



The Debate on Quality and the Private Surge: A Status Review of Private Universities and Colleges in Tanzania

Johnson M Ishengoma*

Abstract

While enrolments in private universities is still low in Tanzania, their number, however, is surging at an alarming rate raising critical questions about their academic quality in terms of their course offerings and the qualifications of the academic staff involved in teaching these programmes. Despite this surge in the sheer number of Tanzania private universities, public universities remain dominant in terms of enrolment. This paper (i) documents the hitherto-lacking critical information about private universities and university colleges in Tanzania, (ii) discusses the implications of the surge and (iii) discusses the related issues of academic quality.

Résumé

Alors que les inscriptions dans les universités privées sont encore faibles en Tanzanie, leur nombre augmente toutefois à un rythme considérable soulevant ainsi des questions cruciales au sujet de leur qualité académique du point de vue de leurs programmes d'études et des qualifications du personnel universitaire impliqué dans l'enseignement de ces programmes. Malgré cette augmentation du nombre d'universités privées en Tanzanie, les universités publiques restent dominantes du point de vue de l'inscription. Ce document (i) décrit les informations jusqu'ici manquantes sur les universités et collèges privés en Tanzanie, (ii) examine les implications de leur essor et (iii) traite des questions liées à la qualité de l'enseignement universitaire.

* Faculty of Education, Department of Educational Planning and Administration, University of Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

Introduction

Tanzania attained her political independence in 1961. For the first seven years after independence (1961-1967), Tanzania retained the free market economy inherited from the British colonial rule, encouraging the growth and development of the private sector. A fundamental and radical shift in Tanzania's development, economic and educational policies was made in 1967 through the Arusha Declaration¹. According to one of the principles of the Arusha Declaration, access to scarce resources such as education was to be regulated and controlled by the Government to ensure equal access by all socio-economic groups. The implementation of the Arusha Declaration went in tandem with the nationalization and control of all the major means of production by the state, including most of the private educational institutions owned by Christian missionaries and other religious organizations, with the exception of Roman Catholic seminaries and one tertiary education institution. There are no documented reasons as to why these educational institutions were not nationalized, but we can speculate that the Roman Catholic seminaries were *probably* not nationalized because the first Tanzania president, the late Julius Nyerere, was a devout Roman Catholic. However, with the introduction of the Arusha Declaration, private higher education sector was effectively banned.

Higher Education Facts

In mainland Tanzania, 45 percent of the population is Christian, 35 percent Muslim, and the remaining 20 percent follow traditional religious beliefs. In Zanzibar, more than 99 percent of the population is Muslim, and about 1 percent is Christian or follows other religions. Fifty-seven point eight percent (57.8 percent) of the Tanzania population lives on less than US\$ 1 per day, while 89.9 percent live on less than US\$ 2 per day (UNDP 2006: 294). The GDP per capita (2005 estimate) at PPP was US\$ 700 (CIA World Fact Book 2006).

While the demand for university education is high in Tanzania (by using the proxy indicator of admission rate, i.e. comparing the number of candidates who applied to those who actually got admitted in any given year), the (public) higher education sector remains elitist. For example, in the academic year 2006/2007, the University of Dar es Salaam (Main Campus) enrolled only 7,049 applicants or 46 percent out of a total of 15,185 applicants who passed the matriculation examination (UDSM 2006:6-7). This implies that 8,136 applicants were eligible for admission to Tanzania private universities. The above application and admission trends also apply to other public universities with the exception of the Open University of Tanzania, which admits non-traditional students and offers academic programs through distance learning. Low admission rates to public

universities are one of the major causes of the growth in the demand-absorbing private higher education sector in Tanzania.

Participation in tertiary education as a percentage of the relevant age group² was 1 percent in Tanzania in the year 2000, compared to 3 percent for Uganda and Kenya respectively (World Bank 2003: 81-82).

There are currently 21 private universities and university colleges registered by the Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU). Only 4 private universities or 19 percent of all private universities and university colleges have received *Certificates of (Full) Accreditation* from the Tanzania Commission for Universities.³

Introducing Private Higher Education in Tanzania

With the exception of one tertiary education institution owned by the Roman Catholic Church (now a private university with three constituent colleges) which has existed since the 1960's, private higher education did not exist in Tanzania until 1997. The government decided to liberalize the provision of higher education in Tanzania by amending the Education Act No. 25 of 1978, which was replaced with the Education Act No. 10 of 1995. This new Act has a provision for the establishment of private higher education institutions. The *1999 National Higher Education Policy* also underscores the importance of encouraging private organizations, individuals, non-governmental organizations and communities to take an active role in establishing and maintaining institutions of higher education. This is one of the government's strategies to bring private sector support into higher education.

Consequently, as of the academic year 2006/2007, private universities made up 62.5 percent of the total universities with a total enrolment of 12,410 students or 24 percent of the total enrolment (51,652 students) in all universities in Tanzania. Total enrolment in private universities increased by 53.3 percent from 5,784 students in 2005/2006 to 12,410 students in 2006/2007, a manifestation of the private surge.

Causes of the Growth in Private Higher Education in Tanzania

While the most commonly acknowledged major cause of private higher education growth globally is the surge in demand for higher education as Levy (2006) observes, there are some exceptions. For example, anecdotal evidence shows that in Tanzania, the first Archbishop of the Mwanza Catholic Diocese (the late Joseph Bloomjous, a Christian missionary from Holland) wanted to establish the first private Roman Catholic university in the Mwanza region in the Lake Zone area of Tanzania in the late 1950s. He planned this in order to meet the special manpower requirements of the Roman Catholic Church in the fields of

journalism, social work, hospital administration and accountancy. This was necessary because the demand for higher education in these specific fields was very high. When the Government refused to grant him permission, he decided to establish a private Roman Catholic tertiary education institution, the Nyegezi Social Training Center, with a disguised objective of training Church personnel. This later became the Nyegezi Social Training Institute and is now the St. Augustine University of Tanzania. In the late 1950s, the demand for university education in Tanzania was very low because of the very few high schools available then. However, at independence (1961) the demand for university education sharply increased due to the critical shortage and need for highly-trained manpower. Thus, unlike in Kenya, the Roman Catholic Church in Tanzania played a leading role in setting a precedent for establishing private higher education.

The major cause of the growth of private higher education in Tanzania, especially in the late 1990s, apart from the limited capacity of the public universities to absorb all the qualifying applicants and also the high admission criteria demanded for admission to public universities, is the stiff competition among major religious denominations to establish higher education institutions as one of their strategies to consolidate their spheres of influence among their followers.

Thus, a common trend in Tanzania now is that various religious denominations are engaged in subtle but stiff competition to establish universities (at times within the same catchment area offering similar degree programs), not *necessarily* because of the surge of demand for higher education. This explains why in Tanzania, sixteen (84.2 percent) out of nineteen private universities and university colleges are owned or affiliated to various religious denominations/organizations in Tanzania or abroad. If we include two other private higher education institutions which are not categorized as universities, but which are also owned by the Roman Catholic and the Evangelical Lutheran Churches, religious denominations own 85.7 percent of all private higher education institutions. As also Banya (2001) observes, religious ideologies have played a pivotal role in the establishment of (private) higher education institutions on the African continent.

Furthermore, total enrolment in private Tanzanian universities is still very small, compared to the large number of private institutions making it difficult to make a valid claim that the growth of private higher education in Tanzania has been largely due to the *surge* of demand for higher education. The growth of private universities in Tanzania might also be attributed to two more factors, also supported by Banya (2001), which are: (i) private universities provide a viable alternative for getting access to higher education to most of the Tanzanians who cannot get admission to very competitive public universities, and (ii) in contrast to public universities, most of the private higher education institu-

tions in Tanzania were established or are being established because of profit motives, albeit disguised.

Levy (2004: 1,6,7) makes important arguments about the reasons for the growth of private higher education worldwide which can also explain the causes of the growth of private higher education in Tanzania. He argues that private higher education growth is connected to widespread changes in the political economy, changes which have diminished the role of the state in funding and controlling higher education in many African countries.

Along the same argument, Banya (op cit: 4) observes that the proliferation of for-profit higher education in Sub-Saharan Africa is part of a larger, worldwide trend towards privatization. Levy (ibid: 7) citing Salamon (1995) further argues that the growth of private higher education or what he calls 'the new private surge' should be seen in a larger context of the 'international crisis of welfare state and the shift from state to private or mixed private-public forms.'

From 1967 until the late 1980s Tanzania adopted socialism, which among other things guaranteed free higher education. When this policy failed to work, which Levy correctly calls 'the crisis of development', the Government adopted neo-liberal economic policy of cost sharing in the provision of social services including higher education. The growth of the private higher education sector in Tanzania should also be seen in the above context of the '*crisis of development*.'

The Role of the Tanzania Commission for Universities⁴ in the Accreditation of Private Universities

All new universities, and specifically private universities and colleges, have to secure permission to operate from a government quality assurance and control organ, the Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU), formerly the Higher Education Accreditation Council. The reason new private universities have to secure permission to operate is mainly for quality control and assurance purposes; the assumption being that these institutions, because they are funded from private sources, need to prove that they meet the basic conditions for establishing an institution of higher learning. Old universities (public and private) have to be re-accredited four-yearly, but for public universities re-accreditation is merely a formality. The assumption is that these are academically credible, well-established institutions with Government-guaranteed human and financial resources, highly-qualified academic staff, and quality students⁵ and academic programmes.

Stages in the Accreditation Process

There are four stages in the process of accreditation of all new universities by the Tanzania Commission for Universities. The first stage of accreditation is when a prospective private university/university college or an investor submits an application together with documentary evidence of the following to the Commission: available premises, a basic educational infrastructure and relevant governance structures and systems, a qualified faculty, a mission and vision, and a relevant academic plan. Experts or the Technical Evaluation Committee from the Commission then visit the site for verification. If the Commission is satisfied with the report and recommendations of the Technical Evaluation Committee, a Letter of Interim Authority (LIA) to operate as a private university is granted.

Private universities and colleges holding Letters of Interim Authority are not allowed to admit students and start running courses until all basic preparations and resources for administrative functions envisaged by the institution are in place and have been verified and approved by the Commission. The Letter of Interim Authority is valid for three years and within this period the prospective private university must make progress towards the second stage otherwise the Letter can be revoked if no satisfactory reasons are given.

The second stage is the granting of the Certificate of Provisional Registration (CPR). This certificate may be granted after a prospective private university has satisfied the Commission through the recommendations made by the Technical Evaluation Committee that, among other things, it has: a strategic plan to guide the development of the planned university; furnished and equipped the required buildings in accordance with the university's approved strategic plan; appointed a fulltime, qualified and competent and experienced Chief Executive; established an administration system, and appointed an adequate and experienced academic staff for carrying out the initial and planned future programs and courses; prepared a prospectus defining, among other things, student admission requirements and procedures; submitted draft curricula for initial courses, students progress and performance assessment procedures and regulations; and established a clear and transparent procedures for the recruitment, employment and promotion of academic and administrative staff (TCU 2006: 18-19).

The Certificate of Provisional Registration is essentially a provisional license to a university to: (a) advertise for and appoint academic, administrative, technical and other support staff; (b) advertise courses and select students for initial academic programs which may commence, at the earliest, during the second year of the license period; (c) embark on teaching/learning, research and public expert service functions; (d) publish the prospectus of the university; and (e) initiate the establishment of departments, faculties, schools, institutes, constituent

colleges, campus colleges and related organs. The Certificate of Provisional Registration is valid for a period of three years (TCU 2006: 19-20).

The third stage is the granting of the Certificate of Full Registration. A university may be granted a Certificate of Full Registration (CFR) if it has attained legal status through charter, it is a holder of a Certificate of Provisional Registration for not less than three years and not more than four and half years, and it has fulfilled all the conditions stipulated under the Certificate of Provisional Registration.

The fourth and final stage is the granting of the Certificate of Accreditation. A Certificate of Accreditation may be granted after a university has attained full registration status and conducted an internal self-evaluation in accordance with the institutional self-assessment and quality assurance guidelines prescribed by the Commission. This certificate is granted after the Technical Evaluation Committee appointed by the Commission has made a thorough review and assessment of the following issues: (a) the adequacy and quality of existing academic, administrative and technical support facilities, programs, services and procedures; (b) the conditions, criteria and procedures used to select and admit students; (c) the adequacy and quality of curricula, instructional and learning environment, materials, equipment, methods and related support services; (d) the adequacy of the ratio of facilities and services such as staff: student ratio, students: facility ratio; etc. (e) the adequacy of numbers, qualifications, and experience of academic, administrative and technical support staff; (f) the conditions for course completion, students assessment and grading system and procedures, examinations regulations and the credibility of external examination; and (g) the conditions for the university's academic awards and graduation (TCU 2006: 22-23). In each of the above stages, a prospective university is required to pay a prescribed fee to the TCU. Table 1 shows the registration status of 20 Tanzania private universities and university colleges as of January 2007.

Table 1 shows that only four or 20 percent of the 20 private universities have Certificates of Accreditation, 6 private universities or 30 percent have Certificates of Provisional Registration, 6 universities also have Certificates of Full Registration, while 3 private universities or 15 percent operate with Letters of Interim Authority. The distribution of Tanzania private universities in zones/administrative regions is shown in Table 2.

Data in Table 2 shows that private universities and colleges are, to some extent, concentrated in Dar es Salaam (the capital city of Tanzania), Kilimanjaro and Arusha. These three regions also happen to have the largest share of private secondary schools in Tanzania and they are economically rich, growing cash crops for export. Yet, Arusha and Kilimanjaro have a smaller population compared to all the other regions. The rest of the regions hosting two private universities each are also economi-

cally rich. In a way, the distribution of private universities in Tanzania supports Levy's observation of the preponderance of private higher education institutions in the capital and other leading cities where the major economic activities are also located. The distribution of private universities among twenty-six administrative regions is basically inequitable leaving some economically-poor southern regions without any prospect of establishing a private university.

Table 1: Current Registration Status of Tanzania Private Universities and University Colleges, July 2007

Institution	Year Established	Registration Status
The Hubert Kairuki Memorial University	1996	COA
The International Medical & Technological University	1996	CFR
St. Augustine University of Tanzania	1996	COA
Zanzibar University	1998	CFR
Tumaini University	1999	COA
Mount Meru University	2002	CPR
University of Arusha	2003	CPR
Bishop Kisanji University	2004	LIA
Muslim University of Morogoro	2005	CPR
Iringa University College	1996	COA
Kilimanjaro Christian Medical College	1996	CFR
Tumaini University Dar es Salaam College	1997	CPR
International University of Africa-College of Education Zanzibar	1998	CFR
Makumira University College	1996	CFR
Aga Khan University - Tanzania Institute of Higher Education	2000	CPR
Bugando University College of Health Sciences	2002	CFR
Mwenge University College of Education	2005	CPR
Ruaha University College	2005	LIA
Bishop Stefano Memorial University College	2006	LIA
St. John's University	2007	LIA
Civic Education Center ⁶	2003	Unknown

Source: *The Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU), (2006) Newsletter Vol. 1. No. 3 Dar es Salaam: HEAC pp.40-42.*

Key: LIA=Letter of Interim of Authority; CPR=Certificate of Provisional Registration; CFR=Certificate of Full Registration; Certificate of Accreditation, *The Guardian*, Friday November 24 2006 'Mengi appointed member of university board,' p. 5.

Table 2: Regional Distribution of Tanzania Private Universities and University Colleges⁷

Region/Zone	Number of Private Universities	percent Total	Regional Population
Dar es Salaam	4*	20.0	2,497,940
Arusha**	3	15.0	1,292,973
Kilimanjaro	4	20.0	1,381,149
Iringa	2	10.0	1,495,333
Morogoro	1	5.0	1,759,809
Mbeya	1	5.0	2,070,046
Mwanza***	2	10.0	2,942,148
Zanzibar	2	10.0	950,000
Dodoma	1	5.0	1,698,996

Source: Adapted from: HEAC (2005) *Guide to Higher Education in Tanzania, 2005*; United Republic of Tanzania (2003) *2002 Population and Housing Census General Report*. Dar es Salaam: National Bureau of Statistics p.2.

* If we include the *Center for Civic Education* owned by the University of South Africa, Dar es Salaam has the largest share of private higher education institutions.

** Arusha (located in the northern part of Tanzania) has been recently elevated to the status of a city.

*** This is the second largest city in Tanzania after Dar es Salaam.

Recent Developments, and Trends and Implications for Quality Ownership of Tanzania Private Universities

A remarkable feature of Tanzania private universities and university colleges is their ownership and affiliation. Of the 20 registered private universities and university colleges, only one private university is not affiliated or owned by a religious organization based in Tanzania or abroad, although they claim to be secular universities. Religious studies or religion-related courses are made compulsory for all students in some of these universities. For example, one university owned by the Roman Catholic Church makes Social Ethics and African Religion and Philosophy compulsory to all undergraduate students.

Furthermore, the mission statements of some of these private universities, especially those owned by Churches, are contradictory. For example, it is stated in some mission statements that apart from being 'secular', these institutions have to promote certain religious values and that even faculty who do not believe

in certain religious values have to 'respect' certain moral and religious values advocated by a particular university. A part of the mission statement of one private university owned by the Roman Catholic Church states:

the University was founded to embrace the ideals of the Gospel message as it comes to the world through the Word of God and through Catholic Tradition and the Teaching Church.

Table 3: Nature of Affiliation and Ownership of Tanzania Private Universities and University Colleges, July 2007

University/University College	Nature of Affiliation/Ownership
Hubert Kairuki Memorial University	Affiliated to the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania (ELCT)
St. Augustine University of Tanzania	Roman Catholic Church - Tanzania Episcopal Conference (TEC)
Bugando University College of Health Sciences	Tanzania Episcopal Conference
Mwenge University College of Educ.	Tanzania Episcopal Conference
Ruaha University College	Tanzania Episcopal Conference
Tumaini University	Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania
Tumaini University Dar es Salaam	Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania
Iringa University College	Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania
Makumira University College	Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania
Bishop Stephano Memorial University College	Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania
Kilimanjaro Christian Medical College	Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania
Muslim University of Morogoro	Muslim Development Foundation
Zanzibar University based in the Gulf States.	Daral Iman Islamic Charitable Association
College of Education Zanzibar	Muslim-Affiliated to the International University of Africa in Khartoum
University of Arusha	Seventh Day Adventist
Mount Meru University	Baptist Church
International Medical & Technological University	Affiliated to Vignan Education Foundation of India ⁸
Teofilo Kisanji University	Moravian Church
Aga Khan University-Tanzania Institute of Higher Education	Aga Khan Foundation
St. John's University	Anglican Church

Source: Adapted from, HEAC (2005) *Guide to Higher Education in Tanzania*, 2005 pp. 18-20.

As Levy (2006) observes, because religious institutions counted prominently among the African continent's precursors, their strong presence in private higher education is to be expected. Most of the private universities in Tanzania were established through the upgrading of existing tertiary education institutions, a phenomenon also noted by Otieno (this issue) in the Kenyan context. Table 3 below shows the nature of ownership/affiliation of Tanzania private universities.

Data in Table 3 reveals the following distribution pattern of private universities by ownership or affiliation to religious denominations: Evangelical Lutheran of Tanzania (ELCT) 7(35 percent) private universities; Roman Catholic Church 4(20.0 percent); Muslim 3 universities (15.0 percent); other religious denominations 4 universities (20.0 percent); and other non-religious organization(s) 2(10.0 percent). The current ownership pattern of private universities is dominated by Protestant churches. The dominant influence of the Protestant Church in private higher education is also noted by Otieno (2006) in Kenya.

The Categorization of Tanzania Private Universities

Varghese (2004: 8) categorizes private higher education institutions as follows: (i) state-supported private institutions; (ii) not-for-profit private higher education institutions, and (iii) for-profit private higher education institutions. State-supported private higher education institutions receive minimal or substantial funding support from the government and are regulated by public authorities, while not-for profit private higher education institutions are owned and operated by trusts that rely heavily on endowments and fees collected from the students. For-profit private higher education institutions, on the other hand, operate to produce profit. Varghese further argues that for-profit private higher education institutions heavily rely on student fees as a major source of financing the institutions and offer courses in market-friendly subject areas.

Levy (in this issue) categorizes private higher education institutions as religious, elite, demand-absorbing and commercial. A clear-cut categorization of Tanzania private universities is to a certain extent elusive because they manifest the three characteristics expounded above, i.e. religious (because almost the majority of them are owned by, or affiliated to, religious organizations), are demand-absorbing and commercial, or are for-profit. With effect from the academic year 2005/2006, academically-qualified students enrolled in private universities also qualify for Government loans through the Higher Education Students' Loans Board. This means these institutions indirectly receive funding from the Government making them also qualify to be categorized as state-supported private higher education institutions. Furthermore, the fact these institutions are also regulated by the Tanzania Commission for Universities and some of them

use curricula 'borrowed' from public universities puts them in a position of being categorized as state-supported private higher education institutions per se.

The above confusion in the categorization of Tanzania private universities notwithstanding, judging from the academic quality of some of the students admitted to Tanzania private universities and colleges, the profile of the faculty employed in these institutions and state of facilities, we can confidently argue that in Tanzania there are currently no academically elite private higher education institutions. .

Some Elements of For-Profit Private Universities and Colleges in Tanzania

While most of the private universities claim to be not-for-profit but established to be affordable also to poor Tanzanians, the tuition fees charged by some of these institutions for both Tanzanian and foreign students and the fact that some also run parallel/evening programs and charge tuition fees in US\$ is evidence that some are for profit. The above evidence of for-profit tendencies is also reinforced by the fact that these institutions mostly rely on students' tuition fees as a major source of finance. Table 4 below summarizes the available data on tuition fees charged by Tanzania private universities and colleges in the academic year 2005/2006. For comparison purpose, Table 5 shows tuition fees charged by some major public universities for Government-sponsored students through the Government loans scheme⁹.

The unusual pattern which emerges from Table 4 is that Tanzania private higher education institutions charge relatively low tuition fees for foreign students, apparently to attract more foreign students who pay their fees in US\$. As Banya (2001:4-5) observes, private universities in Africa have become an alternative route for many students especially those from wealthy families, who can afford to pay the higher tuition fees charged by these institutions.

Table 5 shows tuition fees charged by major Tanzanian public universities and university colleges for Tanzanian and non-Tanzanian students at the undergraduate degree level.

What be can be deduced from Tables 5 is that public higher education institutions charge low tuition fees meaning that they are not for-profit and are also open to students from low income families, when compared to for-profit private higher education institutions.

Table 4: Tuition Fees Charged by Tanzania Private Universities and University Colleges for Undergraduate Degrees for On-Campus Students, 2005/2006¹⁰

Institution	Tanzanian Students (TZS)	Foreign Students (US\$)
Hubert Kairuki Memorial University	4,520,000 [US\$ 8,256] ¹¹	8, 135
International Medical & Technological University	US\$ 4,500	7,500
St. Augustine University of Tanzania	950,000 [US\$ 1,743]	
Zanzibar University	US\$ 520	US\$ 520
Mount Meru University	US\$ 1,260	US\$ 1260
University of Arusha	752,640 [US\$ 1,380]	US\$ 752.64]
The Proposed Bishop Kisanji University	600,000 [US\$ 1,100]	N/A
Muslim University of Morogoro	900,000 [US\$ 1,651]	US\$ 1,500
Iringa University College	1,500,000 [US\$ 2,752]	TZS 1,750,000 [US\$ 3211]
Makumira University College	1,500,000 ¹² [US\$ 2,752] 1,800,000 ¹³ [US\$ 1,500]	[US\$ 3,302]
The Kilimanjaro Christian Medical College	2,000,000 [US\$ 3,669]	US\$ 2,860
Tumaini University College Dar es Salaam ¹⁴	US\$ 1,560 for 1st & 2nd years and US\$ 1,700 ¹⁵ for 3rd and 4th years	US\$ 1,560 for 1st & 2nd years and US\$ 1,700 for 3rd & 4th years.
University College of Education Zanzibar	US\$ 200 ¹⁶	US\$ 200
Bugando University College of Health Sciences	2,500,000 [US\$ 4,587]	US\$ 3,000
Mwenge University College of Health Sciences	1,700,000 [US\$ 3,119] & 1,000,000 [US\$ 1,834] ¹⁷	US\$ 2,500 & US\$ 1,500]
Ruaha University College	NA	NA
Aga Khan University (Tanzania Institute for Higher Education)	1,400,000 US\$ 2,568]	NA

Source: Adapted from HEAC (2005) *Guide to Higher Education in Tanzania, 2005*, Third Edition pp. 46-109.

Table 5: Tuition Fees Charged by Major Tanzania Major Public Universities and University Colleges for Undergraduate Degrees, Academic Year 2005/2006.

Institution	Tanzanian Students (TZS)	Non-Tanzanian Students (US\$)
University of Dar es Salaam (Main Campus)	900,000–1,200,000 ¹⁸ [US\$ 1,651–2,201]	4,200 ¹⁹
Sokoine University of Agriculture ²⁰	400,000 [US\$ 734]	3,000
Open University of Tanzania	150,000 [US\$ 275.2]	1,263
Mzumbe University	1,156,000 [US\$ 2,121]	NA
Muhimbili University Colleges of Health Sciences	1,000,000 [US\$ 1,834] ²¹	4,200
University College of Lands & Architectural Studies	1,200,000 [US\$ 2201]	4,200
Moshi University College of Cooperatives and Business Studies	297,500 [US\$ 546]	1,250
Institute of Journalism & Mass Communication	735,000 [US\$1,348]	NA
State University of Zanzibar	500,000 [US\$ 917]	4,000
Dar es Salaam University College of Education	NA	NA
Mkwawa University College of Education	NA	NA

Source: HEAC (2005) *Guide to Higher Education in Tanzania, 2005* pp. 25-85.

Administration and Governance

To some extent, Tanzania private universities have adopted a system of administration and governance used in public universities, apparently because the constitutions and charters of these universities were written by experts from public universities. This is what Levy (2004: 2) refers to as 'isomorphism and convergence that yields similarities among entities.' The highest organ in the organizational structure is the Board of Trustees (in practice this is the board of owners of a university)²². Boards of Trustees make vital strategic decisions concerning their universities, including appointing Vice Chancellors and their deputies, principals or provosts and their deputies. The University Council is the highest decision-making organ in the organizational structure charged with making deci-

sions concerning the development of a respective university including the hiring and promotion of academic staff. For universities affiliated or owned by the Church, the head of the Church or his representative with the highest rank (e.g. bishop or archbishop) is usually the Chairperson of the University Council. University Charters stipulate who should be a member of a respective University Council.

As in public universities, every private university has a ceremonial Chancellor and a Vice-Chancellor. A Vice-Chancellor is assisted by a Deputy Vice-Chancellors for Academic Affairs and Administration. Vice-Chancellors and their deputies are in charge of the day-to-day administration of their respective institutions assisted by the University Management Boards. Provosts and deputy provosts or principals and deputy principals assisted by Management Boards are in charge of the day-to-day operations of university colleges (constituent colleges).

For universities affiliated or owned by Christian religious denominations, the Chancellor is usually the head of a respective religious denomination, e.g. an archbishop or a bishop. In some cases, a Chancellor is assisted by a Pro-Chancellor who is usually a bishop or an archbishop in a diocese where a particular university is located. Compared to public universities where vice-chancellors and their deputies are appointed through a transparent competitive process, vice-chancellors and their assistants in private universities are in practice appointed by the Boards of Trustees, at times regardless of their academic ranks and experience in academia. Vice-chancellors and their deputies in most of the private universities owned or affiliated to religious denominations are members of the religious clergy. Another important organ in the administration and governance of private universities is the academic senate.

The academic senate is mainly in charge of matters related to university examinations' results, admissions and enrolments, with very limited power to enforce academic quality in terms of hiring the most qualified staff or to punish errant or ineffective professors. In most private universities and colleges, the senate is composed of heads of departments, faculty deans, and provosts or principals and their deputies. In most private universities the powers of decision making, in terms of making vital decisions concerning the faculty (e.g. promotion) and the institutions, are in practice centred on the vice-chancellor. Table 6 summarizes the academic qualifications, academic ranks, and professions of vice-chancellors in Tanzania private universities and colleges.

Table 6: Academic Qualifications, Ranks, and Professions of Tanzania Private Universities' Vice Chancellors and Provosts

Institution	Academic qualification of VC/Provost	Academic Ranks*	Profession
Hubert Kairuki Memorial University	Masters Degree	Professor	Medical Doctor
International Medical & Technological University	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown
St. Augustine University of Tanzania	PhD (Canon Law)	Lecturer	Clergy/Priest
Zanzibar University	PhD (Law)	Professor	Lawyer
Kilimanjaro Christian Medical College	Masters (Medicine)	Professor	Medical Doctor
Mount Meru University	Masters (Divinity)	Unknown	Clergy
University of Arusha	Masters (Divinity)	Unknown	Clergy
Bishop Kisanji University	PhD (Divinity)	Unknown	Clergy
Muslim University of Morogoro	PhD	Professor	Non-Clergy
Iringa University College	PhD	Professor	Non-Clergy
Makumira University College	PhD (Theology)	Professor	Clergy
Tumaini University College Dar es Salaam	PhD	Professor	Non-Clergy
University College of Education Zanzibar	PhD	Unknown	Non-Clergy
Bugando University College of Health Sciences	Masters	Professor	Non-Clergy
Mwenge University College of Education	PhD	Unknown	Clergy/Priest
Ruaha University College	PhD	Unknown	Clergy/Priest
Aga Khan University	Unknown	Unknown	Non-Clergy
Bishop Stephano Moshi Memorial University	Masters	Unknown	Non-Clergy

Source: Adapted from HEAC (2005) *Guide to Higher Education in Tanzania, 2005*, pp.46-107.

* Our source of data does not indicate whether a vice-chancellor is an associate or full professor. However anecdotal evidence shows that most of the vice-chancellors in private universities who have been categorized as professors are associate professors. There are very few full professors leading private universities as vice-chancellors.

The data in Table 6 shows that 33.3 percent of the vice-chancellors/provosts in private universities have master's degrees; 55.5 percent have doctorates; 44.4 percent of the heads of these institutions are professors; and 38.8 percent of vice-chancellors/provosts are clerics. In comparison, 10 out of 11 vice-chancellors/principals in public universities and university colleges have doctorates, and all eleven (100 percent) are either full or associate professors with vast academic leadership experience. The fact that one-third of the vice-chancellors/provosts in Tanzanian universities have master's degrees and that only 44.4 percent have attained the academic rank of professor has implications for the quality of academic leadership in these institutions.

The significance of Table 6 lies in the fact that the quality of academic leadership, in our case manifested by the academic qualifications and ranks of chief executives, in any higher learning institution positively or negatively influences the provision of quality higher education in terms of the leadership style in which these institutions are governed. Quality democratic academic leadership also influences the practice of academic freedom by the faculty and institutional autonomy. The assumption is that a private university whose vice-chancellor is a full professor or an associate professor is more likely to oversee the enforcement of rigorous academic standards, hire the most qualified academic staff and generally abet academic practices that may undermine academic quality in an institution. While I am not arguing that Tanzanian private universities' vice-chancellors who are not PhD holders and senior members of the academia cannot and should not lead these institutions, in order to enhance the academic quality of these nascent institutions, it is desirable that they should be lead by highly-qualified and experienced university professors as is the case with public universities.

Academic Staff Qualifications, Ranks and Employment Terms in Tanzania Private Universities and University Colleges: Implications for Academic Quality

Related to the issue of academic qualifications and ranks of vice-chancellors and provosts in Tanzania private universities is the issue of academic qualifications and ranks of faculty in these institutions as summarized in Table 7. Findings in Table 7 show that of the total 499 academic staff employed in all Tanzania private universities and colleges in the academic year 2005/2006, only 86 (17.2 percent) had doctorates, about 50 percent had master's degrees, while about 16 percent had bachelor's degrees.

Table 7: Academic Qualifications of Teaching Staff in Tanzania Private Universities, 2005/2006²³

Institution	PhD	Masters Degree	Bachelors Degree	Other	Total	% PhD
St. Augustine University of Tanzania	11	29	7	4	51	21.5
Kilimanjaro Christian Medical College	8	27	24	1	60	13.3
Iringa University College	6	35	16	4	61	10.0
Makumira University College	9	9	0	1	19	47.3
Tumaini University College Dar es Salaam	1	11	3	2	17	5.8
Muslim University of Morogoro	7	14	0	0	21	33.3
University of Arusha	2	13	1	0	16	12.5
College of Education Zanzibar	10	7	0	0	17	58.8
Hubert Kairuki Memorial University	NA	NA	NA	NA	67	NA
Bugando University College of Health Sciences	8	11	7	0	26	30.7
Aga Khan University	2	21	3	0	26	9.5
Mount Meru University	6	8	4	2	20	30.0
Teofilo Kisanji University	4	13	7	0	24	16.6
Zanzibar University	4	17	0	0	21	19.0
IMTU	3	20	2	3	28	15.0
Ruaha University College	4	8	1	0	13	30.7
Mwenge University College of Education	1	6	4	1	12	8.3
Stefano Moshi Memorial University	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Grand Total	86	249	79	18	499	17.2

Source: Adapted from United Republic of Tanzania (July 2006) *Basic Statistics on Higher Education, Science and Technology 2001/2002-2005/2006*. Dar es Salaam: Ministry of Higher Education, Science, Technology and Higher Education pp. 119-133.

While comprehensive data on the academic ranks of the teaching staff in all Tanzania private universities and university colleges is not available, available data from 6 private universities (31.5 percent of all private universities) shows that in the academic year 2005/2006, these universities employed in total 2 full professors; 10 associate professors; 24 senior lecturers; 45 lecturers; 14 assistant lecturers; and 11 tutorial assistants (URT 2006). Full professors accounted for 1.8 percent of all the teaching staff in 6 private universities.

Despite the unavailability of data on academic staff ranks in Tanzania private universities, anecdotal evidence shows that the majority of the teaching staff in private universities are lecturers and assistant lecturers, with a negligible number of senior lecturers, associate professors and full professors. One of the reasons why Tanzania private universities have few senior academics is because these institutions mainly employ part-time faculty or retired or retrenched civil servants on a three-year or one-year contract terms, renewable at the discretion of the employer. This employment condition implies insecurity of tenure among the academic staff and has a negative influence on the academic quality. As Mama (2004) correctly observes, security of tenure of academic staff is a minimal prerequisite of academic freedom, which is a basic tenet for the provision of quality higher education.

Insecurity of tenure as well as other consequences makes academic staff in Tanzania private universities vulnerable to some kind of censorship by employers and some kind of self-censorship in their work, especially marking and grading students' papers in order to satisfy both students and employers to secure further employment contracts.²⁴ Self-censorship and censorship by employers whether directly or indirectly compromises academic quality. As Hoeller (2006) also observes, 'college professors cannot teach successfully if they are in constant fear of losing their jobs. They cannot enforce high standards, if doing so will cost them their livelihood.'

Most of the Tanzania private higher education institutions, because of inadequate remuneration and relatively unsatisfactory working conditions, are unable to attract young senior academicians and internationally-acclaimed professors from public universities or elsewhere to work with them on a full-time basis. This explains why there is very little research and consultancy taking place in these institutions. The majority of Tanzania private universities are mainly engaged in teaching rather than in research and consultancy to such an extent that in some universities the number of years an academic staff has taught at an institution is a criterion for promotion rather than research and publication in peer-reviewed journals.

Conclusions

Private providers of higher education in Tanzania have surged from 6 institutions in 1996 to 20 in (July) 2007 (an increase of 70 percent) and in the process outnumber public higher education institutions by 8 institutions. While private higher education institutions have grown in numbers, this growth has not been translated into growth in student enrolments, an increase in the number of highly academically qualified faculty, training at PhD level or the construction of new buildings. These issues have negative implications on the quality of these institutions.

The expansion of student enrolment in private universities is constrained by the fact that the majority of these institutions still operate from rented premises in urban and semi-urban areas, unable to undertake large-scale construction of new educational facilities because of their limited financial resources. The infrastructure and other resources, as one deputy vice-chancellor observes, are inadequate and dilapidated to such an extent that they can no longer withstand the growing number of enrolments.²⁵ Yet, some of the private universities are very busy expanding enrolments to generate the much-needed tuition fees to run these institutions. Enrolment expansion without the concomitant expansion of educational facilities negatively impacts on the quality of education. As we pointed out earlier, Tanzania private universities heavily depend on tuition fees and donations from benefactors as the major sources of income. Very few private universities (if any) undertake any commissioned or contracted research and consultancies which can generate the much-needed extra income for these institutions, because their major focus is teaching, rather than independent research and consultancy. Most private universities, because of the background, experience and to some extent academic qualifications, are unable to undertake serious publishable research and consultancy. The majority of Tanzania private universities are unable to attract highly academically qualified and experienced faculty, except retired academics, because of the relatively poor working conditions [e.g. security of employment], poor compensation and remuneration, geographical location of most of these institutions and, to some extent, academic leadership.

While there is currently a surge for private higher education institutions in Tanzania, this is not necessarily due to the *surge* of demand for higher education, but rather as a result of the initiatives of various religious denominations to establish private higher education institutions or to get involved in the provision of higher education in addition to the secondary and limited tertiary education they have been offering since independence. This explains why more than 90 percent of Tanzania private higher education institutions are owned or directly

affiliated to various religious denominations and that is why most of these institutions offer courses directly related to their religious missions and visions. At present there is some subtle competition going on between various religious denominations which have so far not established their own higher education institutions and are in the process of doing so, while religious institutions which have already established their own universities are in the process of establishing more campuses and constituent colleges and adding new programs: at times without the resources necessary to ensure minimum quality academic standards.

The surge of private higher education institutions in Tanzania and in the neighbouring East African countries has resulted in quality problems in these institutions, recently necessitating a regional workshop of the three countries under the auspices of the Inter University Council of East Africa (IUCEA). At this regional workshop, the IUCEA was urged '*to delve into the problem of the mushrooming of bogus universities and the proliferation of fake degrees*' and '*bogus providers of higher education*'.²⁶ A *Quality Assurance Handbook for University Education in East Africa* is being developed by the IUCEA in collaboration with the German International Academic Exchange Program (DAAD).

Notes

1. The Arusha Declaration was a political blue print which intended to make Tanzania a socialist and an economically self-reliant country.
2. Tertiary education refers to post-secondary educational institutions which mostly offer non-degree vocational oriented courses.
3. Private universities pass through other stages before receiving the Certificate of Accreditation, the last stage in the whole process of accreditation. The first stage is the offer of the *Letter of Interim Authority* to operate as a private higher education institution. The second stage is the offer of Certificate of Provisional Registration, followed by the offer of the Certificate of Full Registration.
4. The Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU) was established in 2005 after the enactment of the Universities Act No. 7 of 2005 to replace the Higher Education Accreditation Council (HEAC).
5. The quality of a student in the context of this paper is defined in terms of the admission criteria demanded by public and private universities for enrollment in different academic programs. Public universities impose strict admission criteria for admission to specific academic programs on the basis of high school final examination results or equivalent academic qualification, thus creating stiff competition for admission among high school graduates. On the other hand, admission to any private university in Tanzania, probably for entrepreneurial reasons, is relatively very easy.

6. This centre is owned by the University of South Africa. In 2004/2005, its total enrollment was 28 students. The Center offers undergraduate degrees in commerce, IT & computer science, banking, business administration and law through an open-learning mode.
7. There are 26 administrative regions in Tanzania (21 in Tanzania Mainland and 5 in Zanzibar).
8. It is not known whether this foundation is religious or not.
9. With effect from the academic year 2005/2006, students enrolled in private universities and university colleges are also eligible for loans from the Higher Education Loans Board [HESLB] as long as they meet the academic requirements set by the Board and are pursuing courses considered critical in the development of the country, e.g. engineering, education, medicine etc.
10. Tuition fees are controlled by the Government, but private universities have the freedom to raise tuition fees or charge any amount of tuition as long as they can justify them. Tuition fees also depend on the degree program, with medicine having the highest tuition fee.
11. Conversion from Tanzania Shillings (TZS) to US \$ is made via 2004 Purchasing Power Parity (PPP) computed at US\$ 1=TZS 545
12. For Tanzanians affiliated to the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania (ELCT).
13. For Tanzanians not affiliated to the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Tanzania.
14. This university, a constituent college of Tumaini University, offers undergraduate degree programs in business administration, law, and library and information science.
15. This is equivalent to TZS 9,265,000/=.
16. The Khartoum-based International University of Africa subsidizes this low tuition fee.
17. This college differentiates tuition fees for on and off-campus students.
18. Tuition fees vary according to faculty or cluster of courses. The breakdown is as follows: Faculties of Arts & Social Sciences, Commerce, and Education (TZS 900,000); law (TZS 1,000,000) engineering (TZS 1,200,000), and science (TZS 950,000).
19. For all courses.
20. This university offers a range of courses in agricultural sciences, including a five-year Doctor of Veterinary Medicine degree.
21. For all courses including a five-year Doctor of Medicine degree.
22. In the case of universities owned by religious denominations, e.g. Roman Catholic and ELCT, the bishops and archbishops form the boards of trustees.
23. The number of academic staff presented in this table includes both full-time and part-time academic staff.

24. It should also be noted that in some private universities, because of their for-profit motive, renewal of an employment contract for academic staff in many cases solely depends on the students' evaluations and the extent to which a lecturer 'passes' students in examinations. Lecturers who adhere to strict academic standards in grading students' papers are usually given negative evaluations by students. This situation leads to some kind of compromise of academic freedom and quality because many academic staff, especially those with low academic qualifications, have to do all it takes to please the students and their employers for the sake of their employment contracts.
25. See 'St. Augustine University of Tanzania (SAUT) Facilities Inadequate', *The Citizen*, 1 May 2007, p.5.
26. See Kisembo, Patrick (December 2006) 'Proliferation of Bogus Universities Decried', *The Guardian*, 13 December 2006, p.4.

References

- Banya, K., 2001, 'Sub Saharan Africa: The State of Public Higher Education and the Emergence of Private Sector Universities', *World Education News and Reviews*, 14(6), 1-5, November/December.
- CIA World Fact Book 2006, retrieved 5 December 2006 from www.cia.gov/cia/publications/factbook/index.html.
- Council on Higher Education (CHE), 2003, 'The Re-Accreditation of Private Providers. A Report on the Quality of Provision at Private Higher Education Institutions', Pretoria: CHE.
- Harvey, L., & Green, D., 1993, 'Defining Quality', *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*, 8(1), 9-34.
- Higher Education Accreditation Council, 2005, *Guide to Higher Education in Tanzania 2005*, 3rd Edition, Dar es Salaam: HEAC.
- Ishengoma, J. M., 2007, *Constraints and Prospects of Academic Freedom in Private Universities and Colleges in Sub Saharan Africa and Implications for Human Development and Capability Improvement: The Case of Tanzania*, paper presented at the 2007 Conference on Human Development and Capability Approaches to Development (HDCA), New York, 16-20 September 2007.
- Ishengoma, J. M., 2006, *The Challenges of Academic Freedom in Private Universities and University Colleges in Tanzania: Implications for Knowledge Production and Dissemination*, a research proposal submitted to the Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa [OSSREA] in September 2006.
- Ishengoma, J. M., 2005, *Academic Freedom in Private Universities in Sub Saharan Africa: The Case of Tanzania*, paper presented at the Academic

- Freedom Conference: Problems in Arab and African Countries, 10-11 September 2005, Alexandria, Egypt.
- Kisembo, P., 2006, 'Proliferation of Bogus Universities Decried', *The Guardian*, p. 4, 13 December 2006.
- Levy, D. C., 2004, *The New Institutionalism: Mismatches with Private Higher Education's Global Growth*. Working Paper No. 3. PROPHE Working Paper Series, Program for Research on Private Higher Education (PROPHE), University of Albany, State University of New York, from <http://www.albany.edu/dept/eaps/prophe/publication/paper.html#WP3>.
- Levy, D. C., (forthcoming). *A Recent Echo: African Private Higher Education in International Perspectives*.
- Levy, D. C., 2006, 'The Unanticipated Explosion: Private Higher Education's Global Surge', *Comparative Educational Review* 50(2), 217-240.
- Mama, A., 2004, *Towards Academic Freedom for Africa in the 21st Century*, commissioned paper prepared for CODESRIA and UNESCO.
- Mitchelsen, H. & Hartwich, F., 2004, *University Based Agricultural Research: A Comparative Study in Sub Saharan Africa*, International Service for National Agricultural Research (ISNAR) Research Report 26, The Hague: ISNAR.
- Otieno, W., (forthcoming), *Private Provision and Its Changing Interface with Public Higher Education: The Case of Kenya*.
- Saut Facilities Inadequate, 2007, *The Citizen*, p.5, 1 May 2007.
- Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU), 2006, *Newsletter*, 1 (3), 10-24. January–September.
- United Nations Development Program (UNDP), 2006, *Human Development Report. The State of Progress in Human Resource Development*, NY: UNDP.
- United Republic of Tanzania (URT), 2006a, *Basic Statistics on Higher Education, Science and Technology 2001/2002–2005/2006*, Dar es Salaam: Ministry of Higher Education, Science and Technology.
- United Republic of Tanzania, 2006b, Speech of the Minister for Higher Education, Science, and Technology to the National Assembly.
- United Republic of Tanzania, 2005, *Review of Financial Sustainability in Financing Higher Education in Tanzania*, Dar es Salaam: Ministry of Science and Technology and Higher Education.
- United Republic of Tanzania, 2002, *Some Basic Statistics on Higher Learning Institutions in Tanzania 1997/98–2001/2002*, Dar es Salaam: Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education.
- United Republic of Tanzania, 1999, *National Higher Education Policy*, Dar es Salaam: Ministry of Science, Technology and Higher Education.
- University of Dar es Salaam, 2007, *Facts and Figures 2006/2007*. Dar es Salaam: University of Dar es Salaam.
- University of Dar es Salaam, 2006, *Facts and Figures 2004/2005*, Dar es Salaam: University of Dar es Salaam.

- University of Dar es Salaam, 2004, *Facts and Figures 2003/2004*, Dar es Salaam: University of Dar es Salaam.
- Varghese, N. V., 2004, *Private Higher Education in Africa*, Paris: UNESCO: International Institute of Educational Planning (IIEP).
- Varsity Students 'Cheat' Loans Body, Gain Shs 80m, 2007, *The Citizen*, p.1, 16 January 2007.
- World Bank, 2003, *World Development Indicators*, Washington, D.C: The World Bank.

