tanzania, 30 percent in Burkina Faso, 24.5 percent in Nigeria, and 20 percent in Niger. The sectorial analysis of available data shows that trade represents about 50 percent of the activity of the informal sector. Manufactured production represents 32 percent, services and transport represent 14 percent and 40 percent respectively (Kankwanda et al. 2000).

The linkages between the informal and the formal sector

The contribution of the informal sector to economic development can also be viewed from the interaction between the various operators in the sector and between the informal sector operators and the formal sector operators. According to Herchbach (1989) and Lanjouw (1998) the relationship among the operators in the informal sector and the relationship between the informal sector operators and the formal sector operators has contributed to the growth of the informal sector and to its contribution to economic development and poverty reduction. For instance, the linkages among the informal sector operators (in terms of the supply of labour, technical services, finance, raw materials and equipment) has helped improve the quality of goods and services produced by the operators thus making them compete favourably with what obtained in the formal sector. Their relationship with the formal sector has made them powerful distributors for the goods and services produced by the formal sector enterprises. And the formal sector enterprises are also known to provide inputs and services to informal sector enterprises through sub-contracting.

Grey-Johnson (1993) also reiterates that the linkages with the formal sector are strong, providing it with a wide array of intermediate and final products. Studies have established that there is more demand for informal goods from outside the sector than from within it. For instance, the informal sector operators consume only 5 percent of their products whereas 50 percent is consumed in the formal sector, and the remainder in subsistence agriculture.

Study area and methodology

Study area

The study area covered parts of Ilorin metropolis. Ilorin metropolis is located some 300 kilometres from Lagos and 500 kilometres from Abuja, the Federal Capital of Nigeria, and on Latitude North 8^0 3^0' and Longitude East 4^0 35' of the Equator.The city is situated in the transition zone between the forest and savanna regions of Nigeria. Presently, the city is the capital of Kwara State of Nigeria and has an estimated population (from the 1991 census) of about 572, 178 people (Adedibu 1988; NPC 1993).

Methodology

Data Source

Apart from the use of secondary data, a survey aimed at generating primary data on the incidence of poverty and the linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector in Ilorin metropolis was conducted through

the distribution of copies of a questionnaire and through a participatory poverty assessment method.

The questionnaire was based on the World Bank Living Standards Measurement Study (LSMS) and the Federal Office of Statistics' National Integrated Survey of Households (NISH) methods, which among other things produced comprehensive monetary measures of welfare and its distribution, and the description of the patterns of access to and use of social services, e.g. education and health care services. The participatory poverty assessment method is used to obtain information from some of the operators within the informal sector on their perception of the impact of their interaction with the formal sector operators (FOS 1999; Grootaert 1986; Valadez and Bamberger 1994).

A stratified sample method was used to select the respondents. To obtain an unbiased selection of samples, the study area was divided into 22 sample units (Oja oba, Gabari, Pataka, Oloje, Adewole, Taiwo, Gari Alimi, Niger, Tanke, Fate, Basin,Offa Garage, Maraba, Sango, Kunlede, Okelele, Okesuna, Oko Erin, Balogun Fulani, Gaa Akanbi and Baboko) based on proximity, ecological, socio-cultural and economic variations. In accordance with the sample units, the structured questionnaire was distributed to about 600 operators in the informal sector out of which only 480 responded.

The issues raised in the questionnaire include the background of the respondents, i.e. marital status, educational status, employment status, household size, income, total consumption-expenditure and nature of interaction and extend of interaction with the formal sector operators.

In line with most recent work on poverty, the poverty analysis in this study was based on a money metric measure of utility and welfare. For the measure of utility and welfare the total consumption-expenditure of each of the operators was used as a measure of welfare and for determining the poverty line. According to Aigbokhan (1997), Glewwe (1990), and Grootaert and Braithwaite (1998), the total consumption-expenditure is preferred to income because it is usually better reported in household budget surveys. Furthermore, there is an important theoretical consideration that expenditure better reflects long term permanent income and life cycle consumption pattern because it is usually stable and devoid of short-term fluctuations like income. Moreover, if expenditure data are used for welfare analysis they have the compelling advantage that the poverty line can be derived from the data themselves and need not be adopted from other surveys.

In determining the incidence of poverty (from which the influence of the interaction between the informal sector and formal sector is determined) a relative poverty line was set at two-thirds of the mean per-capita consumption-expenditure per adult equivalent[3] as proxy/index for the measure of household welfare in Ilorin Metropolis.

Having established a poverty line at N1288.00, 200 and 280 informal sector operators were identified as not being poor, and being poor, respectively. For the interaction between the informal sector and the formal sector operators, labour, technical, financial, goods and materials and equipment linkages were considered. (See Braun and Loayza 1994; Loayza 1994 and Laujouw 1998). The extent of these linkages is based on whether they are very much, much or not much; with scores such as 3 used for the highest linkage, 2 used for intermediate linkage and 1 used for little linkage assigned to each of the variables. These same scores thus become our dummy variables (dummy 3 for very much linkages, dummy 2 for much linkages; and dummy 1 for not much linkages, see Ijaiya 2002).

In the course of the analysis, a multiple regression analysis was used to test whether the linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector have any significant impact on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis.

The Model

In specifying the model, emphasis is placed on whether the linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector have any significant impact on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis.

Having stated this, the model is therefore formulated as

$$POVi = F(\text{Infor/forlink}) \text{ ---------- } (1)$$

$$\text{With Infor/forlink}[4] = F(FLi, FTi, FFi, FGRi, FEQi) \text{ ---------- } (2)$$

When equation (2) is substituted into equation (1) the equation thus gives a multivariate relationship:

$$POVi = F((FLi, FTi, FFi, FGRi, FEQi) \text{ ---------- } (3)$$

With a multiple transformed log-linear[5] relationship as:

$$\ln POVi = \pi_0 + \pi_1 \ln FLi + \pi_2 \ln FTi + \pi_3 \ln FFi + \pi_4 \ln FGRi + \pi_5 \ln FEQi + z \text{ ---------- } (4)$$

Where:

lnPOVi = Log of the poverty level of individual informal sector operator in Ilorin metropolis. Note that the poverty level is proxied by consumption-expenditure (per adult equivalent) of each operator, which is used as an index for household welfare.

lnFLi = Log of the extent of labour linkage between an individual informal sector operator and the formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis.

lnFTi = Log of the extent of technical linkage between an individual informal sector operator and the formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis.

lnFFi = Log of the extent of financial linkage between an individual informal sector operator and the formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis.

lnFGRi = Log of the extent of goods and raw material linkage between an individual informal sector operator and the formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis.

lnFEQi = Log of the extent of equipment linkage between an individual informal sector operator and the formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis.

π_0 = Intercept

$\pi_1, \pi^2 \ldots . \pi^5$ = parameter estimates associated with the influence of the linkages between an individual informal sector operator and the formal sector operators on the poverty level in Ilorin metropolis.

z = error term.

To estimate the model, a multiple linear regression analysis was used in order to reflect the explanatory nature of the variables. To verify the validity of the model, two major evaluation criteria were used: (i) the a priori expectation criterion which is based on the signs and magnitude of the co-efficient of the variables under investigation; and (ii) statistical criteria based on statistical theory, in other words referred to as the First Order Least Square Test consisting of *R*-square (R^2), *F*- statistic and *t*-test. The *R*-square (R^2) is concerned with the overall explanatory power of the regression analysis, the *F*-statistic is used to test the overall significance of the regression analysis and the *t*-test is used to test the significant contribution of the independent variables (Oyeniyi 1997).

Drawn from the model, our *a priori* expectations or the expected behaviour of the Log of the independent variables (lnFLi, lnFTi, lnFFi, lnFGRi, lnFEQi) on the dependent variable (lnPOVi) in the model are: lnFLi < 0; lnFTi < 0; lnFFi < 0; lnFGRi < 0; lnEQi < 0; thus indicating that the higher the extent of the interactions/linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector is expected to reduce the rate of poverty in Ilorin metropolis.

Empirical results and discussion

Socio-demographic characteristics of the respondents

The socio- demographic characteristics of the 480 informal sector operators included in the analysis are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Socio-demographic characteristics of the respondents

Characterisic	Percentage (%)
a. Age of the Respondent	
Below 30 years	12
31–40 years	62
41–50 years	22
Above 50 years	4
b. Marital Status	
Single	20.2
Married	70.8
Divorced/ Separated	-
c. Educational Status	
No Schooling	26
Primary	35
Secondary	19
Tertiary	20
Employment Status	
Informal Sector/ Farming	65
Organised Private Sector/ Informal Sector	14.2
Organised Public Sector/ informal Sector	20.6
Unemployed	-

Source: Authors' Computation.

The survey conducted on the operators in the informal sector in the study area indicates that 62 percent of the respondents fall within the age bracket 31-50 years, and 70.8 percent of them are married, while only 20.2 percent of them are single. About 35 percent of the operators had a minimum of

primary education, while 26 percent of them had no formal education. The survey conducted also indicates that 65 percent of them are engaged in informal sector activities and farming, while 14.2 percent and 20.6 percent are engaged in the organised private and public sectors respectively in addition to operating in the informal sector.

Regression results of the incidence of poverty and the linkages between the informal and formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis

The results of the regression analysis conducted at the 5 percent level of significance are presented in Table 3.

Table 3: Regression results of the incidence of poverty and the linkages between the informal and formal sector operators in Ilorin metropolis

Explanatory Variables and the Co-efficients or Parameter Estimates of the Variables	
Intercept	4.12
(t)	(126.1)
InFLi	-0.12
(t)	(-2.20)
InFTi	-0.10
(t)	(-13.1)
InFFi	0.51
(t)	(4.16)
InFGRi	-5.4
(t)	(-1.31)
InFEQi	-0.21
(t)	(-2.62)
R2	0.71
F	153.2
No. of Observations	280
Dependent Variable	POVi
The *t*-values are in parenthesis.	

A look at the model shows that the model is fairly good as it has an R^2 of 0.71 which in other words, means that 71 percent variation in the dependent variable (ln POVi) is explained by the explanatory variables, (lnFLi, lnFTi, lnFFi, lnFGRi, lnFEQi), while the error term takes care of the remaining 29 percent which are variables in the study that can not be included in the model because of certain qualitative features.

At the 5 percent level of significance, the *F*-statistic shows that the model is useful in determining if the independent variables (lnFLi, lnFTi,

lnFFi, lnFGRi, lnFEQi), have any significant influence on the dependent variable (ln POVi) as the computed *F*-statistic which is 153.2 is greater than the tabulated *F*-statistic (5, 280 degree of freedom) valued at 2.21.

In terms of the individual independent variables, the *t*-test at the 5 percent level of significance shows that all the independent variables with the exception of financial linkage have the expected signs, thus satisfying all our a priori expectations about the other independent variables in the model.

Discussion of the results

As is observed from the results, the linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector, with the exception of financial linkage, have a significant impact on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis. That the financial linkage provides a contrary result from what we expect is not without some reasons, which include among others the attitude of most formal sector financial institutions like the banks that usually find it difficult to make credit facilities available to the people operating in the informal sector. And even when the facilities are made available the conditions attached to them are usually stringent, thus depriving the people access to funds that could have improved their businesses and living condition.

That the other independent variables, like supply of goods, supply of raw materials, supply of equipment and the provision of technical assistance linkages, fulfilled our a priori expectations is not surprising given the role of the informal sector as a good channel of distribution of most goods provided by the formal sector factories and wholesale enterprises.

The above results also conformed to the observation of Herschbach (1989), where he said that given the linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector, the informal sector enterprises have become powerful distribution channels for the formal sector. They are therefore consciously or unconsciously engaged in advertising and sale promotion for the formal sector organisations thus creating greater awareness and consumption. With this, it will be seen that the informal sector activities are not simply 'what the poor do' but those activities which supply the needs of the poor and improve their living standards.

Drawn from the perception of some of the operators in the informal sector, with the exception of financial linkage, other linkages usually emerged on the bases of the goods/inputs and services produced and consumed by the operators in both sectors. The goods/inputs and services produced in both sectors are to some extent made possible by the interaction that exist between them in terms of the supply of labour, supply of goods and services, the provision of technical and the provision of raw materials and equipment.

With these linkages they are able to expand through lower inputs costs, profit invested back into the sector and technological changes which in the long run have helped in the development of the sector and in the improvement in their living standards in the sector in particular and in Ilorin in general.

Conclusion

An empirical analysis of the influence of the linkages between the informal sector and the formal sector on the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis was undertaken. The findings show that the linkages in terms of the supply of labour, the provision of technical services, the supply of raw materials and equipment, with the exception of the provision of finance, are inversely related to the incidence of poverty in Ilorin metropolis. These results indicate that the level of poverty experienced in the informal sector of Ilorin metropolis can be reduced with the continuous interactions between the informal sector operators and the formal sector operators.

This result notwithstanding, the government and policy makers should take into consideration measures such as capacity building, the reconciling and the converging of both sectors, most especially in the aspect of finance and macroeconomic stability, if the relationships between the informal sector and the formal sector is to be sustained or improved upon for continuous improvement in the living standards of the people in particular and the economic development of Ilorin in general.

Capacity building is a measure that requires the strengthening of the organisational and financial capacities of the informal sector operators in Ilorin so that they can act for themselves in the long run. As their capacity is strengthened their voices will begin to be heard and when their voices are heard there is no way they will be neglected by the government and not be included in the policy making and policy decisions that affect their operations and their lives.

Reconciling and converging the existing relationships between the informal sector and the formal sector is also important. The first step in this direction is the recognition of the informal sector by the government as an important catalyst in the nation's development process rather than a nuisance. When reorganised and encouraged, the informal sector enterprises in Ilorin would have the wherewithal to innovate and build themselves anew to meet the challenges and aspirations of the people working within the sector and the people that patronise them.

In addition to the above, the government should continue to guarantee stable macro-economic policies that would encourage low rates of inflation,

reform the existing credit policies and institutions by making them more flexible and liberal to the informal sector of Ilorin, and invest heavily in infrastructural services, such as water supply and electricity which are the most important infrastructural services required by most informal sector operators in the town. Government should also check and control corruption, most especially at the local government level where most of these operators are found operating.

Notes

1. See Fluitman (1989), Grey-Johnson (1992) and Hart (1973).
2. The World Bank provides $1 and $2 per day per person for core poor and moderate poor respectively. This method is also referred as Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), See World Bank (1993).

3. The formula for calculating consumption-expenditure per adult equivalent is a fraction of EXP and n(0.7)
   where:
   EXP = total household expenditure
   n = household size
   0.7 = exponential formulation representing other adults in a particular household.
4. Infor/forlinki stands for the linkages between an individual Informal sector operator and the formal sector operators.
5. The logarithmic transformation on both side of the equation (i.e. of the dependent variable and the independent variables) called double log-linear specification produces the best functional fit since it is used to avoid giving undue weight to some variables with extremely high scores.

References

Abumere, S.I., 1995, 'The Informal Sector in Nigeria's Development Process: Lessons from the Literature', *Development Policy Center Working Paper No.3*

Adedibu, A.A, 1988, 'Measuring Waste Generation in Third World Cities: A Case study of Ilorin, Nigeria', *Environmental Monitoring and Assessment*, Vol, 10 No 2:89-103.

African Development Bank (ADB), 2003, *Gender, Poverty and Environmental Indicators in African Countries*, Abidjan, ADB.

Aigbokhan, B.E, 1997, 'Poverty Alleviation in Nigeria: Some Macroeconomic Issues', in *Proceedings of the Nigerian Economic Society Annual Conference on Poverty Alleviation in Nigeria*, Ibadan, NES:181-210.

Braun, J. and Loayza, N.V, 1994, Taxation, Public Services, and the Informal Sector in a Model of Endogenous Growth', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* No 1334.

Central Bank of Nigeria, *Annual Report and Statement of Account*, Lagos, CBN.

Federal Office of Statistics (FOS), 1999. *Poverty Profile for Nigeria: 1980-1996*, Lagos, FOS.

Federal Office of Statistics, (Various issues), *National Household Consumer Survey*, Lagos, FOS.

Federal Office of Statistics (Various issues), *Annual Abstract of Statistics*, Lagos, FOS.

Foster, J., Greer, J.and Thorbecke, E, 1984, 'A Case of Decomposable Poverty Measures', *Econometrica*, Vol.52:761-765.

Francis P, Akinwumi, J.A., Ngwu P., Nkom S.A., Odili, J., Olamajeye J.A., Okunmadewa, F. and Shehu, D.J, 1996, 'State, Community and Local Development in Nigeria', *World Bank Technical Paper*, No 1440.

Fluitman, F., eds. 1989. Training for Work in the Informal Sector, Geneva, ILO.

Friedmann, J., 1996, 'Rethinking Poverty: Empowerment and Citizen Rights', *International Social Science Journal*, No. 148:161-172.

Glewwe, P., 1990, 'Improving Data on Poverty in the Third World: The World Banks Living Standards Measurement Study', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* No. 416.

Grey-Johnson, C, 1992, 'The African Informal Sector at the Crossroads: Emerging Policy Options', *Africa Development*, Vol. XVII: 65-92.

Grooteart, C, 1986, 'Measuring And Analysing Levels of Living in Developing Countries. An Annotated Questionnaire', World Bank Living Standards Measurements Study Working Paper, No 24.

Grooteart, C, and Braithwaite, J., 1998, 'Poverty Correlates and Indicator Based Targeting in Eastern Europe and Former Soviet Union', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper*, No 1942.

Hart, K., 1973, 'Informal Income Opportunities and Urban Employment in Ghana', *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, Vol.11, No.1: 61-89.

Herchbach, D.R., 1989. 'Training and the Urban Informal Sector: Some Issues and Approaches', in Fluitman, F., ed., *Training for Work in the Informal Sector*, ILO, Geneva.

Ijaiya, G. T., 2002, *The Role of the Informal Sector in Minimizing Poverty in Ilorin Metropolis*. Unpublished Ph.D Thesis, Department of Economics, Usmanu Dan Fodiyo University, Sokoto, Nigeria.

International Labour Organization (ILO), 1972, *Employment, Income and Inequality: A Strategy for increasing Employment in Kenya*, Geneva, ILO.

Kankwanda, M. L., Greogoire, H., Legros and H. Ouedraogo, 2000, *Poverty Eradication: Where Stands Africa*? London, Economical.

Lanjouw, P., 1998, 'Ecuador's Rural Non-farm Sector as a Route out of Poverty', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper*, No 1904.

Levy, S., 1991, 'Poverty Alleviation in Mexico', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* No.679.

Loayza, N.V., 1994, 'Labor Regulation and the Informal Economy', *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* No 1335.

Morgan, D., 1989, 'Micro Enterprises and their Role in the Development Process', *Courier* No. 115.

Narayan D., Peter R., Schaff K., Rademacher A., and Koch–Schulte S., 2000, *Voices of the Poor: Can Anyone Hear Us?* Oxford University Press, New York.

National Population Commission (NPC), 1993, *Population Census 1991: National Summary*, Lagos, NPC.

Oyeniyi,T.A., 1997, *Fundamental Principles of Econometrics*, Lagos, Ceder Publication Ltd.

Pearce, D., ed., 1992. *Dictionary of Modern Economics*, London, Macmillan.

Ravallion, M., 1996, 'Issues in Measuring and Modeling Poverty', *The Economic Journal* 106:1238-1343.

Sanyal, B., 1991, 'Organising the Self Employed: The Poverty of the Urban Informal Sector', *International Labour Review*, Vol 30 No.1 39-56.

Schubert, R., 1994, 'Poverty in Developing Countries: Its Definition, Extent and Implication', *Economics*, Vol 49/50: 17-40.

Stearns, K.E., 1988, 'Assisting Informal Sector Micro Enterprises', *Economic Impact*, No 63.

Trager, L., 1987, 'Re-examination of the Urban Informal Sector in West Africa', *Canadian Journal of African Studies*, Vol. 21 No 2:238-255.

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), 1998, *Nigeria: Human Development Report 1998*, Lagos, UNDP.

Valadez, J. and Bamberger, M., 1994, 'Monitoring and Evaluating Social Programmes in Developing Countries: A Handbook for Policy Makers, Managers and Researchers', *World Bank EDI Development Studies*, Washington D.C., The World Bank.

Von Hauff, M. and Kruse, B., 1994, 'Conceptual Bases for a Consistent Poverty-Oriented Policy', *Economics*, Vol. 49/50:41-55.

Wickware, D., 1998, 'The Shadow Economy', *Urban Age*, Vol 16, No 1: 5-6.

World Bank, 1993, *Implementing the World Bank's Strategy to Reduce Poverty: Progress and Challenges*, Washington D.C., World Bank.

World Bank, 2001, 'Attacking Poverty', *World Development Report 2000/2001*, New York, Oxford University Press.

Yahie, 1993, 'The Design and Management of Poverty Alleviation Projects in Africa: Evolving Guidelines Based on Experience', *World Bank EDI Human Resources Division*.

Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 103–113

(ISSN 0850-3907)

The Status of Yorùbá Dialects in Communicative Competence and Language Proficiency

Felix Abídèmí Fábùnmi*

Abstract

This paper attempts to explore the status of Yorùbá dialects in communicative competence and language proficiency. Dialectal identities are quite strong among the Yorùbá people; they form an integral part of sociolinguistic behaviour in any of the Yorùbá communities. So, during speech acts or communication, the centralised version of the language will invariably depict the native speaker's version as deviating from the so-called standardised rules of speaking. But such dialectal identities and expressions actually mirror the people's mind, most covertly when deciding the topics that are appropriate to a particular speech event. This is the essence of communicative competence. It is however discovered in this paper that such proficiency could not be enhanced among the Yorùbá people unless skilled dialectal knowledge is allowed to thrive. The Yorùbá people appear to have rather strong views on the appropriateness of their dialects in different situations. The work is conceptualised within the framework of Chomsky's 'states' of mind where the adult native speaker's knowledge is fully developed static competence. Our corpora are largely taken from various dialectal renditions and written texts. Oral and structured interviews were also conducted among Yorùbá language students and among Yoruba native speakers. This was decided in order to reduce introspection in diverse forms.

Résumé

Cet article tente d'analyser la situation des dialectes Yorùbá en matière de communication et de pratique linguistique. Les différences dialectales sont assez prononcées chez les Yorùbá. Celles-ci sont une partie intégrante du comportement sociolinguistique au sein de ces communautés. Ainsi, dans le cadre des actes de parole ou de communication, l'on prendra toujours comme référence la version

* Department of African Languages and Literatures, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria.

centralisée de la langue, en considérant que la version linguistique du locuteur natif est non conforme aux soi-disant règles standardisées de la langue concernée. Pourtant, ces identités et expressions dialectales reflètent l'esprit des populations concernées, en ce qui concerne la détermination des sujets appropriés à un acte de parole donné. Cela constitue l'essence même de la compétence communicative. Toutefois, cet article nous apprend qu'une telle compétence ne peut être mise en valeur chez les Yorùbá, à moins que l'on favorise la connaissance dialectale spécialisée. Les Yorùbá semblent avoir des opinions tranchées quant à l'adaptation de leur dialecte à différentes situations. Ceci est conceptualisé dans le cadre de 'states' of mind ("Etats" d'esprit) de Chomsky, dans lequel la connaissance du locuteur natif adulte constitue une compétence statique qui a été soumise à une certaine évolution. Nos sources proviennent, en grande partie, de diverses interprétations dialectiques, mais également de textes écrits. Des entretiens oraux et structurés ont également été menés au sein de groupes d'étudiants de langue Yorùbá et de locuteurs natifs Yoruba. Cette décision avait pour but de réduire toute forme d'introspection.

Introduction

Among the theoretical claims which Chomsky (1965:3–5) tries to establish is the fact that speakers of language are endowed with a kind of 'linguistic blueprint' in their heads; a system that enables them to distinguish what they know about language from what they do while speaking or listening. Chomsky proposes to term these linguistic abilities as 'Competence and Performance'. Competence is the 'speaker-hearer's knowledge of his language' while performance is the 'actual use of language in concrete situations' (Chomsky 1965:4). Moreover, formulating detailed descriptions of particular languages are but efforts geared towards developing a theory of language structure. Radford (1988:2) technically calls such structures 'grammars'. According to him, 'a grammar of a particular language will take the familiar form of a set of rules or principles which tell you how to "speak" and understand the language...' Dialects however are subdivisions of languages, and because they are varieties of language used by groups smaller than the total community of speakers of the language (Francis 1983: 1), they can be considered as parts by both the theories of Language Structure and Language Use; that is, Communicative Competence on the one hand, and that of Language Proficiency on the other. This is also in line with the view of Fishman (1972:17), who writes that 'language is a superordinate designation; dialect is a subordinate designation'. If dialects are traditionally recognised as varieties or subdivisions of languages, and if communicative competence and language proficiency are part of the factors involved in the knowledge of language, dialectal roles would be richly embedded and reveal. Recent literature on Yorùbá dialects is on

the increase because it helps scholars of the language re-appraise the existing theories and hypotheses on the grammar of the so-called standard Yorùbá language. In this paper, we review the status of Yorùbá dialects and examine how skilled dialectal knowledge could enhance communicative competence as well as language proficiency.

Theorising the knowledge of dialects

It is a palpable fact that language is uniquely human. And according to Traugott and Pratt (1980:1) 'the more we discover, the more mysterious and complex language appears to be'. One of such language complexities is its variability. Ethnic origin, sex, age, socio-economic status as well as education shape the lines of language variation. In some cases like the Yorùbá race in Nigeria and other parts of the world, rich culturally shared attitudes largely contribute to the language varieties. The aspects of mutual intelligibility and cultural development in language variation are recognised by Robins (1964:15). He says:

> ...structurally, the languages of people at different levels of cultural development are inherently different. Their vocabularies, of course, at anytime reflect fairly closely the state of the material and more abstract culture of the speakers; but languages are capable of infinite adjustment to the circumstances of cultural development...

An attempt to measure the degree of such inherent differences usually brings about variations in languages; and is eventually responsible for the existence of dialects. For instance, before the advent of the colonialists into the Yorùbáland, the Oyo Empire under the supremacy of the Alaafin of Oyo was firmly established. Similarly, the Oyo variety of the Yorùbá language was the favoured and prestigious variety. Speakers of this variety were socially approved as the 'powers that be'. It was still the case, as Oyelaran (1978:624–51) and Adetugbo (1982:207–24) have shown, that more than twenty-six varieties of the language existed at the time. Awobuluyi's (1998:2) recent classification of the Yorùbá dialects is even more detailed. Where Oyelaran and Adetugbo recognised three and four dialect subgroups respectively, Awobuluyi identifies five different Yorùbá dialect groupings. Since 1960s, however, many of these Yorùbá dialectal varieties function as indicators of people's identity and social status. A considerable number of the varieties have also become widely acceptable in Yorùbáland. Most radio and television programmes are now aired in different Yorùbá dialects, for example, greeting and exchange of pleasantries in Ìjèsà, Oyo, Ife, Igbomina dialects on Osun Radio, Nigeria. In some television and radio stations, news is broadcast in these dialects too. If every language has

aeons of changes, irretrievably lost to knowledge, we could as well affirm that only those that are retrievable enjoy dialectal attestations.

Following the principles of mutual intelligibility again, the various processes of change graduated into the dynamics of language variability, Yorùbá dialects inclusive. Since dialect is an abstraction of the same sort as language, it falls into successively larger groups of dialects, the largest groups being the language itself. More importantly linguistic theories try to emphasise that observable differences of vocabulary, grammar, pronunciation and speech acts are to be mixed and explicitly recognised within a linguistic domain before a variety of such a language could be said to be proficient. We overtly observe that in the case of Yorùbá language and its various varieties, the establishment of writing systems and standards of correctness (efforts towards attaining the so-called standard Yorùbá language, which Bamgbose [1966:2] describes as 'Koine') retard the focus of such linguistic theory. Nevertheless, the Oyo dialect, which is in itself a variety of the Yorùbá language, is the core of the standardisation.

Dialectal roles in language use

If language, according to linguists, is uniquely human, then human beings are born to talk by making use of intuitions. In sociolinguistics, language as an instrument of communication, and the various structures that control it, are focused. Traugott and Pratt (1980:310–11) list about eight factors that form the basis of this language role. These factors are: (i) type of speaker, (ii) type of addressee, (iii) topic of speech, (iv) genre, (v) medium, (vi) situation, (vii) degree of formality, (viii) type of speech act. We are mostly concerned with the first factor – variations through sex, age, education, socio-economic status, ethnic origin, etc. The reason is that they usually come into play whenever dialectal roles are examined in language use. Chomsky (1977:40) distinguished two types of competence: grammatical and pragmatic. If our competence is meant to express meanings in ways that are native-like, it could thus be formulated to enhance competence among various speakers of dialect. Linguistic theories traditionally and customarily select the speech of community dwellers as representing 'the dialect'. This prompted Chambers and Trudgill (1980:3–5) to vehemently disagree with the assertion that a dialect is substandard, low-status, often rustic form of language generally associated with the peasantry, the working class or other groups lacking in prestige ... a form of language spoken in more isolated parts of the world, which have no written form.

This opinion clearly negates the motivations for dialect study; it also underlines the ignorance and prejudice which cloud the subject. So,

competence tends to focus on meanings in ways which are native-like, and are expressed 'in more isolated parts of the world'. This is just dialectal enhancement.

Moreover, in Chomsky's grammatical competence, 'native speaker' is reflected in two types of intuitions. The first one is referred to as intuitions about sentence well formedness, while the second, intuitions about sentence structure. These are reflections of our understanding of the roles of dialects in language use. For instance, members of a community with a specified dialect could decide the plausibility and grammaticality of any of their utterances. They do not bother about the reactions of other people outside their community as long as they speak and get messages across to one another. It is only when non-members compare such utterance with theirs' and cannot decipher or decode the messages that we talk of linguistic standardisation. To the native speakers, any such principles of standardisation outside what he or she speaks negate his or her intuitions about sentence well-formedness. The Ìjèsà, Ònkò, and Ifè dialects of Yorùbá, to mention a few, reflect on this perspective and are represented by the following tokens:

	Ìjèsà Dialect	**Standard Yoruba**	**English**
1.	/usu/	isu	yam
2.	/ulé/	ilé	house
3.	/mo mí susɛ /	Mo sisé	I am working
	Ònkò Dialect		
4.	/itsɛ nɛɛ tsòro itse/	Isé náà sòro se	The task is difficult.
5.	/nnkɛ tse ɛ /	Nnkan se o	Something must be wrong with you
	If'è Dialect		
6.	/òdòdó náà rè mí/	Òdòdó náà wù mí	I admire the flower.

In Ìjèsà dialect, for instance, the short back close rounded vowel /u/ features very prominently in initial positions of their words as in (1) and (2) above – /**usu**/, /**ulé**/. The standard Yorùbá disallows its usage, it features /i/ short front close spread vowel instead – /**isu**/, /**ilé**/. Again, in (3) above, /mí/ is the marker for the progressive aspect in Ìjèsà dialect – as against /n/ used in standard Yorùbá. Some other Yorùbá dialects also use /**mí**/ as the progressive marker. The Ònkò dialect also features palato-alveolar affricate sound /ts/ in their words as in (4) and (5) above; whereas it is the use of alveolar fricative sound /s/ that is found in the standard Yorùbá. The Ifè

dialect again prefers using /**rè**/ (admire) to /**wù**/ (admire) that is commonly used in the standard version of the language as shown in (6) above. There are many examples.

Radford (1988:4) stresses that 'these intuitions about sentences span four different aspects of language'. We can therefore generalise by stating that the speakers of these dialects have phonological, morphological, syntactic as well as semantic competence which are reflected in their intuitions about the well-formedness and structure of sentences in their various dialects. This being the case, we would also strongly affirm that whenever the well-formedness in these dialects is being re-ordered to suit the dictate of linguistic standardisation (as the case of the Yorùbá dialects), the speaker-hearer's knowledge of his language which is explicitly fundamental to the theories of language structure and language use, is being denied. This, we will call linguistic prejudice.

Yorùbá dialects via communicative competence

We adopt the assertion of Wolfson (1983:61) on the sociolingustic perspective of communicative competence. He asserts that communicative competence entails

> knowing when it is appropriate to open a conversation and how, what topics are appropriate to particular speech-events, which forms of address are to be used, to whom and in which situations, and how such speech acts as greetings, compliments, apologies, invitations and complements are to be given, interpreted and responded to.

Although communicative competence captures other concepts that aid human understanding of the hypothesis of language structure and use, grammatical, sociolinguistic, discourse, vocabularies, semantics, etc, Wolfson's assertion above reveals in its entirety the focus of communicative competence. Again, following Chomsky's mentalist analysis of 'language as a mirror of the mind', the most overt and even covert means through which the Yorùbá people mirror their mind is through the use of their dialects. Through it, their means of communication, social identities and sacred cultural beliefs and practices are revealed. For instance, a Yorùbá man will first and foremost see himself as an Ìjèsà man or Ìjèbú man or Òyó man or Ìgbómìná indigene, etc, before honouring the generalised identity – a Yorùbá man. Up till today, an Òndó man would not call himself a Yorùbá. He is Òndó. He only conceives of Òyó/Òsun as such. No wonder there were fierce internecine wars in all parts of Yorùbáland before the advent of the colonialist. Such dialectal identity affects their communicative competence, a term which we

believe summarily refers to the rules of speaking. It forms an integral part of sociolinguistic behaviour in any speech community.

When dialect mirrors people's mind 'negatively' during any speech act, the rules of speaking of such people are being revealed. For instance, courtesy demands politeness among the Yorùbá people especially when somebody is invited to contribute to an on-going debate. Here they will say

7. Òyó E bá wa dá sí òrò yíì (please contribute to this debate)
   Sábe Ìwo kò gbénu sí òrò náà, ó yá ìwo náà, gbénu sí òrò náà.
   (Why don't you too put your mouth in his debate, you should)
8. Ifè É làá bá ni dá sòrò ín.
   (You too should contribute to this debate)

Although the Sabee people do not intend to be abusive following their own manner of invitation; yet to others, it is not appropriate. Similarly, the Ìjèsà people are known to be fond of raining curses on an opponent during any feud, misunderstanding or disagreement:

9. Ìjèsà Lùkúlùkú lá a pa
   (Smallpox shall kill you)

Although Ìjèsà people usually de-emphasise the efficacy of such curses as a mere sign of anger (the opponent can even be their own son or kinsmen), yet to others the efficacies and potencies of curses remain effective under whatever circumstances. In addition, among the Yorùbá people during speech acts like greetings, the use of honorific language is very prominent. This is majorly demonstrated in their pronouns:

10. B̌àbá mi e fún mi lówó.
    (My father, give me some money)
11. E káàbò mòmó wa.
    (Welcome, our mother)

Linguistically speaking, the vowel /e/ in the examples above should represent the second person plural pronoun, whereas it only functions as honorific constituent in the sentences. In contrast however, researchers have shown that the Ijesa dialect does not mark the use of honorific expressions:

12. y Mo kí i yín kábíyèsí oba wa Gabriel Owa Obòkun
13. Ìjèsà Mo kí o kábíyèsí oba Gabriel Owa Obòkun
    (Royal greetings to you our king Gabriel the Owa Obokun)

Although such Ijesa greetings literally render all regards, honours and exaltations to the king, yet the other Yorùbá people would prefer the use of honorific pronoun marker: *yín* instead of *o*. In contradiction to the Ònkò speakers who are fond of using /ts/ consonant, the Ìbàdàn dialect is known for the sole use of /s/ sound; they always substitute it for /s/ sound:

14. Omo Ìbàdàn kí ni 'so'?
Eran 'síkìn' ni a je lánàá.
(Ìbàdàn sons, what is the show?
We ate chicken meat yesterday)

These behavioural patterns are peculiar to each compact dialectal community. Yet, they are only following their own specified rules of speaking which is the essence of communicative competence. So, Wolfson's criteria reflect and mirror the minds of the Yorùbá people through their dialects.

Yorùbá dialects via language proficiency

In order to describe the usage of Chomsky's competence (pragmatic and grammatical) in the act of communication, a psycholinguistic perspective needs to be examined. We gain the crux of such analysis in the concept of language proficiency. Language Proficiency is performance-oriented and it takes into cognisance the ability to use language. Since language proficiency differs from the concept of communicative competence in terms of performance, the Yorùbá dialectal roles in it will be reviewed through data analysis. Following Richards (1985:146), language proficiency is 'defined not with references to knowledge, or competence, but with reference to performance, that is, to how language is used. It is defined with reference to specific situations, purposes, tasks and communicative activities such as using conversation for face to face social interaction, listening to a lecture, or reading a college textbook'. We will adopt Richards's definitions of language proficiency by examining the dialect attitudes of some Yorùbá students in a tertiary institution. This, we believe, will determine the status of the Yorùbá dialects in language proficiency.

Data

Corpora for the analysis are drawn from the results of both open (ethnographic) and structured questionnaire interviews conducted with Yorùbá language students at the Department of African Languages and Literatures, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria. Since a speaker's attitudes towards his or her dialect enhance proficiency, we can discover their dialect choice in specific socio-linguistic situations; that is, the variety that functions best in a given situation.

Analysis

Several factors are taken into consideration when determining a person's speaking proficiency, but we emphasise functions, contents and accuracy in accessing the dialect proficiency of these students. We discovered that the dialect proficiency among these Yorùbá language students achieves the basic functions of language in a number of different linguistic settings. We administered questionnaires to a total number of one hundred and twenty seven undergraduates. Questions like 'Can you speak your dialect?' were asked to assess their fluency. To assess their comprehension, we asked, 'Do you understand your dialect?' In determining their vocabulary, questions like 'To what extent do you speak your dialect with your friends or colleagues, parents or relatives, husband or wife or fiancé or marital friends, etc?' were asked. Other questions asked included 'Do you like your dialect?'. 'To what extent do you speak your dialect in school?'; 'If you are being interviewed on radio or television programme conducted in Yorùbá, would you like to speak your dialect?'; and so on.

Findings

The assessment of the speaking proficiency in the Yorùbá dialects among these undergraduate students varies according to the type of subskills involved. It is observed that the level of fluency, comprehension, vocabulary, etc, of each of them contributed to our understanding of the role of dialect in language proficiency. In the first instance, we should not be unmindful of the fact that these are Yorùbá language students, that is, they are much more familiar with the standardized version of the language. Yet this does not, in the least, hinder their dialectal fluency. Nearly all of them (except eight) claimed that they could fluently speak their dialects. Whereas all of them claimed that they do understand their dialects, these eight students could not speak their dialects fluently yet when others spoke, they understood. It is, however, deduced that the speaking proficiency of these students is highly influenced by formal settings. They appeared to have strong views on the appropriateness of their dialects in different situations. They are conscious of the specific socio-linguistic situations, that is, the awareness that one variety of the language rather than another is used for certain functions and or on certain occasions. So, the factors like functions, contents, and accuracy come into play. These formal settings embrace the language of specialised information, that is, the language of higher education or specialised formal training. This gives credence to the officially 'imposed' standard Yorùbá. Where the relationships are most formal, they are less likely to speak dialects.

Moreover, we discovered that in the most informal relations, these students most often speak their dialects, most especially when dealing with kinsmen, parents or marital friends, etc, at home. These formal and informal settings are the type of sub-skills that varied the proficiency of these students. Our discovery is in line with Richards (1985) who claims that language proficiency is 'defined with reference to specific situation, purpose, task ...social interaction, listening to lecture...' The Yorùbá dialects play prominent roles in the acquisition of language proficiency among these students; their dialects are part of the component of communication; the type of communicative settings they find themselves will only dictate their level of proficiency.

Pedagogical implications

We opine that every dialectal variety of Yorùbá is in itself the legitimate form of the language. This is because each of the varieties contributes, in one form or the other, to the well-formedness of the language. And following Chomsky, if a native speaker's grammatical competence is reflected in intuition forming the basis of the communicative competence, then the status of the dialectal variability should be considered in language teaching and learning. Perceptions of the roles of dialect in language use depict that only native speakers can decide only on the grammaticality of their utterances. For instance, no matter how proficient, non-natives like Europeans find it linguistically difficult to pronounce correctly the implosive sound /gb/ as in /gbogbo/ (all) found in Yorùbá. As a result, words like /gbogbo/ (all), /ìgbò/ (a tribe in Nigeria) are wrongly pronounced /bobo/ and /ìbò/. Europeans find it difficult because they use a pulmonic egressive instead of glottalic ingressive airstream. The implication of this is that both the so-called standard and dialect grammars are now co-existing. So, there is the need for a more structured approach to Yorùbá language teaching and learning.

Moreover, dialects act as one of the components of language proficiency. The end result of language acquisition by children is to be able to use it, especially in adulthood. We find that the Yorùbá people are conscious of the specific sociolinguistic situations by choosing the variety that functions best in a given situation. Dialect usage is frequently and fluently utilised in non-formalised settings. This they observe in consonance with the dictate of the linguistic prejudice of the so-called standard Yorùbá. Still, each dialect is a distinct, prestigious and legitimate form of the Yorùbá language. Both the standardised form and the so-called dialects should be viewed as 'a lect within the cluster'.

Conclusion

This study has attempted to explore and illustrate the linguistic positions of Yorùbá dialects in relation to the thematic approach of both communicative competence and language proficiency. The study believes that the native-speakers' linguistic intuitions enhance their communicative competence in expressing meanings given to their various dialectal utterances. Perfecting such utterances according to the context of standardisation will only negate their intuitions about sentence well-formedness. Again, since language proficiency is performance-oriented, the dialect choice of Yorùbá people in specific socio-linguistic situation is usually carefully chosen to function best in any given situation.

References

Adetugbo, A., 1982, 'Towards a Yorùbá Dialectology,' in *Yorùbá Language and Literature*, ed., Adebisi Afolayan, Ile-Ife: University Press Limited, pp. 207–224.

Bamgbose, A., 1966, *A Grammar of Yorùbá*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Chambers, J.K., and Trudgill, P., 1980, *Dialectology*, London: Oxford University Press.

Chomsky, N., 1965, *Aspects of the Theory of Syntax*, Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press.

Chomsky, N., 1977, *Essays on Form and Interpretation*, New York: North Holland.

Chomsky, N. 1995., 'Language and Nature', *Mind*, Vol. 104, N° 413, pp. 1-62.

Fabunmi, F.A., 1998, 'Tense, Aspects and Modal System in Ijesa Dialect', M.A. Dissertation, Department of African Languages and Literatures, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria.

Fishman, J.A., 1972, *The Sociology of Language*, The Hague: Mouton.

Francis, W.N., 1983, *Dialectology: An Introduction*, London: Longman Group Limited.

Oyelaran, O., 1978, 'Linguistic Speculations on Yorùbá History', Department of African Languages and Literatures Seminar Series 1, ed., O.O. Oyelaran, Ife University Press Limited, pp. 624-651.

Petyt, K. M., 1983, *The Study of Dialect: An Introduction*, London, Andre Deutsch.

Radford, A., 1988, *Transformational Grammar*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Richards, J.C., 1985, *The Context of Language Teaching*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Robins, R.H., 1964, *General Linguistics: An Introductory Survey*, London: Longman Group Limited.

Traugott, E.C., and M.L. Pratt., 1980, *Linguistics for Students of Literature*, New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Wolfson, N., 1983, 'Rules of Speaking', in J. C. Richards and R. W. Schmidt, eds., *Language and Communication*, London: Longman, pp. 61-87.


Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 114–130

(ISSN 0850-3907)

Mothers in the Informal Economy and Changes in Child Feeding and Caring Roles in Kampala, Uganda

Innocent Najjumba Mulindwa

& James P.M. Ntozi*

Abstract

The paper examines the child feeding and caring practices of mothers in an informal economy in Kampala City, using qualitative data collected in 1996. It was found that the supplementary feeding of children in this context started as early as three weeks despite the widespread belief among mothers that full breast feeding should go on up to at least three months. This action was justified in terms of insufficient milk, working away from home, maternal illness, increased appetite of the child, sex of the child, child illness and contraception. This discussion, therefore, explores the ways in which, due to financial constraints, relatives as childcare providers are normally relied on heavily by working mothers.

Résumé

Cet article s'intéresse aux pratiques en cours concernant l'alimentation et les soins assurés par les mères, dans le secteur informel, à Kampala, en Ouganda. L'analyse est basée sur des données qualitatives collectées en 1996. L'étude révèle que dans ce cas de figure, l'alimentation complémentaire des enfants commence dès les trois semaines de celui-ci, même s'il est établi que l'alimentation exclusive au sein doit être pratiquée au moins jusqu'aux trois mois de l'enfant. Les raisons invoquées étaient l'insuffisance de lait, les activités pratiquées loin du domicile, les maladies maternelles, une augmentation de l'appétit du nourrisson, le sexe de l'enfant, les maladies infantiles et la contraception. Cette contribution montre bien la dépendance des mères actives envers les membres de leur famille qu'elles chargent de prendre soin de leurs enfants.

---

* Department of Population Studies, Institute of Statistics and Applied Economics, Makerere University, Uganda.

Introduction

The pattern of women's work in the developing world has changed in the recent past. Increased urbanisation, industrialisation, poverty and migrations have caused greater numbers of women to seek income generating employment away from home (Oppong 1993). There is, therefore, a genuine need in most low-income households for mothers to earn income at the same time as they are bearing and raising children. The shift to wage employment away from home, however, makes it difficult for working mothers to combine work-related aspects and proper feeding and childcare. This outcome is because the work environment and nature of work do not warrant easy compatibility of the two roles of worker and mother. The dimensions of the crisis for working women regarding how to cope with the feeding and caring needs of young children goes largely unrecognised and unanswered – particularly in terms of workplace design and supportive aspects. The emphasis in large-scale studies has been on number of children born rather than on the qualitative issues of modes of caring. Yet it is the latter which is of paramount importance for the outcomes in terms of child survival, development and investment in human resources.

In Uganda, the increasing participation of women in employment outside the home can mainly be attributed to the worsening economic situation and the ever increasing cost of living, which have marginalised women's incomes, especially the earnings from agricultural produce (Asowa-Okwe 1993). According to the Household Budget Survey (HBS) for 1989-90, 30.6 percent of the urban women in Uganda were in the labour force, of which 7.5 percent, 1.3 percent, and 20.4 percent were involved in agriculture, industries, and services respectively. By 1992, the percentage of women in the labour force of women had risen to 42.8 percent in the urban centres, of whom 28 percent were in service sector, and 10.4 percent and 1.8 percent in the agricultural and industrial sectors respectively (The World Bank 1995).

Of great concern however is not the increased participation of women in the market economy per se, but the increasing number of working mothers, for whom employment and family responsibilities are spatially separated. The incompatibility of the two roles of mother and worker is likely to arise because of new role expectations as well as changing opportunities and resource constraints (Oppong and Abu 1985).

Traditionally, women's roles as mothers focus on their activities as bearers, nurses and socialisers of the next generation, while their occupational roles may be defined in terms of context, activities and

functions. One can thus say that a woman's ability to cope with an occupational role as well as child rearing depends partly on the context, flexibility and formality of the occupation. This makes the relationship between women's work and child rearing practices worth studying because the resultant conflicts between the two aspects often tend to disfavour proper child rearing practices. It implies an increased use of artificial milk and a more restricted use of breast feeding. In addition, mothers have to find alternative childcare while at work which may take the form of housemaids, daycare centres, siblings, relatives and neighbours.

A number of studies have pointed out the lack of an inverse relationship between women's participation in the labour force and fertility, childcare and other domestic work in non-Western cultures (Lloyd 1990, Caldwell 1982). The major reason often cited is the prevalence of extended families in which grand mothers, older siblings, co-wives or other adults substitute for the mother in caring for the children. However, the extent to which extended kin members are actually available as childcare substitutes in urban areas of the third world today may be overstated. For example, Fapohunda (1982) reports that in Nigeria, this kind of support system is breaking down because aged parents are reluctant to stay in cramped, strange, urban environments when they have more comfortable options in villages. In addition, co-wives today live in separate houses and are also employed outside the home. The study further points out that it is only to a limited extent that urban families send their children to be raised by rural relations. Also declining is the residential pattern whereby poorer relatives are sent to help with childcare in the urban kins' homes. Even in the presence of housemaids, the mother of small children is forced to spend long hours away from her job sitting in line in overcrowded health clinics. The situation in Uganda, particularly in Kampala, is not any different. The growing urban child-care dilemma has led to the demand for commercial day care centres in Kampala (Najjumba and Sentongo 1994).

The relationship between women's work and childcare has been a subject of great interest in population studies. It is well known that the level and pattern of women's labour force activity is affected by the need for childcare, since women, not men, are almost always responsible for childcare. Childcare responsibilities therefore are an important factor facilitating women's ability to balance productive and reproductive roles. Some women stay out of the labour force altogether, while others take up work that can more easily be combined with child care because it is near or at home, has flexible or part time hours, or allows the child to be cared for at work (Connelly et al. 1991; Church 1978).

The availability of individuals who assume childcare roles is a function of many factors. One of these factors is composition and size of the residential domestic group, with socio-cultural norms and values determining the intra-household sharing and delegation of child care responsibilities among mother, spouse, older and younger children, grand parents, hired helpers, and other relatives who may come to live with the family (Oppong 1991). It is important to note however, that kin networks appear to be weaker in the urban areas of Uganda as is the case elsewhere, making it less likely that relatives will take on care giving roles. It is against this background that this paper attempts to address the child feeding and caring practices of mothers in the informal economy in Kampala.

The informal economy in Uganda

In Uganda, the major activities in the informal economy include food processing, trading, metal fabrication, carpentry making, handicrafts, construction, repairing vehicles and working in restaurants (Manpower Planning Department Uganda 1989). These activities in most cases employ less than five persons, predominantly owned by family members, using labour intensive methods, with simple management systems and minimum documented controls. In addition, the technical know-how and operational skills required are frequently obtained outside the formal education system. The purpose of selecting the informal sector for the study is mainly twofold. First, by virtue of their low status, most of the women who are engaged in employment outside the home are absorbed into the informal economy because of the easy entry into the sector and the flexibility of the activities therein. Secondly, informal sector workers have no institutional protection such as paid maternity leaves or sick leaves, which makes the group distinct and worth studying. Unlike the formal economy, there are no stipulated regulations governing informal sector workers with regard to maternity leave or salary benefits while on leave. While the work in the informal sector seems to have flexible schedules, the work environment does not warrant childcare while at work. This is because either the operational area of informal activities is too small or the hygiene too poor and thus a health hazard to the children. These two aspects necessitated the formulation of bye-laws prohibiting mothers working in the markets from bringing children under five years old with them to work.

Methodology

The data on which this paper is based were collected in a qualitative study, which was conducted among informal sector mothers in Kampala in 1996.

Study participants had to have children who were under two years of age. This is because children in this age group have particular nutritional needs, due to the combined effects of rapid growth and a high prevalence of infectious diseases (Leslie and Buvinic 1989). Second, most Ugandan women do not breast feed beyond two years (Uganda Statistics Department and Macro International 1996). The data were generated in two phases. The first phase used key informants (KIs), and data collected from focus group discussions (FGDs) formed the second phase. These qualitative methods were used because they enable observation, open discussion and an in-depth understanding of the problem under investigation.

In-depth interviews were held with Key Informants (KIs) who were selected on the basis of occupation, child-rearing experience, age and willingness to be a respondent. These women were selected from the four most common informal sector activities, in which women dominate, namely: market vending, shop proprietorship, tailoring, and hairdressing. The locations where the respondents were drawn were Kalerwe market area, Kiyembe, Luwum Street, Wandegeya, and William Street. Informants from each of the above mentioned occupational categories were identified primarily on the basis of having at least one child who was under two years, and having been involved in the activity for more than two years. For each pair of informants, one member had to be less than 24 years while the second one had to be 25 and above, in order to cater for differentials in child rearing experience arising from age differences. These helped in the identification of the important aspects concerning these particular activities with respect to methods of obtaining products together with marketing, child rearing experience, role conflict and/or compatibility together with coping mechanisms normally adopted.

Five focus group discussions (FGDs) of eleven members each were conducted (1 in Kiyembe market, 2 in Nakasero market, and 2 in Owino market). The first focus group served as a pilot group, which enabled the researchers to assess the success and usefulness of the information that was to be generated from the focus groups. The choice of Nakasero and Owino markets was a result of these two places being the hubs of women involved in small petty trade and market activities. In addition, the concentration of women in these two particular work places was an advantage in the formation of focus groups. Age of mothers and type of activity/occupation were the criteria used in the organisation of the focus groups, and these were arrived at after regular visits, observations and consultations with the women representatives of both markets.

The first two focus group discussions were held in Nakasero market, which is popularly known for its specialisation in both fresh and dry foodstuffs. Focus group 1 (FGD1) consisted of mothers in the age bracket 15–24 while mothers who were aged 25 years and above formed the second focus group (FGD2). Owino market, however, is more diversified in activities, and women there mainly engage in trade in second hand items like clothes, shoes, handbags, etc., together with the preparation (cooking) and serving of food and drinks to the entire market population. From observation, vendors of second hand items are relatively older than those involved in food preparation. Based on this, FGD3 comprised of older mothers (25 years and above) who were vendors of second hand items, while FGD4 was formed by young mothers who were selling cooked food/drinks in the market.

The study findings

The findings presented in the sections that follow focus on child feeding and caring practices of the index child together with compatibility of worker and mother roles.

Breast feeding

Full breast feeding is defined as a situation whereby a child's only source of nutrition or food is breast milk. Included under this definition is exclusive breast feeding (feeding the child on only breast milk) and almost exclusive breast feeding (occasional tastes of ritual foods or water) (Labbok et al 1990). It is worth noting that in most cultures in, particularly, Africa, a number of liquids may be given in the form of sugared water, herbal teas, honey water mixtures, ghee, mushroom infusion, paps, etc., as early as one month of age (King and Ashworth 1987). In the light of the above, 'full breast feeding' was used in the study to accommodate both exclusive and almost exclusive breast feeding (where children also receive water, juice or traditional herbal mixtures in very little amounts of around two to three teaspoons per day), which is also very common in most Ugandan societies.

In the study, mothers were asked to state the ideal period in months within which children should be fully breast fed and there seemed to a be a consensus that this should be between 3 to 4 months. However, almost all of them reported not to have done so. Respondents were thus requested to supply information about factors responsible for their early initiation of supplementary feeds to the children's diet. The common factors mentioned were: insufficient breast milk, working away from home, maternal illness, growth pattern and sex of the children as reflected in the appetite, child's illness and contraception.

Insufficient breast milk emerged as the most important factor in all focus group discussions, which governed the mothers' decision to terminate full breast feeding. It was reported that this normally leads to an inadequate food intake for the child, thus making mothers introduce other foods to supplement the breast milk. Reflections of this practice can be found in the following statements:

> In most cases, you realise that you no longer have adequate breast milk to satisfy the baby. So, you end up introducing supplements (Respondent FGD1).
>
> I cannot fully breast feed for more than one and half months because I do not have sufficient milk for the baby (Respondent FGD3).
>
> I cannot produce adequate breast milk for the baby 3 weeks after birth. So, I introduce supplements before the end of the first month (Respondent, FGD2).
>
> I have very little milk and therefore cannot fully breast feed for more than 1 month (Respondent FGD4).

In general terms, the mother's perception of the adequacy of her own milk appears to be a prime determining factor in the decision to begin supplementation. Karamagi (1985) explains that early introduction of solids into an infant's diet impairs the mothers' lactation by decreasing the appetite of the infant and thus the vigour in stimulating the nipple to elicit prolactin and milk let-down reflexes. He thus observes that early weaning of children (introduction of supplements) may be a cause rather than a 'cure' for insufficient milk.

Related to the above reason is the mothers' working away from home. The participants felt that working away from home deprives them of the ability to access their children whenever they wanted so that they could fully breast feed on demand. The following are some of the statements that were made by some participants in the focus group discussions:

> I only breast fed fully for 3 weeks because I had to resume work (Respondent FGD3).
>
> I normally breast feed fully for 2 months because I am an employee (Respondent FGD4).
>
> I breast fed my second last born fully for 3 months because I was not working. But the one I have now, I only breast fed him for 1 month because I had to go back to work (Respondent FGD4).

Another reason to explain the early introduction of supplemental foods by mothers, which featured in all focus groups, is the children's appetite and growth pattern. Participants felt that children who have a very high appetite (which is normally the case with fast developers) easily lose interest in breast milk thus leading to early initiation of supplements. An

element of sex preference was observed in the course of this discussion, with most participants expressing the view that boys cannot feed on breast milk alone for more than a month. It was claimed that boys need early supplementation because of their high appetite and growth pattern compared to girls. This was echoed in statements such as the following:

> If it is a baby boy, he has to start eating other foods at an early age because of his appetite (FGD2 Woman 6).
>
> Some children, particularly boys have such high appetite that you just need to initiate supplements very early in their diet (Respondent FGD1).

Other factors which came up include sickness of the mother such that she could not get sufficient milk to fully breast feed. Other respondents said that their children were given supplemental foods by other family members without the mothers' knowledge. In so doing, children started liking other foods in addition to breast milk. An example of this phenomenon can be found in the following statement:

> Baby sitters normally give supplements and solids to our children very early, around 2 months without our knowledge; particularly when the child is of the type that cries a lot (Respondent FGD1).

A child's illness was also mentioned as one of the reasons that could induce mothers to introduce supplements early in a child's life in the belief that the child would recover faster. At times the sick child refuses to breast feed and forces the mother to use supplements. Also some mothers maintained that breast milk alone may lead to child illnesses. For example, two mothers said:

> If a child falls sick, you cannot continue breast feeding it fully. You just need to introduce supplements. I have experienced this and I know what it means (Respondent FGD2).
>
> Breast milk makes my children develop diarrhoea. So, I cannot fully breast feed for more than 3 weeks (Respondent FGD2).

There was general consensus among the respondents that contraception and breast feeding were incompatible. It is believed that contraceptives, particularly oral pills, can lead to insufficient breast milk, thus leading to the shorter duration of full breast feeding. One of the participants in the focus group discussions said:

> I normally give up full breast feeding at 2 months because of contraception. Pills normally reduce my supply of breast milk, and I have to introduce supplements once I start contraception (Respondent FGD3).

An observation made in the course of the group discussion was that mothers were unaware of any difference between breast milk and any other milk or infant formula. To respondents, the introduction of other forms of milk to the child's diet was the same as actual breast feeding. One participant echoed this belief by saying

> I always stop full breast feeding early (around 1 month) and I introduce cow's milk to the child because it is actually the same as breast milk (Respondent FGD3).

Prolonged breast feeding

The study probed mothers' perceptions about advantages of prolonged breast feeding to both mother and child, the ideal period within which a child should be fed on the breast, and the problems of early weaning. There was a consensus among respondents that a child who is breast fed for a long time develops much faster than one who is breast fed for a short period; and that breast milk increases the child's intellectual capabilities, which may later be reflected in the child's performance at school. Some also mentioned the reduction in the incidence of disease but only after a probe. The following sample of statements illustrates:

> A child who is breast fed for long develops much faster and swiftly goes through every stage of development – e.g walking, talking and even performing well at school (Respondent FGD3).
>
> Prolonged breast feeding increases a child's intellect. In most cases, such a child would perform well in school which would be of great benefit to the parents (Respondent FGD2).

With respect to problems associated with early termination of breast feeding on the part of the childmong, most respondents gave as reasons the increased incidence of disease, increased crying of children causing great disturbance for the mother, and loss of appetite and at times general failure of the child to adjust to a breast milk-free diet.

For the mother, the only advantage of prolonged breast feeding mentioned in both focus group discussions and in-depth interviews was delayed pregnancy because of the contraceptive benefits of lactation. Most of the younger participants aged 15-24 mentioned between 12 and 18 months, while older participants cited 24 months and over as the ideal period within which a child should be breast fed. Cow's milk was the most popular milk given to children, while food included mashed potatoes and beans mixed with milk and margarine.

Child care arrangements while away from home

It was observed in the course of interviews and discussions with the respondents that almost all participants relied on relatives, rather than maids, as providers of care to children while the mothers were at work. These normally included younger sisters, nieces and sisters-in-law. A few women mentioned their own mothers as baby caretakers.

The high costs of maintaining maids ranked as the most important reason for not using maids as providers of childcare. Other reasons were the dishonesty of the maids, and the lack of adequate space in homes to accommodate the maids. Samples of the statements from focus group participants included:

> I cannot afford to take on a house maid because her wage is expensive yet I do not pay anything to the relatives with whom I leave my children (Respondent FGD1).
>
> House maids are expensive. One has to pay them every month, which is not the case with relatives. The latter are your own people and thus do not ask for any payment (Respondent FGD3).
>
> Unless you have a spacious room, it is hard to stay with a maid in small houses like the ones in which we stay (Key informant Wandegeya).

The women however pointed out that relying on relatives also has its problems with the free child care service notwithstanding. Some of the problems included not being able to give proper and explicit instructions on how you want your child to be cared for, and also a relative might have her own problems making it difficult for her to look after someone else's child.

In her study on market women in Kampala, Davis (1997) found that the economic burden of supporting an extra person in the household (baby sitter) was a serious and stressful aspect regarding childcare arrangement for mothers. This is made worse by most mothers lacking enough money as capital to restart their businesses after child delivery.

When probed on whether spouses provide any assistance in relation to child care, all respondents and discussants pointed out that they receive mainly financial assistance in form of 'buying things needed by children at home', 'paying medical bills of the child when sick', and 'buying milk and food for children'. The women however complained of the inadequacy of the assistance rendered by some spouses. This is not surprising because childcare is a woman's role in most of the African societies. A man's parental responsibilities are mainly assessed in terms of financial provisions towards aspects like health care costs when the child is sick and material goods like clothes. This can be confirmed by findings of a

study carried out on market women in Kampala. The study respondents mentioned the specific household items that a husband was expected to provide at the minimum and these included: clothes for the family, particularly children, paying school fees, and paying for medical treatment (Davis 1997).

Self-executed child caring tasks

The participants were asked about the child caring tasks that they normally undertook by themselves. The tasks mothers reported to prefer to do for themselves were: feeding the baby, preparing food like porridge for the baby, cleaning the cups and other feeding items, preparing clothes and whatever the baby is going to use for the day, etc. One respondent said:

> I always believe that any responsible mother should be directly in charge of what the child will put on for the day and food and drinks that will be given to the child while one is away (Key informant, Kalerwe).

This is evidence that much as mothers are engaged in productive activities outside the home, they still feel obliged to carry out maternal roles and responsibilities particularly those that enhance the welfare of their children. In her findings on ordering of daily activities by market women in Kampala, Davis (1997) reveals that preparing the baby's breakfast ranked very high on their childcare agenda.

Child fostering

Participants were further introduced to the subject of child fostering in an effort to establish the desirability of the practice among working mothers, given the competing needs of motherhood and working. The results generated by the interviews revealed that all the key informants were strongly against the practice of child fostering. They went further to suggest associated problems like lack of maternal love, guidance and care, and the poor socialisation of the child. Two informants for example said:

> The children do not get special love like that of the mother... they also tend to develop aggressiveness because they would all the time be reminded by the people they stay with that they are not in their home (Key informant Luwum St).
>
> When you go to visit such a child, you may find it stunted and very dirty which may even make one hate the person staying with the child (Key informant Kalerwe).

Participants in the focus group discussions as can be evidenced from the following answer held similar views. One respondent said: 'It is not good

to foster children because acceptable behaviour varies from one person to another. You would rather be with her/him and teach her/him everything' (Respondent FGD2).

The fears expressed by the respondents can be confirmed by Oni (1995). Using data from Ekiti in Nigeria, Oni found that fostered children among the Yoruba were faced with psychological strain arising from their separation from parents, and their fear of questioning whatever was done to them by their foster parents in the new environment. In addition, fostered children within the Mende households in Sierra Leone were reported to have been found to lack good and nutritious food in their foster homes (Bledsoe, 1990). Bledsoe further claimed that non-fostered children were treated better while fostered children were often mistreated.

With regard to the circumstances that may force mothers to foster their children, there was a lot of argument on why mothers may resort to such a strategy. Some respondents strongly maintained that it was not good at all whatever the circumstances for mothers to part with children. Some of the statements said in support of this included:

> I will live anywhere with my children. It is only death that can separate us (Respondent FGD2).
>
> I am the only one responsible for rearing my children. I cannot transfer this responsibility to anybody whatever the case (Respondent FGD3).

To some other members, financial inability (though presented in different dimensions) came out as the most important factor which may induce mothers to part with their children, followed by a heavy workload, as reflected in the following sample of statements:

> If it were not for financial problems, I would stay with my children, and avoid giving problems to anybody (Key informant, Wandegeya).
>
> You may not have a job, hence no money to look after the child (Key informant, Luwum St).
>
> You may not have the money to pay for the house-girl and to buy food for both of them (child and maid) (Respondent FGD4).

In FGD2 the issue became very controversial with respect to marital disruption. To the discussants, marital disruption (not occasioned by death) came up as the only factor due to which mothers would have to separate from their children, but with financial problems again emerging as an

underlying force though operating through marital disruption. For example, some of the respondents said:

> If my husband chases me away and has his own house, then it would be better for one to leave the children with the father. I for one cannot afford to rent a house as good as the one I am staying in now with my husband and I do not want a bad environment for my children (Respondent FGD2).
> If my husband is caring and provides for his children, then it is best for one to leave them behind because nobody can assist you when you have children and you may fail to provide for them (Respondent FGD2).

All women gave their mothers as the only ideal people whom they would like to give their children because of their love for them, respect and exemplary behaviour. Isiugo-Abanihe (1985) in his analysis of data from Ghana also found that grandparents were the most frequent recipients of fostered children, because it is assumed that their experience in child rearing is beneficial to children.

Possibility of bringing children to the work place

Asked whether they would have liked to take their children to work with them, participants in all the focus groups expressed their desire to do so but cited the conditions at work and the nature of their jobs as strong deterrents. Two women noted:

> It is a good idea but the child may mess itself up when you are in the middle of transacting business. You cannot attend to the child and touch the food thereafter. It would be very unhygienic (Respondent FGD4).

Even if I am allowed to bring her, the environment where I work would not warrant that kind of arrangement... There is a sewer underneath my stall and the timber on which I operate my business is very loose. Very soon, it will give way (Respondent FGD3).

Similar views were held by most of the key informants, with disruption of business by the children coming out as the key factor in their opposition to the suggestion, followed by difficult working environments as the key factor against staying with children at the place of work.

> I used to bring my child with me and stayed with him at work but it taxed me a lot. The child was disturbing me, wanting us to play, pulling clothes, wanting to be on my lap all the time such that I could not work. I eventually had to get somebody to stay with him at home (Key informant William St).
>
> The place is very dirty. I cannot even dare come with my child (Key informant Wandegeya).

Possibility of checking up on the child during working hours

The respondents were asked about the possibility of checking on their children during working hours, which is also an indication of the flexibility of their work routines. Responses on this issue were however not favourable since many pointed out problems related to the expense in terms of transport and loss of business as can be seen from the following statements:

> I cannot even afford it. I stay very far away from here (place of work) and thus it is expensive. Customers may also come by when I am not around, which would be very bad for my business (Key informant William St).
>
> My home is so far that I cannot even think about it (Key informant Luwum St).
>
> Some customers may come while I am away, and I don't like to leave my products unattended to because I will then lose clients and hence income (Key informant Wandegeya).

Delegation of productive chores

Respondents were asked if it is possible for them to delegate work-related chores so that they could fulfill their maternal roles. Responses reflected on the intricacy of such an arrangement due to the high demands of their jobs in terms of skills – like the basic technical skills for jobs that require some training, and customer care. In addition, all key informants and discussants in focus groups stressed dishonesty, and lack of commitment on the part of most people to whom the mothers would want to delegate the tasks. The following statements back up these sentiments:

> I cannot delegate any task to anybody. My machine is delicate and I am the only one who knows how to handle it. Delegation might lead to unnecessary maintenance costs (Key informant Luwum St).
>
> Delegation is not that easy. In most cases one loses products and money because most of the people are dishonest (Key informant William St).
>
> The person you delegate the duties to might not work as expected due to lack of interest and this may lead to collapse of one's business (Key informant Wandegeya).
>
> Dishonesty of people may lead to poor returns from business because you do not have any mechanisms for detecting whether you got any customer while you were away or not (Key informant Kalerwe).

All participants stressed that delegation needs somebody who is dependable, trustworthy, honest, skilled in customer care, and with the knowledge of the commodities being sold.

Asked about the circumstances under which mothers may decide to delegate their productive roles, most of them gave 'death of a family

member, no maid at home, and when self is sick'. Circumstances under which the mother has to attend to child caring roles were mentioned after probing, and respondents cited only 'taking children to hospital'. These reactions show that the working mothers are only willing to delegate their economic activities in cases of emergencies, which implies that normal child feeding and caring are secondary to the income generating activities.

Discussion and conclusion

The findings presented show that children are breast fed for very short periods. The idea of free childcare is always taken advantage of by the informal sector mothers as reflected in their reliance on relatives, due to mainly financial constraints. However, one needs to explore more about what happens with when mothers' incomes increase. Much as mothers are engaged in productive activities outside the home, they still feel obliged to carry out maternal responsibilities, particularly those that enhance the welfare of children. The findings also seem to contradict the popular belief that informal sector work is compatible with child rearing responsibilities. The popular belief has always been that these workers can ably take their children with them to work and/or can easily go home in the course of the working day to breast feed – which is not easy. Regulations and the environment at the workplace together with financial constraints operate against these desirable practices regarding child survival and development. This however does not mean that women should not participate in gainful employment outside the home, because their contribution is very vital in the enhancement of the country's economic growth and overall development of their children, families and country. Instead, avenues which can help them minimise the conflict particularly in the direction of increased full and optimal breast feeding together with provision of proper child care services near work places need to be encouraged. This is because women's employment outside the home has important direct and indirect effects on demographic behaviour through its effect on household and child rearing economics. There is therefore, a need to provide adequate information about the benefits of breast feeding, so that working women can practice optimal breast feeding which will enhance child survival; encourage women to breast feed fully and frequently for the whole period of maternity leave to give the baby the benefit of breast feeding and to build up the mother's milk supply; urge women to continue to breast feed at night and in the early morning, and at any other time that the mother may be at home since many babies learn to suckle more at night and obtain most of the milk they need at that time; disseminate messages

regarding determinants of breast milk supply in order to enlighten mothers that insufficient breast milk supply can be dealt with by more suckling rather than less; and tailor breast feeding education programmes in such a way that they also address the needs of working mothers whose numbers are growing not only in Uganda but in most of the developing world.

Acknowledgement

This paper is based on the chapters of a Ph.D thesis by Innocent Mulindwa. The supervisors of the thesis, Professor Kenneth K. Hill and Dr. John Ssekamatte Ssebuliba are acknowledged for their comments. Makerere University Staff Development Grant supported the research activities.

References

Asowa-Okwe, C., 1993, 'The Dynamics of Women Participation in Workers' Struggles in Uganda: A Case Study of the National Union of Clerical, Commercial, Professional and Technical Employees (NUCCPTE)', Paper presented at 'Workers' Education' seminar, 6 March, Kampala.

Bledsoe, C., 1990, 'Differential Care for Children of Previous Unions within Mende Households in Sierra-Leone', in *Health Transition Reviews – The Cultural Social and Behavioural Determinants of Health*, The Australian National University, pp, 561–83.

Caldwell, J.C., 1982, *Theory of Fertility Decline,* New York: Academic Press.

Church, K.Y. , 1978, 'A study of Socio-economic Status and Child care Arrangements of Women in Madina', Paper presented at the conference of the National Council on Women and Development in Accra, September 9–14.

Conelly, R., DeGraff, D.S. and Levison, D., 1991, 'Child care Policy and Women's Market Work in Urban Brazil', *Working paper No. 180* on World Employment Programme Research, Geneva: ILO.

Davis, J. P., 1997, *Time Is Money? Women's Time Allocation to Market Trading and to Infant Feeding in Kampala*, Uganda, Doctoral Dissertation, Johns Hopkins University.

Fapohunda, E., 1982, 'The Childcare Dilemma of Working Mothers in African Cities: The Case of Lagos, Nigeria', in Edna G. Bay ed. *Women and Work*, Boulder, Colorado: West view Press, pp. 277-88.

Isiugo-Abanihe, U.C., 1985, 'Child Forsterage in West Africa', *Population and Development Review*, Vol.11, No. 1.

Karamagi, C.A.S., 1985, 'Breast Feeding in and around Kampala', in Dodge, E.P. and Wiebe, P.D. eds. *Crisis in Uganda: The Breakdown of Health Services*, Oxford: Pergamon Press.

King, J. and Ashworth, A.,1987, 'Historical Review of the Changing Patterns of Infant Feeding in Developing Countries: The Case of Malaysia, the Carribbean, Nigeria and Zaire', *Social Science and Medicine* Vol. 25, N° 12.

Labbok, M., Koniz-Booher, P., Shelton, J., and Krasovec, K., 1990, *Guidelines for Breast Feeding in Family Planning and Child Survival Programs*, Washington DC: Georgetown University.

Leslie, J. and Buvinic, M., 1989, 'Introduction', in *Women, Work and Child Welfare in the Third World*, Westview press, AAAS, Selected Symposium Series 110.

Lloyd, C.B., 1990, *Understanding theRelationship Between Women's Work and Fertility*, The Contribution of the World Fertilitiy Surveys, Workshop Paper No.9, Population Council, New York.

Manpower Planning Department, Uganda, 1989, *Manpower and Employment in Uganda: Report of the National Manpower Survey 1989*, Ministry of Planning and Economic Development, Kampala.

Najjumba, I.K. and Sentongo, A.L., 1994, 'The Effect of Women's Work Status on Breast Feeding Practices in Kampala District', a Survey Report Submitted to the WHO Under the Research Programme of Research Development and Research Training in Human Reproduction.

Oni, B.J., 1995,'Fostered Children's Perceptions of Their Health Care and Illness Treatment in Ekiti Yoruba Households in Nigeria', in *Health Transition Review - The cultural social and behavioural determinants of health*, Vol. 5, No.1 pp. 21-34.

Oppong, Christine, 1991, 'Relationships Between Women's Work and Demographic Behaviour: Some Research Evidence in West Africa', *Working Paper* (No. WEP 2-21/WP.175), World Employment Programme Research, Geneva, ILO.

Oppong, Christine, 1993, 'Labour and Population: ILO Standard Setting, Policy Studies andTechnical Co-operation Relating to Population Issues and Women', *Working paper* No. POP/WP.185, World Employment Programme Research, Geneva: ILO.

Oppong, Christine, 1993, 'Some roles of women: What Do we Know?: Conceptual and Methodological Issues in Sub-Saharan Africa', Paper Prepared for the Seminar on Women's Status and Population Change in Sub-Saharan Africa, Senegal, March 3-6.

Oppong, C. and Abu, K, 1985, *A Handbook for Data Collection and Analysis on the Seven Roles and Statuses of Women*, Geneva, ILO.

Uganda Department of Statistics, Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning and Macro International Inc., 1996, *The Uganda Demographic and Health Survey 1995*, Calverton, Maryland USA.

World Bank, 1995, *Uganda Growing Out of Poverty*, A World Bank Country Study, Washington DC.


Africa Development, Vol. XXIX, No. 3, 2004, pp. 131–136

(ISSN 0850-3907)

Book Review/Revue de livres

Arnfred Signe (ed) *Re-thinking Sexualities in Africa*, Uppsala: Nordic Africa Institute, 2004, 276 pp, ISBN 91-7106-513-X

Amanda Gouws
Department of Political Science
University of Stellenbosch, South Africa.

From the perspective of Feminist/gender scholarship this book was intriguing and highly enlightening to read. For feminist and non-feminist scholars alike, this book brings new insights and perspectives about sexualities in Africa. It makes a highly significant contribution to theorizing African sexualities and deconstructing Western/Euro-centric myths about sexualities in Africa.

Relying on different types of methodologies such as ethnographic research, narrative analysis and case studies the book brings a richly nuanced and textured understanding of Africans' lived experience and interpretation of their own sexualities. The 'insider views' are contrasted with the constructed 'outsider' (Western) views of the 'dark discourse' on sexuality in the context of the African continent.

Using Chandra Talpade Mohante's seminal article 'Under Western Eyes' as a starting point, the introduction locates the book as a critique of Western understandings of African sexualities. As the title of 're-thinking' implies – a double move of de-construction and re-construction takes place. The book is divided into three sections. In the first section, titled 'Under Western Eyes' a new discourse on sexuality and gender in Africa is constructed in opposition to the 'dark continent discourse'. In the second called 'Problems of Pleasure and Desire' areas of investigation rendered invisible by mainstream thinking comes under scrutiny. African male and female desire and lust, constructed from Africans' own points of view become the object of analysis. This analysis takes place in a context in which moral condemnation or judgement is suspended.

In the third section on 'Female Agency' socio-economic changes and gender power relations and their interpretation are investigated. How do

sexual beings cope in the face of growing poverty, soaring HIV/AIDS infection rates and the growing impact of globalization?

Important and innovative theorization takes place in the introductory chapter. Arnfred shows how it is often the case that in an attempt to deconstruct the 'dark continent discourse', new binary oppositions that are not helpful are put in its place, such as South Africa's president, Thabo Mbeki, arguing for a return to tradition and custom.

Arnfred also shows how the Gender and Development (GAD) discourse that is supposed to be a more 'liberating' discourse than the Women in Development (WID) discourse is still based on the assumptions of colonial/ missionary images and imaginations of 'African culture' as excessively patriarchal and women as down-trodden and overworked. The GAD discourse is powerful in structuring the minds of donors as well as gender researchers who uses essentializing concepts of female subordination and patriarchy. She also theorizes the contribution of Christianity as establishing heteronormativity as the normative framework that should be embraced, making same sex relationships invisible. In the context of 'morality and sin' insights about sex for procreation and sex for pleasure became obscured. Yet, one would have liked to also read the voices of authors in same sex relations in this book.

In the theorization of pleasure and desire, African women's genital cutting in Senegal is, for example, explored by Liselott Dellenborg and the Western condemnation juxtaposed with these women's own desire for excision that inducts them into society and womanhood.

The psychology of race and the impact that the colour of bodies have on desire in the South African context is very revealing for our understanding of how colour created a desirability that is completely divorced from beauty and how black African women's sexual relations with white men are viewed as betrayal (turning them into prostitutes) through the narrative of a research subject, theorized in the chapter by Ratele Kopano. The book also grapples with and interrogates multiplicitous sexualities and 'dividuality' where dividuality is determined by the social context. People belong to different social context and these contexts can determine the meaning of sex in the context of marriage and outside of marriage.

Female agency is theorized in terms of wifehood and motherhood and exposes agency as freedom to choose motherhood but not wifehood in certain conditions. Mumbi Machera's chapter and that of Jo Helle-Valle brings new insight and understanding to a myth that African women are merely victims of oppressive sexual relations.

The chapter that best addresses the 'dark continent discourse' is that of Katarina Jungar and Elina Oinas titled 'Preventing HIV? Medical Discourses and Invisible Women'. The authors through their analysis of medical discourses on HIV/AIDS in Africa show how the notion of male circumcision is promoted by Western medical experts as a strategy to diminish the spread of the HI virus even though there is no proof that circumcised men are less likely to contract or spread the virus. Neither is this strategy promoted for Europe of North America. The underlying assumptions behind this 'preventative strategy' are that circumcision is an 'African thing', ie part of African culture and that it is the only strategy that can work on the 'lost continent' since Africans can't control their sexual desires, won't condomise or cannot use condoms properly. With this discourse African Aids is invented, rendering invisible the complexities of the spread of AIDS such as conditions of poverty, global exploitation and marginalization of the continent and the reluctance of big pharmaceutical companies to provide anti-retroviral drugs at affordable prices.

There is a total invisibility of women in this Western medical discourse even though the spread of HIV/AIDS is heterosexual in Africa. As a consequence this invisibility of women may make it harder for them to negotiate sexual relations and requesting condom use if circumcised men decide that circumcision is indeed preventative. As the authors point out – the male circumcision debate seems more involved in reproducing imagery of 'African sexuality' than envisioning actual change.

Every chapter in this book is fascinating to read for its ability to shift our thinking about male and female sexuality in Africa but also for retheorizing African Gender Theory (see for example the chapter by Mary Kolawole 'Re-Conceptualizing African Gender Theory: Feminism, Womanism and the Arere Metaphor'). In this regard it makes a contribution to the broader developing body of indigenous African gender theorizing. It also makes this book different from other descriptive accounts of sexualities.

Everyone who has an interest in feminist theory, gender scholarship or sexualities should read this book. It will also be a very useful tool for post-graduate teaching. This book is a timely and necessary contribution to gender scholarship. I recommend it very highly.

Adekeye Adebajo, *Building Peace in West Africa: Liberia, Sierra Leone, and Guinea Bissau*. Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 2002. 192 pp. ISBN 1-58826-077-1

Samuel Ong'wen Okuro,
Maseno University
Kenya

The post independence period in Africa has witnessed, in unprecedented scale, the escalation of wars and violence in many countries both in terms of magnitude and intensity. Some of these conflicts have reached genicidal dimension. As such, it should not come as a surprise that the African continent is in need of conflict resolution mechanisms. It is based on the above observations that a diplomacy Adekeye Adebajo undertakes a deeper analysis of conflict prone West African region. He acknowledges that in this region Liberia, Sierra Leone and Guinea Bissau represent the most volatile countries, and that in terms of promoting peace keeping, peace making and peace building they serve as an example to the rest of the continent. The author examines the origins and actors in the management of conflict in the three countries. He also attempts to provide a viable mechanism for building a political, economic and secure community in West Africa. Throughout the text the author blames personalised autocratic and cleptocratic political leadership for the endemic conflicts in the three countries.

Adebajo identifies the involvement of a variety of actors and interested parties in conflict ridden West African states. He then argues that a nuance understanding of these actors and parties is critical when it comes to building stable and viable conflict management initiatives. The main actors according the author are in Liberia, are the political leaders in Burkina Faso, Côte d'Ivoire and Libya; in Sierra Leone, Liberia (particularly Taylor), Nigeria, Guinea-Bissau and Burkina Faso, and in Guinea-Bissau, Senegal, Guinea and Gambia. Apart from these warlords France (in Francophone Africa), Britain (in Sierra Leone) and Portugal, (in Guinea Bissau). Other actors include the United States, the United Nations, the World Bank and the European Union. These actors, Adebajo argues have not provided the adequate economic support necessary for peacekeeping, peacemaking and peace building efforts. The author also discusses the controversial external actors, such as International Alert, Executive Outcomes, and Sand Line International, whose involvement, in the author's opinion, has led to huge public debate and outcry. The author then underscores the critical role

played by the civil society in promoting peace and respect for human rights.

It must however be appreciated that the author relates in detail the conflict management initiatives in West Africa, taking into account internal and external conflict resolution initiatives and acknowledging Nigeria's key role.

The last part of this book, which is the main focus of the book, examines the role of the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) particularly the role of Economic Community of West African Cease-fire Monitoring Group (ECOMOG) in the management of these conflicts. ECOMOG experienced inadequate financial and technical support in Liberia and Sierra Leone, but much more in Guinea Bissau where Nigeria, the regional economic giant, was absent. Adebajo, locates the problems facing ECOMOG at three levels: 1) lack of economic and political trust among individual ECOMOG member states; 2) the pursuing of the unstable deals or 'feast of warlords' or the policy of appeasing warlords and rebels adopted by ECOWAS; and 3) the inability of the emerging regimes after coup and conflicts to come up with alternatives for the implementation of the democratic reforms including social and economic reforms that would benefit the vast majority of the people.

Adebajo proposes several solutions. Apart from a sound financial base, ECOMOG also needs to solicit for adequate resources before embarking on a military intervention. It also requires the participation of non-ECOMOG states to avoid the dominance of Nigeria and/or Anglophone states in peacemaking, peace building and peace-keeping operatives in West Africa. However, he makes it clear that peacekeeping and peace building initiatives in West Africa have been complicated because of several things: the complex relationships based on military agreements (Nigeria and Kabbah), political threats (Guinean leader Lansana Conté's threat to invade Liberia) and economic advantages (Taylor's interest in Sierra Leone to access diamonds). In addition to this friendship (Abdou Diouf's personal friendship with Vieira and Conté), ancestry (General Mane's family roots in The Gambia) and others based on colonialism particularly French unwillingness to loose the grip on her former colonies. The author ought to have attempted to suggest a mechanism for using these relationships in peace building initiatives in this region.

The author alluded to a proposal at one time espoused by Ali Mazrui in 1994 while writing for the *International Herald Tribune*. Even though the proposal was flawed by emotive words such as re-colonisation, auto-colonisation, tutelage and benign annexing, Mazrui's proposal on the

establishment of an African Security Council as a long term solution to African problems needs thorough re-examination today. This may at least lessen the problem of mistrust among ECOMOG member states. Furthermore, ECOMOG's failure to yield the desired results in managing the conflicts in Sierra Leone, Liberia and Guinea Bissau has lessons it can utilise for future regional interventions in the many conflicts in the continent. In other words, the book provides a watershed upon which the ECOMOG can evaluate itself. It can also serve as a reference tool for the newly formed African Union and NEPAD, for the management of conflict in Africa. Similarly, institutions such as CODESRIA and OSSREA should mount scholarly reflections of peace initiatives in Africa with a mission to drafting peacekeeping policy papers that Africa dearly needs at this time.

On the whole, this book is very insightful particularly considering the grafting of peace initiatives in West Africa. Graduate students, regional policy makers, regional political and economic agencies, Africa's development partners and military strategists will definitely find the book useful.